

City Services Auditor

**SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS
POLICY AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE
CSA Update**

May 16, 2014



Completed Projects

December 2013 – April 2014

- Audits Unit
 - Audit of Taxis and Accessible Services Division *(Issued 4/24/14)*
- City Performance Unit
 - TEP Corridor Survey Analysis January 2014
 - TEP Milestones – EIR Approval, Workbooks March 2014
 - MTA Benchmarking Report March 2014
 - Walkfirst Project – Materials, public events March 2014



Audits Unit

Audit of Taxis and Accessible Services Division

- **Audit Objectives**

Determine whether SFMTA:

1. Effectively manages its five-year, \$118.6 million paratransit contract to ensure that eligible patrons receive safe, prompt, and high-quality service.
2. Adequately ensures that the public receives safe and effective taxi service in San Francisco.



Audits Unit

Audit of Taxis and Accessible Services Division

- **Audit Results**

SFMTA:

1. Does not adequately ensure that paratransit services are safe, prompt, and of high-quality.
2. Pays \$18.5 million in yearly paratransit costs but does not verify support and, therefore, cannot ensure that these costs are valid.
3. Made \$12,000 in incentive payments to the paratransit broker, Veolia, in fiscal year 2012-13 but does not verify support to ensure that Veolia earns these payments.
4. Should strengthen internal controls over the eligibility determination process for paratransit applicants.
5. Should ensure that the paratransit broker agreement clearly defines outreach activities and priorities.

Audits Unit

Audit of Taxis and Accessible Services Division

- **Audit Results** *(continued)*

6. Veolia does not frequently or thoroughly review user access to its Trapeze system or Debit Card Central System.
7. Veolia's eligibility clerks have broad access to the Trapeze system and Debit Card Central System, creating the opportunity to grant eligibility and make changes to patrons' debit cards.
8. Veolia has inadequate password-protection controls for its paratransit systems.
9. SFMTA does not consistently log, track, investigate or follow up on taxi complaints, which results in unreliable performance data.
10. SFMTA's taxi driver licensing process is inadequate and needs improvement. It does not ensure that only safe and well-qualified drivers operate taxis in San Francisco.

City Performance Unit

TEP Milestones and Corridor Survey

- Transit Effectiveness Project milestones in this period include:
 - Final EIR Certification by the Planning Commission;
 - Completion of an extensive public outreach and comment process on the coming changes;
 - Various approvals by the SFMTA Board;
 - Beginning rollout of TTRP and other improvements.
- Intercept surveys were collected from ~ 200 residents and shoppers on Irving (N Judah) and San Bruno (9 San Bruno) corridors in October and November. Analysis performed for SFMTA shows 50%-80% of respondents walked or took MUNI to the corridor. Respondents were also asked about visit frequency, spending, and support for various improvements, including moving MUNI stops to speed up service.

City Performance Unit

MTA Benchmarking Report

- CSA published a report comparing SFMTA to other transit providers on March 13. This is in a series fulfilling a Charter mandate regarding benchmarking CCSF services to other public entities.
- Clear themes are that SFMTA's cost, service provision and operational efficiency are commensurate with peers;
- SFMTA carries a relatively higher volume of passengers and provides more miles of service. Slower average vehicle speeds appear correlated to the passenger volume;
- SFMTA fares are consistently lower than fares in most peer cities;
- Compared to peer fleets, SFMTA vehicles are older, travel fewer miles between failures, and are less energy efficient;
- SFMTA is far above peers in the overall availability of service—density measured by route miles per square mile of service area.

City Performance Unit

WalkFirst Project

- WalkFirst is a collaborative effort among CSA, SFMTA Livable Streets, SF Planning, Department of Public Health, SFCTA and DPW. A consultant team was hired. Director's Working Group provided guidance.
- Project deliverables included extensive modeling, mapping and scenario planning using the Transbase data set and other data; outreach tools and materials; collision profiles, and pedestrian countermeasures with associated costs.
- Result is a five-year capital improvement plan with projects and programs to achieve the Mayor's Pedestrian Strategy and Vision Zero goals.
- WalkFirst informs the Vision Zero goal of no traffic deaths. SFMTA will implement 24 projects by February 2016 to help reach this goal.
- Press event on March 6th rolled out WalkFirst products to the City. For more information, visit <http://walkfirst.sfplanning.org/>

Projects in Progress

- Audits Unit
 - Parking Meter Revenue Audit
 - Sutter-Stockton and Union Square Garage Audits
- City Performance Unit
 - Development Agreements tracking and planning
 - Transportation Task Force – support to outreach process
 - Streetscape Project Development for FY15



Audits Unit

Parking Meter Revenue Audit

- **Audit Objectives**

1. Identify and analyze the barriers that prevent SFMTA from collecting the maximum potential parking revenue.
2. Determine the effectiveness of internal controls over parking meter revenue collection used by SFMTA and the contractor, Serco, Inc.



City Performance Unit

Projects in Progress

- CSA is leading a project requested by SFMTA to analyze and track the transportation and related commitments in City's development agreements (CPMC, Park Merced and others). Complex operating, financial, permitting and planning responsibilities are spread throughout the agreements and enforcement and delivery is poorly understood. Deliverables will include a database linked to the City's other permitting and planning functions, enforcement and accountability mechanisms, and financial tracking,
- CSA is supporting the Transportation Task Force leadership, SFMTA and the Mayor's Office in providing materials and analysis regarding the funding proposals in the 2030 plan. Briefing meetings, additional public outreach efforts and financial planning are required.
- CSA is preparing a Streetscape prioritization process similar to WalkFirst, in collaboration with SFMTA, Planning and other CCSF stakeholders. The work will be prepared now and executed in FY15.

City Services Auditor

Questions and Discussion

