



SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL

ADMINISTRATION, OPERATIONS, AND CUSTOMER SERVICE COMMITTEE

MINUTES

Thursday, November 18, 2021

**WATCH:** (link can be found online at <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/administration-operations-and-customer-service-committee-aocsc-regular-meeting-november-18>)

**PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN:** (415) 915-0757 | Conference ID: 649 668 25#

REGULAR MEETING  
4 P.M.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Chris Arvin, Chair  
John Lisovsky  
Karim Salgado  
Sue Vaughan

COUNCIL LIAISON

Christine Silva

COUNCIL SECRETARY

Keka Robinson-Luqman

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Council Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA Meeting Room (Noe Valley Conference Room) is closed.

**Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Council in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [CAC@sfmta.com](mailto:CAC@sfmta.com) by 5pm on Wednesday, November 17<sup>th</sup>, or call (415) 646-2388.**

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Arvin called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

AOCSC members present at Roll Call: Chris Arvin, John Lisovsky, and Sue Vaughan

AOCSC members absent at Roll Call: Karim Salgado

CAC members present: Michael Chen, Aaron Leifer, and Dorris Vincent

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of July 15, 2021:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, John Lisovsky, and Sue Vaughan

ABSENT – Karim Salgado

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Arvin reported on their requested upcoming AOCSC topics and asked for suggestions on future meeting topics.

No public comment.

### 6. Public Comment

No public comment.

## REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Shared Spaces update. (Monica Munowitch, Shared Spaces Deputy Program Manager. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Monica Munowitch, Deputy Manager, Shared Spaces Program presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Karen Wong stated that there is a parklet on 19<sup>th</sup> and Clement with customers who park their cars in her driveway. They also block the driveway so she cannot leave. The police come and do not give them a ticket.

Daniela Rible complained about extreme noise due to parklets. It has been reported to 311 many times, yet nothing has happened. They support small business but not at the expense of the safety and encroachment on public space.

AOCSC Motion 211118.01

The SFMTA CAC encourages the agency to explore expanding full-time, 24/7 road closures as roadway 'shared spaces.'

Members of the public expressing opposition: Daniela Rible

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, John Lisovsky, Karim Salgado, and Sue Vaughan

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Muni 2022 Service Plans including J Church line service. (Julie Kirschbaum, Director, Transit. No explanatory documents.)

Julie Kirschbaum, Director, Transit presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Karen Kennard spoke in support of Option 2 and expressed strong opposition to Option 3.

Kathy Setian asked that the SFMTA restore full service to the J Church line and expressed opposition to Option 3.

Michael S expressed strong support for Option 2 and strong opposition to Option 3.

David Pilpel stated that the SFMTA should increase and decrease service as demand warrants. The J Church line should be operated every 10 minutes.

AOCSC Motion 211118.02

WHEREAS the SFMTA has an obligation to provide safe, consistent service to all riders, especially those most vulnerable (e.g., the disabled, elderly, women, and families)

WHEREAS the technical analysis presented by SFMTA staff supporting Option 1 (and by extension Option 3) for the J Church omits the following:

- Improvements in subway performance go far beyond removal of the J Church line:

- The dramatic reduction in ridership across all lines (~50%) inherently speeds up boarding and reduces station dwell time
- There is no “AM peak” service as downtown rush hour demand has yet to return and trains operate on roughly the same schedule for most of the day, another source of service reduction
- The recent subway shutdown of an unprecedented duration resulted in improvements to boost overall system reliability
- Even under the agency’s recently stated 30 trains/hour subway capacity limit, at least four (if not five) additional trains per hour could run **without overall performance degradation**
- Many subways/metro light rails around the world run multiple lines on the same trackway (e.g., New York, London, Tokyo, Chicago, Los Angeles) at rates higher than 30 trains/hour
- The agency has not begun to roll out automated train control system (ATCS) improvements which should result in additional operational efficiencies in order to justify their cost

WHEREAS arguments presented by SFMTA staff significantly understate the public opposition to Option 1 (and by extension Option 3) of those surveyed (who are not exclusively J Church riders) in Summer 2021:

- A vast majority (68%) of those surveyed oppose making the forced transfer permanent
- Less than 22% of those surveyed support a permanent forced transfer
- Transfers *are* (vs. “can be”) challenging for riders with disabilities, 73% of whom found them difficult (68% of all surveyed found them difficult)
- Reducing transfer wait times **will not** fully address the concerns of riders, especially vulnerable communities

WHEREAS the proposed Option 3 for the J Church would be needlessly confusing for riders due to different bus and rail stops while providing inconsistent and poor overall service

WHEREAS the safety and streetscape improvements proposed by the agency to address rider concerns—to be completed regardless of the J Church terminus—**would not begin to be permanently implemented until 2025 if at all** according to staff presentations

WHEREAS the SFMTA should work to increase transit ridership and J Church riders are already opting to not ride Muni due to the forced transfer

Be it RESOLVED that the SFMTA Citizens Advisory Council RECOMMENDS the SFMTA:

- For the purposes of the December 7, 2021 SFMTA Board meeting, return the J-Church line to the subway for all-day service. (Given the three options presented to the SFMTA Board of Directors, this would mean choosing Option 2.)
- Expedite the permanent safety and streetscaping improvements at Market and Church Streets, including but not limited to the construction of an elevator at south side of said intersection.

- Explore additional options for J Church service to downtown as future conditions warrant, as part of an overall Muni rail plan presented to the CAC and the public for input and consideration.
- Expedite plans to replace the ATCS and revise said plans to include the J Church in the subway.

Members of the public expressing support: Michael S, Karen Kennard, David Pilpel, Pete Wilson, and Mark Norton

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Kathy Setian and Edward Mason

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES –Chris Arvin, John Lisovsky, and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Karim Salgado

AOCSC Motion 211118.03

The SFMTA CAC supports the bus network changes and restorations included in the proposal for the 2022 Muni Service Network, given that future bus improvements and restorations will be considered in 2022 as circumstances warrant.

Members of the public expressing support: David Pilpel

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES –Chris Arvin, John Lisovsky, and Sue Vaughan  
NAYES – Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Karim Salgado

9. Committee Members' request for information. (For discussion only)

Sue Vaughan asked what the Shared Spaces program impact is to meter revenue.

No public comment.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 7:02 p.m.

Submitted by:



Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary