



Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee

Bruce Agid – Chair
Manoj Madhavan
Amit Kothari – Co-Chair
Catherine Sharpe
Sarah Davis

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee Meeting Thursday, January 27, 2022

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Committee Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the SFMTA meeting rooms at One South Van Ness Avenue are closed.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Committee in advance of the meeting, please send an email to Kim.Walton@SFMTA.com by 5pm on Tuesday November 17, 2021 or call 415.646-2541.

Microsoft Teams meeting

Join on your computer or mobile app

[Click here to join the meeting](#)

Or call in (audio only)

[+1 415-915-0757,,751824269#](tel:+14159150757751824269) United States, San Francisco

Phone Conference ID: 751 824 269#

[Find a local number](#) | [Reset PIN](#)

[Learn More](#) | [Meeting options](#)



**Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund
Advisory Committee**

Bruce Agid – Chair
Amit Kothari – Vice-Chair
Sarah Davis

Manoj Madhavan
Catherine Sharpe

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee Meeting
Thursday, January 27, 2022
10 am
Online Meeting

The Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee (MB TIF AC) is the central City-sponsored community advisory body charged with providing input to the SFMTA, Department of Public Works, and the Police Department and decision makers regarding allocation of monies in the Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund established in Administrative Code Section 10.100-364. The Advisory Committee shall be advisory, as appropriate, to the SFMTA and the Board of Supervisors.

1.	Call Meeting to Order	Bruce Agid, Chairperson	
2.	Approve minutes December 16, 2021 meeting (For Discussion and Possible Action)	Bruce Agid	5 minutes
3.	Resolution to allow teleconferenced meetings under California government code section 54953(e) (For discussion and Possible Action)	Kim Walton, Staff Liaison	5 minutes
4.	Advisory Committee and City Staff review and approve Final Draft Budget Letter to the Mayor’s Office FY 22-23, FY 23-24 (For Discussion and Possible Action)	SFMTA Finance team; Bruce Agid and Advisory Committee Members	40 minutes
5.	Metrics update <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transportation • Safety and Security • Public Realm (For Discussion and Possible Action)	Manoj Madhavan & City Agency/Department representatives	30 minutes
6.	Old Business <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Review and finalize commendation letter for Samuel Thomas b. Review current status re: congestion, pedestrian safety, Muni impacts based on interim funding levels and resource availability (Both items -For Discussion and Possible Action)	Bruce Agid and Amit Kothari Manoj Madhavan and City Agency/Department Reps.	20 minutes

Agenda -Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee Meeting January 27, 2022

7.	Review and Update 2022 Workplan (For discussion and possible action)	Bruce Agid and AC Members	10 minutes
8.	Public Comment		
9.	Advisory Committee Comments and Future Agenda Items (For Discussion and Possible Action)	Committee Members	5 minutes
10	Adjourn		

ACCESSIBILITY MEETING POLICY

The Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council will meet virtually due to the public health emergency.

To obtain a disability-related accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, or to obtain meeting materials in alternative format, please contact Kim Walton at 415-646-2541. Providing at least 72 hours' notice will help to ensure availability. Written reports or background materials for calendar items are available for public inspection and copying at 1 South Van Ness Ave. 7th Floor during regular business hours and are available on-line at www.sfmta.com

To assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chairman may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org. Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website <http://www.sfgov.org>.

LANGUAGE ASSISTANCE

- ☎ 311 Free language assistance / 免費語言協助 / Ayuda gratuita con el idioma / Бесплатная помощь переводчиков / Trợ giúp Thông dịch Miễn phí / Assistance linguistique gratuite / 無料の言語支援 / 무료 언어 지원 / คว"มช่วยเหลือท"งภ"ษ"โดยไม"เส"ยค"าใ"จ้จ"าย / Libreng tulong para sa wikang Tagalog
- ☎ 415.646.2541: For free interpretation services, please submit your request 48 hours in advance of meeting./ 如果需要免費口語翻譯, 請於會議之前 48 小時提出要求。/ Para servicios de interpretación gratuitos, por favor haga su petición 48 horas antes de la reunión. Para sa libreng serbisyo sa interpretasyon, kailangan mag-request 48 oras bago ang m



Bruce Agid – Chair
Sarah Davis
Amit Kothari – Vice-Chair
Manoj Madhavan
Catherine Sharpe

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

December 16, 2021

10:00 am – 12 Noon

On-line Meeting

Advisory Committee Seats
Seat 1 (Golden State Warriors) Manoj Madhavan, Voting member Yoyo Chan, Alternate
Seat 2 (UCSF) Amit Kothari, Voting member Clare Shinnerl, Alternate
Seat 3 (Neighborhood resident) Bruce Agid, Voting member Bruce Huie, Alternate
Seat 4 (Neighborhood business owner) Catherine Sharpe, Voting member Terezia Nemeth, Alternate
Seat 5 (Neighborhood resident) Sarah Davis, Voting member Sarah Bertram, Alternate

1. Call to order/rollcall -Bruce Agid, Chairperson

Voting members in attendance: Agid; Kothari; Davis; Madhavan; Sharpe

Alternates in attendance: Bertram; Chan

Alternates not in attendance: Huie; Shinnerl, Nemeth

2. Approve minutes of November 18, 2021 Meeting

A motion was made by Amit Kothari to approve the minutes of the November 18, 2021 meeting and was seconded by Manoj Madhavan.

Member Comment – None

Public Comments – None

Ayes – Agid; Kothari; Davis; Madhavan; Sharpe

Nays -none

Motion passed

3. Resolution to allow teleconferenced meetings under California government code section 54953(e)

Kim Walton, staff liaison read the resolution regarding the continuation of holding teleconference public meetings.

**RESOLUTION MAKING FINDINGS TO ALLOW TELECONFERENCED
MEETINGS UNDER CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT
CODE SECTION 54953(e)**

WHEREAS California Government Code Section 54953(e) empowers local policy bodies to convene by teleconferencing technology during a proclaimed state of emergency under the State Emergency Services Act so long as certain conditions are met; and

WHEREAS, In March 2020, the Governor of the State of California proclaimed a state of emergency in California in connection with the Coronavirus Disease 2019 (“COVID-19”) pandemic, and that state of emergency remains in effect; and

WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, the Mayor of the City and County of San Francisco (the “City”) declared a local emergency, and on March 6, 2020, the City’s Health Officer declared a local health emergency, and both those declarations also remain in effect; an

WHEREAS, On March 11 and March 23, 2020, the Mayor issued emergency orders suspending select provisions of local law, including sections of the City Charter, that restrict teleconferencing by members of policy bodies; those orders remain in effect, so City law currently allows policy bodies to meet remotely if they comply with restrictions in State law regarding teleconference meetings; and

WHEREAS, On September 16, 2021, the Governor signed AB 361, a bill that amends the Brown Act to allow local policy bodies to continue to meet by teleconferencing during a state of emergency without complying with restrictions in State law that would otherwise apply, provided that the policy bodies make certain findings at least once every 30 days; and

WHEREAS, While federal, State, and local health officials emphasize the critical importance of vaccination and consistent mask-wearing to prevent the spread of COVID-19, the City’s Health Officer has issued at least one order (Health Officer Order No. C19-07y, available online at www.sfdph.org/healthorders) and one directive (Health Officer Directive No. 2020-33i, available online at www.sfdph.org/directives) that continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, such as masking, in certain contexts; and

WHEREAS, The California Department of Industrial Relations Division of Occupational Safety and Health (“Cal/OSHA”) has promulgated Section 3205 of Title 8 of the California Code of Regulations, which requires most employers in California, including in the City, to train and instruct employees about measures that can decrease the spread of COVID-19, including physical distancing and other social distancing measures; and

WHEREAS, Without limiting any requirements under applicable federal, state, or local pandemic-related rules, orders, or directives, the City’s Department of Public Health, in coordination with the City’s Health Officer, has advised that for group gatherings indoors,

such as meetings of boards and commissions, people can increase safety and greatly reduce risks to the health and safety of attendees from COVID-19 by maximizing ventilation, wearing well-fitting masks (as required by Health Officer Order No. C19-07), using physical distancing where the vaccination status of attendees is not known, and considering holding the meeting remotely if feasible, especially for long meetings, with any attendees with unknown vaccination status and where ventilation may not be optimal; and

WHEREAS, On July 31, 2020, the Mayor issued an emergency order that, with limited exceptions, prohibited policy bodies other than the Board of Supervisors and its committees from meeting in person under any circumstances, so as to ensure the safety of policy body members, City staff, and the public; and

WHEREAS, the Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee has met remotely during the COVID-19 pandemic and can continue to do so in a manner that allows public participation and transparency while minimizing health risks to members, staff, and the public that would be present with in-person meetings while this emergency continues; ,and

WHEREAS, on September 27, 2021, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that AB 361 findings described above are not a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060© and 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS a copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors and is incorporated herein by reference;

WHEREAS, on October 28, 2021, the Advisory Committee adopted the recommended findings allowing it to continue to meet remotely for 30 days; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee finds as follows:

1. As described above, the State of California and the City remain in a state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic. At this meeting, Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee has considered the circumstances of the state of emergency.
2. As described above, State and City officials continue to recommend measures to promote physical distancing and other social distancing measures, in some settings.
3. As described above, because of the COVID-19 pandemic, conducting meetings of this body Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee and the Metrics Dashboard Sub-Committee in person would present imminent risks to the safety of attendees, and the state of emergency continues to directly impact the ability of members to meet safely in person; and, be it further

RESOLVED for at least the next 30 days meetings of Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee and its committees will continue to occur exclusively by teleconferencing technology (and not by any in-person meetings or any other meetings with public access to the places where any policy body member is present for the meeting). Such meetings of Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee and its committees that occur by teleconferencing technology will provide an opportunity for members of the public to address this body and the Metrics Dashboard Sub-Committee will otherwise occur in a manner that protects the

statutory and constitutional rights of parties and the members of the public attending the meeting via teleconferencing; and, be it further

RESOLVED, That the Advisory Committee Liaison is directed to place a resolution substantially similar to this resolution on the agenda of a future meeting of the Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee within the next 30 days. If the Committee does not meet within the next 30 days, the Staff Liaison is directed to place such a resolution on the agenda of the next meeting of the Committee.

A motion was made by Amit Kothari and was seconded by Manoj Madhavan to adopt the resolution as read.

Member Comment: None

Public Comment: None

On the motion to adopt the resolution:

Ayes – Kothari; Davis; Agid; Sharpe; Madhavan

Nays – None

Motion passed

4. Review departments final budgets and proposed service levels for FY 22-23, FY 23-24

Tim Manglicmot, SFMTA Budget Analyst went over the budget process.

Advisory Committee Comments:

Bruce Agid brought up the prior request by Sarah Davis to have a slide that shows additional revenues available to augment the money provided in the Transportation Improvement fund. Tim agreed to provide this information in the January budget package.

Public comments – none

5. Advisory Committee and City Staff review draft Budget Letter to the Mayor's Office FY 22-23, FY 23-24

The Committee went through the draft letter which resulted in an updated version (see attached).

The Committee asked that members Madhavan and Kothari draft a new paragraph addressing Muni operations – driver shortages and level of service.

A final draft of the letter, including the new paragraph, will be sent to the Committee prior to the January 27, 2022 meeting. In addition, the Committee agreed to include all the attachments as is.

The Committee will discuss the final version, make additional changes, if needed. Kim Walton, Staff Liaison reminded the Committee that the SFMTA Director of Transportation is to review the letter prior to it being voted upon and sent to the Mayor's Office of Budget.

Advisory Committee Comments:

Bruce Agid:

- The draft letter was based on the prior year's letter.
- The information in the letter is based on feedback from both the Committee and members of the public.

Catherine Sharpe:

- Asked about the intent of the letter.
- Suggested that the letter have a paragraph discussion safety and another discussing parks.

Sarah Davis:

- Would like to explore how city services can provide trash/garbage can services to Mission Bay parks.

Manoj Madhavan:

- Stated that transit service is not sufficient due to the lack of operators and the increase in traffic pre and post events.

Amit Kothari:

- Stated that Muni staffing shortages is Citywide concern.

Yoyo Chan:

- Stated that there is no way to predict what service levels will be in July 2022, but that it will be an issue if the driver shortages and less service continues past July 2022.

Public Comment –there was no public comment

6. Old Business

6a. Review congestion, pedestrian safety, PCO & Muni impacts based on interim FY21-22 funding levels

Shawn McCormick, SFMTA Parking Enforcement, provided an update on his staffs' work around the Center. While there is currently a staffing shortage, new parking control officers are currently being trained.

Daisy Avalos, Transit Operations, provided an update on the Ambassador program. While there are currently eight staff available to work events, more are being hired and by February 2022 there will be a total of 28 ambassadors. Their work entails helping on the light rail platform before and after events. She is confident when fully staffed, they will be able to cover events at both the Chase Center and Oracle Park occurring at the same time.

Leslie Bienefeld, Manager of Special Events and Construction Support provided information regarding southbound light rail service. She was unaware of service gaps of trains traveling southbound. She will look at schedule and provide the Committee with an update at a future meeting.

Committee Comments:

Bruce Agid:

- Stated that there was one specific complaint he received from a rider who waited 45 minutes or more for a train.

Sarah Bertram:

- Stated that she was concerned about service since it was to be increased prior to the opening of the Center in 2019.

Manoj Madhavan:

- Stated that the "community" hot line has not received complaints regarding Muni service. The data collection sheets provided by SF PW, SFPD, and SFMTA/Muni will be used to help identify areas for improvement.

Public Comment – there were no comments from the public.

6b. Review commendation letter for Samuel Thomas

Due to lack of time, this item will be held over to the January 2022 meeting agenda.

7. Review and Update 2022 Workplan

Due to lack of time, this item will be held over to the January 2022 agenda.

8. Public Comment – there were no comments from the public

9. Advisory Committee Comments and Future Agenda Items

The January 27, 2022 agenda will include the following:

- Discussion and finalization, & vote on the letter to the Mayor’s Budget Office.
- Update on Metrics
- Review draft and finalization of 2022 Workplan.
- Review and vote on commendation letter for Samuel Thomas.

Chairperson Bruce Agid thanks the Committee for their hard work during 2021 and wished everyone Happy Holidays.

Adjourn

Amit Kothari motioned that the December 16, 2021 meeting be adjourned, and it was seconded by Manoj Madhavan. The vote to adjourn was unanimous.

Meeting ended at 12:04 pm



SFMTA

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Fiscal Year (FY) 2022-23 and FY 2023-24 Budgets and Service Levels

Prepared by:
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
San Francisco Public Works
San Francisco Police Department

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Advisory Committee (AC)
27 January 2022

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Meeting Objectives

Objectives

- Review the FY 2022-23 (FY23) and FY 2023-24 (FY24) budget roadmap

Agenda

- *FY23 and FY24 Budget Roadmap*
- *Question and Answers*

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

MBTIF Budget Overview – as of 12/16/2021

Dollars in Thousands

	FY 2019-20 Revised Budget	FY 2020-21 Revised Budget	FY 2021-22 Revised Budget	FY 2022-23 Revised Budget	FY 2023-24 Proposed Budget
Sources					
MBTIF	8,100	3,170	7,610	8,800	9,100
Uses					
SFMTA Allocation	6,207	2,778	5,868	5,102	5,276
SFPD Allocation	1,285	280	1,214	2,706	2,799
SFPW Allocation	558	112	528	992	1,026
CON Allocation	50	0	0	0	0
Sources Minus Uses	0	0	0	0	0

- SF Office of the Controller (CON) is currently assuming full funding in FY23 & FY24 per amounts defined in the MBTIF ordinance
- CON will assess Chase Center event numbers and economic activity in future fiscal updates and may adjust funding amounts as required

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

MBTIF Budget Overview – as of 1/27/2027

Dollars in Thousands

	FY 2019-20 Revised Budget	FY 2020-21 Revised Budget	FY 2021-22 Revised Budget	FY 2022-23 Revised Budget	FY 2023-24 Proposed Budget
Sources					
MBTIF	8,100	3,170	7,610	8,800	9,100
Uses					
SFMTA Allocation	6,207	2,778	5,868	4,792	4,968
SFPD Allocation	1,285	280	1,214	2,959	3,051
SFPW Allocation	558	112	528	1,050	1,081
CON Allocation	50	0	0	0	0
Sources Minus Uses	0	0	0	0	0

- SF Office of the Controller (CON) is currently assuming full funding in FY23 & FY24 per amounts defined in the MBTIF ordinance
- CON will assess Chase Center event numbers and economic activity in future fiscal updates and may adjust funding amounts as required
- Difference from 12/16/2021 amounts based on **increase from 200 to 216 budgeted events per fiscal year**

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SFMTA MBTIF Budget and Projected General Fund & Enterprise Revenues and Expenditures

Dollars in Thousands

	FY 2022-23 Proposed Budget	FY 2023-24 Proposed Budget
Sources		
MBTIF MTA Allocation	4,792	4,968
Projected SFMTA Share of Parking Tax Attributable to Chase	3,246	3,360
Projected SFMTA Share of GF Baseline Increase Attributable to Chase	1,712	1,772
Projected Special Event Parking Meter Fees	719	734
Projected Transit Fares	3,581	3,653
Uses		
Projected Operating Expenditures	(8,343)	(8,616)
Subtotal Remaining Balance	5,707	5,869
Projected Capital Payback from MBTIF	0	0
Projected Capital Payback from Other Sources	(5,707)	(5,869)
Subtotal Capital Payback	(5,707)	(5,869)
Remaining Balance	0	0

- Operational costs are expected to be partially offset by projected enterprise revenues and General Fund revenues assuming 216 events and using assumptions from EPS's *SF Multi-Purpose Venue Fiscal Impact Analysis: Revenues* published 18 Feb 2020, and assuming transportation mode splits prior to the COVID-19 global pandemic
- Any revenues exceeding expenditures will be used to pay back SFMTA's capital expenditures related to Chase
- Projected operating expenditures assume 3.26% and 3.29% COLAs respectively in FY23 & FY24, per Controller's Office assumptions in the *March Update to the Five-Year Financial Plan (Joint Report)*

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SFMTA Capital Balance 1/27

	Dollars in Thousands
FY19 Year-end Capital Balance	(71,761)
FY20 MBTIF Capital Investment Payback	2,129
FY20 Special Event Meter Revenue	657
FY20 Transit Fare Revenue	1,506
FY20 Year-end Capital Balance	(67,468)
FY21 MBTIF Capital Investment Payback	2,554
FY21 Special Event Meter Revenue	-
FY22 Transit Fare Revenue	-
FY21 Year-end Capital Balance	(64,914)

*FY21 payback and balance amounts not final— pending FY close and final audited expenditure and revenues

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SFMTA Planned Deployment in FY2022-23 and FY2023-24

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)

- No additional MuniMetro/LRV or Bus deployment
- No PCO deployment with exceptions
- No MTAP (crowd control) staff deployment

Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)

- 3 additional two-car MuniMetro/LRV deployment
- 3 additional 60-ft coaches on the 78X
- 3 additional 40-ft coaches on the 79X
- Modified PCO deployment, 17 total
- Half MTAP deployment

Level 3: >10k (112 + 16 Events)

- 6 additional two-car MuniMetro/LRV deployment
- 6 additional 60-ft coaches on the 78X
- 6 additional 40-ft coaches on the 79X
- Full PCO deployment, 25 total
- Full MTAP deployment

Staffing levels subject to exception depending on event requirements

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund
SFPD FY2022-23 and FY2023-24 Budgets

Police Department Budget - based on 200+16
Events and 31% of the Estimated FY23 & FY24
MBTIF Allocation:

FY23: \$2,706,000 + \$252,064 = **\$2,958,064**

FY24: \$2,799,000 + \$252,064 = **\$3,051,064**

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SFPD Flexible Operational Deployment in FY2022-23 and FY2023-24

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$9,267
- Bike Officers (2)
- Traffic Officers (5)
- Foot beat Officers (3)

Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$11,120
- Bike Officers (2)
- Traffic Officers (5)
- Foot beat Officers (5)

Level 3: >10k (112 +16 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$15,754
- Bike Officers (2)
- Traffic Officers and Honda Unit (12)
- Foot beat Officers (5)
- Marine Unit

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SF Public Works Cost Per Event

Estimated Public Works Department Cost per Event*

- FY23: \$5,095
- FY24: \$5,248

Summary of services/benefits to public**

Augmented Chase Center Post-Event Cleanup Services

- Litter Patrol Routes
- Mechanical Sweeping Overlay

Assumptions regarding service levels and hours of operation

- 4 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- 2 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup for <5K attendee events
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

****Assumed number of events: 200 events in FY2023 and FY2024, plus 16 playoff games.***

*****Estimate per event does not include can servicing for OCII/MB parks.***

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SF Public Works Planned Deployment in FY2022-23 and FY2023-24

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$FY23: \$2,548 ; FY24: \$2,624
- 2 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$FY23: \$5,095 ; FY24: \$5,248
- 4 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

Level 3: >10k (112 + 16 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$FY23: \$5,095 ; FY24: \$5,248
- 4 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

MBTIF Advisory Committee Questions and Feedback

Thank You.



**Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund
Advisory Committee**

Bruce Agid – Chair
Amit Kothari – Co-Chair
Sarah Davis

Manoj Madhavan
Catherine Sharpe

January 27, 2022

Mayor's Office of Public Policy and Finance
Attn: Ashley Groffenberger, Budget Director
City Hall, Room 200
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

Director Groffenberger,

Please consider this letter of support, with conditions, from the Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Advisory Committee (the Committee), for the budget recommended by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), Police Department (SFPD) and Public Works (SFPW) for fiscal years 2022-23 and 2023-24 (Attachment A). While we believe the recommended amounts per City and County of San Francisco departments are sufficient to meet currently projected demand for transportation, public safety and street and sidewalk cleaning services associated with Chase Center events, the Committee's support is conditioned on the satisfaction of several concerns that will need to be monitored and addressed in a timely manner.

The Committee was generally satisfied with City services prior to the shut-down of the Chase Center due to the global health pandemic and their results in mitigating negative impacts on traffic, parking, public safety, and cleanliness in the neighborhoods surrounding Chase. Upon the reopening of the Chase Center, based on an interim budget allocation and resource plan, there are currently some initial concerns regarding pedestrian safety, additional congestion in the adjacent neighborhoods and on-going cleanliness and safety of all Mission Bay Parks that require timely actions.

Pedestrian safety is a priority for the Chase Center, with the Golden State Warriors playing the lead role for monitoring the Safe Pedestrian Access Performance Standard, with support from OCII, SFMTA, and SFPD, as written in the Transportation Management Plan (TMP). Funding is provided through the Transportation Improvement Fund (TIF) and resources through the SFMTA. These groups will work with the TIF Committee to understand the optimal resource compliment to ensure pedestrian safety.

As for the cleanliness, the Committee feels that there was an oversight to not have included the Mission Bay Parks (under the jurisdiction of OCII) and the SF Port as City entities to receive funds. The Committee has asked both OCII and SF Port to work together with SFPW to monitor the impacts from events at the Chase Center, and if deemed appropriate, determine

the best practice how to provide these services and secure funding, consult with the City Attorney's Office, and recommend to the Committee a resource and/or funding plan.

The Committee will continue to closely monitor expenditure and service levels for SFMTA, SFPD, and SFPW to ensure that delivered services appropriately match the needs of event attendees and adjacent neighborhoods; the services provided should approximate actual demand. The Committee recognizes that City operations may sometimes require minimum staffing levels for public safety reasons, or to encourage transit ridership, for example. However, the MBTIF should be used to fund services as determined by actual data points, and within the bounds of comparative examples. If indicators suggest service levels are in excess of what is necessary, the Committee will recommend adjustments by the City. This will ensure that MBTIF funds are effectively used, generating the maximum value for event goers and surrounding businesses and communities.

The TMP established a set of event levels to assist City agencies in developing staffing plans based on various size events. *Level 1* would be less than 5,000 attendees, *Level 2* between 5,000 to 10,000 attendees, and *Level 3* with over 10,000 attendees. Of course, staffing levels are subject to exception depending on event requirements. Depending on the size of attendance, the appropriate number of staff and vehicles will be deployed. For additional details, please view Attachment B.

One tool to measure service demand and delivery is an appropriate set of metrics. The Committee has established with City agencies and other stakeholders an initial defined set of metrics that establishes goals/objectives (based on the 2015 TMP) and documents service levels and performance delivered by the SFMTA, the SFPD, and SFPW. The objective of a metrics scorecard is to identify possible gaps or opportunities to right-size the services provided by the City.

As the area surrounding the Chase Center continues to grow and develop, we anticipate the needs of surrounding businesses and communities will evolve and grow as well. Because of this, the Committee would like to focus on the continued assessment of the trade-offs between different MBTIF uses, while ensuring that funds are leveraged, based on the MBTIF legislation, to address impacts specifically attributable to events at the Chase Center.

While the MBTIF minimum amounts coupled with enterprise and parking tax revenues attributable to Chase Center events are currently sufficient to cover the Chase Center-specific operating expenditures, SFMTA debt service costs and a portion of SFMTA capital expenditures, flexible and ongoing funding should be secured for future needs. The SFMTA's capital expenditure balance also remains a concern, as the MBTIF is not sufficient to fully address the magnitude of incurred expenditures; the Committee encourages the Mayor's Budget Office in concert with SFMTA to examine potential solutions

We appreciate your consideration of the MBTIF Advisory Committee's thoughtful feedback. We look forward to working with the Mayor's Office, the SFMTA, the SFPD, SFPW and other City departments to ensure the continued effective allocation of funds and efficient provision of critical services to meet the needs of event goers and communities surrounding the Chase Center.

On behalf of the Committee,

Bruce Agid
Chair, Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee

Attachments: (5)

- Attachment A: Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Budget for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24
- Attachment B: Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund: SFMTA Planned Deployment in FY 2022-2023 and FY 2023-2024
- Attachment C: Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund: SFPD Planned Deployment in FY 2022-2023 and FY 2023-2024
- Attachment D: Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund: SFPD Planned Deployment in FY 2022-2023 and FY 2023-2024
- Attachment E: Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee Motion of Support

Cc: Jeffery Tumlin, SFMTA Director of Transportation
Jonathan Rewers, SFMTA Acting Chief Financial Officer
Chief William Scott, SFPD
Carolyn Welch, SFPD Chief Financial Officer
Carla Short, SFPW Acting Director
Bruce Robertson, SFPW Deputy Director for Finance and Administration

Attachment A
Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Budget

Dollars in Thousands

	FY 2019-20 Revised Budget	FY 2020-21 Revised Budget	FY 2021-22 Revised Budget	FY 2022-23 Revised Budget	FY 2023-24 Proposed Budget
Sources					
MBTIF	8,100	3,170	7,610	8,800	9,100
Uses					
SFMTA Allocation	6,207	2,778	5,868	4,792	4,968
SFPD Allocation	1,285	280	1,214	2,959	3,051
SFPW Allocation	558	112	528	1,050	1,081
CON Allocation	50	0	0	0	0
Sources Minus Uses	0	0	0	0	0

Attachment B

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Budget: SFMTA Planned Operational Deployment FY2022-2023 and FY2023-2024 as Compared to FY2021-22

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund SFMTA Adjustment in FY2021-22 Due to Operator Shortage

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• No additional MuniMetro/LRV or Bus deployment• No PCO deployment with exceptions• No MTAP (crowd control) staff deployment
Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 1 additional 2-car MuniMetro/LRV deployment• 3 additional 60-ft coaches on the 78X• Modified PCO deployment, 17 total• Half MTAP deployment
Level 3: >10k (112 Events)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 3 additional 2-car MuniMetro/LRV deployment• 6 additional 60-ft coaches on the 78X• Full PCO deployment, 25 total• Full MTAP deployment

Staffing levels subject to exception depending on event requirements

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund SFMTA Planned Deployment in FY2022-23 and FY2023-24

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• No additional MuniMetro/LRV or Bus deployment• No PCO deployment with exceptions• No MTAP (crowd control) staff deployment
Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 3 additional two-car MuniMetro/LRV deployment• 3 additional 60-ft coaches on the 78X• 3 additional 40-ft coaches on the 79X• Modified PCO deployment, 17 total• Half MTAP deployment
Level 3: >10k (112 + 16 Events)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 6 additional two-car MuniMetro/LRV deployment• 6 additional 60-ft coaches on the 78X• 6 additional 40-ft coaches on the 79X• Full PCO deployment, 25 total• Full MTAP deployment

Staffing levels subject to exception depending on event requirements

Attachment C

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Budget: SFPD Planned Operational Deployment FY2022-2023 and FY2023-2024

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund

SFPD Flexible Operational Deployment in FY2022-23 and FY2023-24

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$9,267
- Bike Officers (2)
- Traffic Officers (5)
- Foot beat Officers (3)

Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$11,120
- Bike Officers (2)
- Traffic Officers (5)
- Foot beat Officers (5)

Level 3: >10k (112 +16 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$15,754
- Bike Officers (2)
- Traffic Officers and Honda Unit (12)
- Foot beat Officers (5)
- Marine Unit

Attachment D

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund (MBTIF) Budget: SFPW Planned Operational Deployment FY2022-2023 and FY2023-2024

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund SF Public Works Planned Deployment in FY2022-23 and FY2023-24

Level 1: <5k (20 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$FY23: \$2,548 ; FY24: \$2,624
- 2 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

Level 2: >=5k to <10k (68 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$FY23: \$5,095 ; FY24: \$5,248
- 4 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

Level 3: >10k (112 + 16 Events)

- Cost Estimate: \$FY23: \$5,095 ; FY24: \$5,248
- 4 Hours of Post-Event Cleanup (to begin 1 hour after event end time)
- Field crew of 6 general laborers, 2 truck drivers, and 1 working supervisor

Attachment E

Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee

January 27, 2022

Motion of Support

The Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee supports with conditions as stipulated in the letter, the budget submitted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), Police Department (SFPD) and Public Works (SFPW) at the XXXXX XX, 2022 Advisory Committee meeting.

To assist the Committee in proactively monitoring potential Chase Center impacts and the level of services provided by the City, the Committee will work with applicable City departments to update and monitor a comprehensive dashboard for determining the effectiveness of all City services and right-sizing department budgets.

Motion made by Bruce Agid, Chair
Seconded by XXXXXX

Vote:

Bruce Agid
Manoj Madhavan
Catherine Sharpe
Amit Kothari
Sarah Davis



**Mission Bay Transportation Improvement
Fund Advisory Committee**

Bruce Agid – Chair
Amit Kothari – Co-Chair
Sarah Davis
Manoj Madhavan
Catherine Sharpe

DRAFT

December 16, 2021

Dear Samuel Thomas;

Congratulations on your new position as the Budget Director for the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing. Knowing your expertise and dedication, we are confident that the City Department and the San Francisco community will be very well served.

On behalf of the Mission Bay Transportation Improvement Fund Advisory Committee (MB TIF AC) members, I want to acknowledge your praiseworthy contributions since the Committee formation in 2019. During the last two years, the Committee tackled many complex matters pertaining to the impacts of the brand-new Chase Center on Mission Bay residents, businesses and public entities. Your deep knowledge of the MB TIF legislation, City's budgetary processes and policies, tenacity and professionalism were invaluable to the Committee's success.

Thank you for your outstanding contributions, and best wishes in your new role.

Bruce Agid
Chair, MB TIF Advisory Committee

cc: Jeff Tumlin – Director of Transportation, City and County of San Francisco
SFMTA Board of Directors
MB TIF AC Members

MB TIF AC 2022-2023 Work Plan Draft December 30, 2021 (Bruce Agid, Chairperson)

	January 27, 2022	April 28, 2022	July 28, 2022	September 22, 2022	October 27, 2022	November 17, 2022	December 15, 2022	January 26, 2023	April 27, 2023
SFMTA/City Activities for budget process	City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 22-23 & 23-24 budget	Budget vs Actuals Update FY 21-22	Budget vs Actuals Update FY 21-22 & FY 22-23 Review of budget development & approval cycle for FY 23-24 & 24-25	City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget	City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget	City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget	City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget	City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget	Budget vs Actuals Update FY 22-23
SFMTA/City Activities /meeting focus	<p>Advisory committee finalizes formal statement to Mayor’s Budget Office</p> <p>Quarterly Review of TIF Metrics Dashboard</p> <p>Review 6 months of metrics to understand Port and Mission Bay Park’s needs</p> <p>Finalize & approve 2022-23 Work Plan</p>	<p>Quarterly Review of TIF Metrics Dashboard</p> <p>Elect Chair and Co-Chair for 2022</p> <p>Review Local Hospital Access Plan (LHAP) Delay Metric</p>	<p>Quarterly review of TIF Metrics Dashboard</p> <p>Review Metrics as integrated into budget proposals</p> <p>Local Hospital Access Plan (LHAP) Delay Metric discussion</p>	<p>City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget</p> <p>Expenditure and service level updates</p> <p>SFMTA, SFPD and SFPW provide update of operations and spending to date, actual vs. planned</p> <p>Advisory Committee comments on presentations and discusses service levels.</p>	<p>Quarterly review of TIF Metrics Dashboard</p> <p>Review Metrics as integrated into budget proposals</p> <p>City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget</p> <p>Departments present proposed FY 23-24 & 24-25 budgets and planned service levels</p>	<p>City Departments Work with MB TIF AC on FY 23-24 & 24-25 budget</p> <p>Departments present updated proposed FY 23-24 & 24-25 budgets and planned service levels</p>	<p>Departments present final budgets and service levels</p> <p>Advisory Committee provides feedback for formal statement to Mayor’s Budget Office</p>	<p>Advisory committee finalizes formal statement to Mayor’s Budget Office</p> <p>Quarterly Review of TIF Metrics Dashboard</p> <p>Finalize & approve 2023-24 Work Plan</p>	<p>Quarterly Review of TIF Metrics Dashboard</p> <p>Elect Chair and Co-Chair for 2023</p> <p>Review Local Hospital Access Plan (LHAP) Delay Metric</p>