

**Minutes**  
**PCC Executive Committee Meeting**  
**May 12, 2021**

PCC Executive Committee Members Present: Fred Lein, PCC Chair; Bob Planthold, PCC Vice Chair; Marty Smith, PCC Secretary; Cheryl Damico; Jacy Cohen; Jane Redmond; Kevin Lee; Mara Math; Olivia Santiago; Robert Grant; Sam Alicia Duke; Susan Kitazawa

PCC Members and Guests: Robin Abad; Nicole Bohn

PCC Executive Committee Member Excused: Bruce Oka; Gilda Chico; Roland Wong

SF Paratransit Staff: Marc Soto; Kent Hinton; Richard Foiles; Cheryl Hac; Kevin McDonald; Justin Leong; Carol Osorio; Catherine Callahan; Matthew Teixeira

SFMTA: Annette Williams; Erin McAuliff; Jonathan Cheng; Maddy Ruvolo; Monica Munowitch

Fred Lein, PCC Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

**Read and Approve Agenda**

Fred Lein, PCC Chair, read the agenda. A new item regarding an update on the TNC Access for All legislation was added after Item #4. The agenda were motioned/seconded/approved as amended.

**Comments from the Chair**

Fred Lein commented that he has noticed that the taxi business is picking up with more people getting vaccinated and tourists returning to the city.

Annette Williams provided an update on her recent injury, indicated that she injured her pelvic bone while hiking but is recovering nicely. Cheryl Damico stated that Bruce Oka was recently hospitalized and recovering at home. Jonathan Cheng announced that the five year extension of the Paratransit agreement was approved by the San Francisco Board of Supervisors,

**Shared Spaces Program**

Robin Abad presented on the Shared Spaces Program.

He introduced the Shared Spaces Program, which was created during pandemic and meant to provide commercial spaces for business outdoors such as retail, dining, personal care, gym, entertainment and arts. Approximately a fifth of all spaces are for curbside pick up. The COVID-19 pandemic extended beyond a public health crisis to an economic crisis, particularly for small businesses. The design guidelines have shifted based on the color tiered restrictions with an evolving criteria and thoughts about what was permissible outdoors. According to surveys conducted, the Shared Space Program has been essential in keeping businesses open and many indicated that they want them to continue permanently as they are seen as opportunity to aid in economic recovery. In terms of accessibility, ADA standards are already required in the business

permit and the city's Planning Department has multiple ways of communicating to business of what ADA requirements are needed include design guidelines and webinars.

Currently, enforcement has occurred following the implementation of the business' Shared Space. In the future, compliance will be done multiple times during the permitting process as well post-implementation. About 75 percent of the ADA-related complaints are recorded by Department of Public Works (DPW) staff and the remaining submitted by the public. 71 percent of complaints are closed and remaining still pending. Turnaround to respond to complaints is approximately three days with businesses given up to 30 days to comply with any violations and follow up by DPW staff; failure to comply can lead to punitive fines and eventually lead to permit revocation. In the future, all Shared Space facilities will have to provide accessible seating. Many city agencies will be involved in certain aspects of the permitting including the SFMTA, which is responsible for the roadway and travel lanes.

Bob Planthold made a complaint on a poorly constructed Shared Space that block the gutter and floods the sidewalk when it rains. Robin replied that the quick build mentality of the Shared Space program has caused some problems, including some poorly constructed parklets. With the codification of this program, changes will be made in the design guidelines to prevent this from occurring. Bob also asked if there a limit on the number of parklets on a single block as having too many parklets on a single block may limit the ability of Paratransit vehicles to access the sidewalk to load/unload riders. Monica Munowitch answered that in the future, there will be a more thoughtful process to evaluate the transportation and road space in a more holistic way, which could lead to the revocation of permits. Nicole Bohn added that staff is working to make the permitting process more transparent. Jane Redmond questioned how quickly complaints are resolved. Robin says it varies depending on the type of problem and resolution required to meet compliance.

Cheryl Damico asked if taxis could use these spaces to pick up or drop off a rider. Monica Munowitch indicated that it could be used for drop offs as they zones are meant for high frequency use and have a five minute time limit. Mara Math if wait trips are allowed. Kent Hinton responded that wait trips are not allowed on Paratransit.

Kevin Lee asked if any outreach is conducted to neighborhood businesses or residents when applications are received. Robin Abad indicated that once the program is codified, public notice will be required for any proposed parklet. These hearings are a part of the process to allow members of the public to provide input. Kevin also inquired as to how these spaces are maintained and prevent homelessness. Robin stated that one provision of having such a space is that business can secure the parklet overnight and that accessibility is only required during daylight and business hours. He also encouraged anyone to report any complaints to 31.1.

### **TNC Access for All**

Erin McAuliff provided an update about the TNC Access for All legislation.

The program, being implemented by California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) through legislation signed by governor, is meant to hold TNC companies accountable in ensuring that they are accessible to wheelchair users. The CPUC has been conducting rulemaking for the past

three years. This program established a 10 cent per trip fee to fund wheelchair accessible (WAV) transportation. TNC companies can keep it these funds if they provide a certain level of WAV service; if not, funds must be provided to other agencies providing on-demand wheelchair transportation. The CPUC is currently working on developing the standards for TNC companies to keep these funds. The current rulemaking only allows transportation companies regulated by the CPUC to be able to access the funds if the TNCs do not meet requirements. The SFMTA is advocating to allow public transit agencies not regulated by the CPUC, like Paratransit agencies to apply for funds. SFMTA is also encouraging CPUC to strengthen requirements around transportation policy regarding driverless vehicles. The CPUC is collecting comments from the public through June and are encouraging wheelchair users with experience using TNCs to provide feedback. Erin stated that she will send out contact information once she receives it. Nicole Bohn added that she would like to see expansive transportation options made available to those with mobility aids and is strongly encouraging the disabled community, particularly those with mobility aids, to provide feedback regarding their experience requesting TNCs.

Fred Lein asked if there was any movement on allowing non-CPUC transportation providers to access fund. Erin McAuliff mentioned that it seems like they are open to that possibility but that the commissioners are concerned that safety requirements of non-CPUC entities. She indicated that information is being provided about safety requirements of such agencies to provide clarity

Susan Kitazawa would like to ensure that the blind community is involved in addressing the needs of the disabled community. She would like to give feedback to the CPUC as based on her experience, TNC drivers rarely give accessible notification to blind people that they have arrived for pick up or where their vehicle is located; this lack of communication often results in drivers leaving, thinking the rider is a no-show. Nicole Bohn stated that while they are currently focused addressing the needs of the wheelchair users, they can incorporate comments regarding other accessibility needs into next set of comments. Bob Planthold asked if anyone has done a test of the 503 compliant. Nicole Bohn said that they can pose the question to the companies.

### **Jewel McGinnis Luncheon**

Jonathan Cheng provided an update about the Jewel McGinnis Luncheon. He indicated that he would like to have the event in-person but would like to convene an ad-hoc committee of the PCC to help plan the event as well as determine a location that would facilitate such an event.

### **PC&O Group Van Subcommittee Report**

The summary report of the April 14 Group Van Subcommittee meeting is as follows:

- **SF Paratransit Status Update**

Kent Hinton of the Broker's Office reported demand for SF Access was 50% of the pre-pandemic level but expects to see an increase as further restrictions are lifted with reopening. Taxi demand has exceeded pre-pandemic levels by 10% due to the ETC (Essential Trip Card) program providing an additional 300 trips per week. Drivers and vehicles continued to be provided for Emergency Services and Pier 94 Shuttles.

Transdev's driver roster was reduced to two-thirds of the pre-pandemic number and while working to recruit they noticed a smaller pool of applicants. Alfonso Estera of the Broker's Office would send participant lists to SFMTA Group agencies to confirm their eligibility status.

- **Group Van Service Reintroduction Task Force**

Kent reported agencies should provide 60-days' notice ahead of expected resumption of transportation to help ensure staffing and schedules could be ready. Catholic Charities was the only program presenting a firm reopening plan as of the last meeting. He asked agencies to advise of their reopening details as soon as possible and to involve paratransit with their formal transportation plans. The next meeting would be April 21st at 3 pm and those interested in joining should contact Justin or Kent for info.

- **Agency Status Reports**

- Institute on Aging reported they were planning a June 1st reopening at much reduced capacity, understanding this was less than 60-days' notice. They would connect with paratransit offline after call.
- On-Lok 30th Street Senior Center's leadership started planning but had no set reopening date. They continued providing meals to-go or by home delivery as well as virtual activities. They were awaiting further guidance from DAS.
- Self-Help's for the Elderly's ADS (Adult Day Services) branch continued providing daily calls to participants and home delivered meals. They were planning to provide limited on-site services starting in June with riders using SF Access. Some of their vehicles were awaiting CHP inspection because they would not inspect them during their closure.
- Self-Help for the Elderly's DAS branch reported they provided about 200 trips per month over the last quarter, running at 23% of their pre-pandemic level. They had 225 clients that needed to have their eligibility renewed. They were awaiting guidance from DAS on reopening centers. Their daily route count fluctuated due to driver availability when they expanded their home delivered meal program.
- SteppingStone noted that the State's checklist required six-foot distancing which they would be following in-center. They understood that all participants would need to attend their centers at least one day per week by October 31st, 2021. Their reopening plans should be complete by June 1st and they hoped that they could reopen before end of October as many of their clients were eager to return.
- The Arc of San Francisco reported working with Regional Center on their reopening efforts. Jacy Cohen suggested working with families to see if they could provide transportation to ease capacity concerns. They continued serving participants one-on-one out in the community using Google Maps to coordinate geographically. They planned to start serving small groups in May using the same model. They anticipated September would be the earliest in-center services could resume and 60-days' notice would be provided.
- DAS (Department of Disability and Aging Services) invited those on the call to join their webinar next Tuesday April 20th for guidance on reopening. Mike Zaugg noted The City's current guidance allowed 25% capacity for centers but no congregate meals.

The next PC&O Group Van Subcommittee meeting date is July 14th, 2021.

### **PC&O Taxi/Ramp Taxi Subcommittee Report**

The summary report of the May 5 Taxi/Ramp Subcommittee meeting is as follows:

- **Comments from the Chair**  
Marty Smith covered for Bruce Oka who could not attend. Marty thanked the SFMTA for allowing drivers to get vaccinated and mentioned that we just need to keep getting people vaccinated.
- **SF Paratransit Broker Report**  
Kent Hinton reported that taxi trips have been operating slightly below pre-pandemic levels, not including ETC. SF Access is experiencing less than half of pre-pandemic service demand. Taxis are providing 150 to 200 ETC trips on weekdays and 150 to 160 on weekends. Paratransit continues providing drivers and vehicles in support of Emergency Management Services. Kent updated the committee on recent on-time performance, as well as ramp taxi incentive payments. SFMTA has launched a vacation free-ride program which includes the Paratransit and ETC programs. Some agencies previously participating in the SFMTA Group Van program have indicated intent to resume in-person congregate services. Several staff promotions following the retirement of Richard Folies were announced, as well as the hiring of a new staff member to backfill the van services monitor position. Marc Soto reported that Board of Supervisor approved a five-year extension to Transdev's SFMT Paratransit contract.
- **Rider Issues**  
Susan Kitazawa reported being picked up by a driver who appeared to be looking at a hand held device while the taxi was moving along the street rather than looking ahead of the vehicle. He continued this behavior after she asked him not to do this. She has reported this to the taxi company and to Paratransit but has not received any response. Kent Hinton will follow up. Marty commented that we should have representatives from other cab companies sat our meetings to help get out information related to Paratransit.
- **Public Comment**  
The next PCC Executive Meeting will be held Wednesday, May 12, 2021. Bob Planthold requested an item to be added to the PCC agenda to discuss the shared spaces program. Several members inquired about Bruce Oka and staff committed to reaching out to Bruce.

### **Paratransit Broker Report**

Kent Hinton, Mary McLain, Kevin McDonald, and Marc Soto reported as follow:

- **Service Level Statistics**  
Trip levels is still down from pre-pandemic levels. SF Access is operating at about 50 percent of pre-pandemic levels while taxis are at approximately 70 to 80 percent. However, when ETC trips are included, more taxi trips are being provided before the pre-pandemic.
- **On Time Performance**  
SF Access on-time performance continued to perform about 98 percent in April. Taxi on-time performance has remained consistent between 92 to 98 percent. Overall complaints are down.

- **COVID related service**  
SF Paratransit continues to provide EMS service and the Pier 94 shuttle. SF Access and Paratransit taxi is providing financial assistance to those who want to use Paratransit to get to and from their vaccine appointments. On SF Access, four one-way trips are available at no cost to riders while \$60 of taxi value has been loaded onto the cards of all active Paratransit taxi riders. For ETC riders, a one-time month allotment increase to \$60 is available and robocalls were made to riders to inform them of this new allotment.
- **SF Access**  
Staff is working on ensuring there is sufficient personnel to meet anticipated increases in trip demand. At the moment, there are enough driver to meet existing demand and some future increase. There are currently some difficulties recruiting drivers and 15 trainees are undergoing training now.
- **Group Van Service**  
Staff is working to Group Van agencies to get a better sense of when they anticipate reopening to in-person activities. Catholic Charities is reopened with SF Paratransit providing limited group van service. Staff is working with the Institute on Aging and Stepping Stone with anticipated service resumptions in June and July. Others agencies may open at various times in the fall through the end of the year. Staff is making them aware that due to the social distancing requirements, a limited number of participants could be transported on a vehicle and that masks are required at all times.
- **SF Access Online and Taxi Online**  
Information will be sent to SF Access riders on how to register and booking trips online. Staff is prepared to assist users with registration. For SF Taxi Online, staff is working to update the purchase functionality and clarify the enrollment procedure.
- **Staff Change**  
Kevin McDonald took over as the Director of Finance and Administration. Replacing Kevin as the Contracts Administrator on an interim basis is Justin Leong. Matthew Teixeira was introduced as the SF Access Van Compliance Monitor.
- Marc Soto also expressed his immense gratitude to the PCC members for their support over the last 20 years

Fred Lein asked how the free vaccine trips work for Paratransit taxi riders. Kent Hinton responded that all active Paratransit taxi riders were issued \$60 worth of value onto their taxi debit card and a one-time allotment of \$60 is available for purchase.

### **Public Comments**

Erin McAuliff announced that starting June 6, the Adaptive Bikeshare program will be restarted in Golden Gate Park. Adaptive bikes will be available from 11AM to 4PM. This is a continuation

of pilot that started in 2019. Bikes are available on a first come, first serve basis but reservations can be made via the BORP website.

Mara Math stated she recently took a taxi ride and the driver indicated that they will not accept Paratransit trips anymore. Kevin Lee filed a complaint recently regarding the misinformation provided by the dispatcher regarding the availability of taxi and their attitude. Susan Kitazawa indicated that she has had good experience communicating with the dispatchers

Nicole Bohn thanked everyone for their engagement and encouraged with policy level concerns to elevate any concerns to Mayor's Office on Disability. She said that the best way to contact the department is via email or phone.

Robert Grant thanked Kate Fitzpatrick as she was helpful when he had issues using the SF Access Online portal. Sam Alicia Duke thanked Kevin McDonald and Justin Leong for their help in connecting her to the meeting today.

### **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 12:30 pm.

**The next PCC meeting will be held on Wednesday, 18<sup>th</sup> from 10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.**