



**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND  
PARKING AUTHORITY COMMISSION**

**MINUTES**

Tuesday, February 2 at 1:00 PM until recessed (approximately 5PM)  
and  
Wednesday, February 3, 2021 at 1:00 until adjourned (approximately 5PM)

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Board Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the Board's Meeting Room (Room 400) is closed.

**Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm on Monday, February 1 or call (415) 646-4470. Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.**

**NOTE:**

This Special Two-Day Meeting replaces the previously scheduled Regular Meeting of February 2, 2021

**SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Gwyneth Borden, Chair  
Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair  
Cheryl Brinkman  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

Jeffrey Tumlin  
DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Caroline Celaya  
acting SECRETARY

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Borden called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Gwyneth Borden  
Cheryl Brinkman  
Amanda Eaken  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement was made.

### 4. Communications

Chair Borden discussed the virtual meeting and expressed appreciation to staff for their work to enable the meeting to be held via teleconference. Board Secretary Celaya reviewed how members of the public could watch the meeting and address the Board.

Chair Borden suggested that staff determine if the SFMTA can scroll the teleconference message similar to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission does for their meetings.

### 5. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

Neil Ballard, Chair, Citizens' Advisory Council, presented the report.

No public comment.

### 6. Presentation and discussion regarding the financial responsibilities of the SFMTA. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation. Fulfills Charter Section 8A.102 (c) (3) training requirements.)

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Bob Planthold stated that he is a senior with a lifelong mobility disability, so he is transit dependent. He questioned the data that's been provided and has asked staff how many buses will be on Market Street but received no answer. When the pandemic first hit, he questioned the decisions the agency made as certain areas were entirely cut off from service such as St. Mary's hospital. It appears staff is

only responding to survey responders but people who doesn't have access to technology are left out in the cold. The Board needs to look at how staff is making their decisions.

Joel stated he is a member of SEIU and that the SFMTA appears to be dependent on an ever-dwindling labor market to fill craft positions. To recruit and maintain the best people, the agency has to pay top dollar. He hopes the Board urges the city, during negotiations, to not rely on pay freezes or making employees pay more for health care. This creates ill will amongst workers and many leave for higher paying jobs.

Aleta Dupree stated that equity and finance are both important, but equity must allow everybody to participate and should not be rooted in definitions. There are people that do not fit definitions. She supports a higher transit sales tax but questioned if the public would support it. With the new tax money, the agency needs to invest in new infrastructure and continue American Disability Act (ADA) work.

Hayden Miller discussed the agency culture and public trust. He heard from frontline workers that they don't trust management. Most members of the public don't understand the role that the SFMTA plays and only sees the agency as giving them parking tickets. He urged the Board to work on the SFMTA's reputation with employees and the public and build confidence. It's a false narrative that the financial situation is preventing additional service from being added right now. He urged the use of mobile cleaning.

Barry Taranto stated that the agency is destroying the cab business by not allowing them to use the transit lane on Market Street. He urged the Board to pursue federal money for subsidized rides for seniors and disabled and to compensate taxi drivers for serving those communities. Taxi drivers should be paid what paratransit van drivers get paid. It's a bleak future given that it'll be another year or two before taxis can pick up business and conventions clients.

7. Presentation and discussion regarding the status of the SFMTA's accomplishments and challenges. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Bob Planthold stated that he had hoped board members would be questioning the statistics in the presentation. Ninety percent of those with a disability don't use ramps and they need better, more responsive service. For example, at Church and Market, the stop doesn't work for the disabled community. The Board has not responded to the changes to the 27 line where there is now no service to the dental school nor the Independent Living Research Center. This doesn't serve people well.

Trevor Adams discussed safety issues and adequate staffing for parking control officers (PCO). Enforcement is more difficult now than ever. Please consider what PCO's need to do their jobs including a safe, COVID free workplace as the number of positive COVID cases are staggering. This is causing an uproar in employee morale. Please safeguard this group.

Shayda Haghgoo stated that as a planner with the SFMTA, her key responsibility is to secure the future of the community and prepare for setbacks. The pandemic is a setback and she asked that the Board approach the budget as a planner would. The choices the Board makes now will have long term impacts.

She asked that the Board look out for the community over the long haul. The SFMTA received \$374 million in the CARES Act and there is more money on the way. The SFMTA doesn't need to reduce staff or service. The agency should set innovative design policy and invest in city workers.

Aleta Dupree stated that she is pleased with some of the accomplishments such as quick builds and car free spaces. There needs to be more car free and traffic calming areas. She appreciates the importance of fixing the subway.

Herbert Weiner stated that there is a perpetual deficit at the SFMTA. He suggested saving money by not going forward with projects such as Geary Boulevard and Van Ness Avenue. Funding should be spent on new buses and new drivers. The Central Subway is a fiasco. He urged the Board to use new money to shore up the deficits. The system has gotten worse and there is less ridership.

Cat Carter applauded the miles of Temporary Emergency Transit Lanes (TETL) and hopes the next miles come soon. This is a crucial investment in rider accessibility, overall mobility, in efficiency and cost savings. She looks forward to continuing to work with the SFMTA on preserving those bureaucratic savings and moving needed transit improvements forward as fast as possible, followed by rider and community outreach to make sure final projects are the best they can be. She appreciates the conversation about the trade-offs between effective, useful outreach and getting projects done quickly. She supports using pilot projects as outreach.

De John Imangadan stated that, as an employee of the SFMTA, he has worked as a disaster service worker and as an Ambassador to keep people safe. Fellow staffers have cleaned buses and worked at the SFMTA COVID command center. The agency can't afford to cut public services and he urges the Board to use the rainy-day fund and the anticipated federal money. He urged the creation of a budget that works for working people.

Hayden Miller stated that as a daily rider of the 38 line, it's great to see the temporary transit lanes implemented. The agency has struggled with COVID response and their standards aren't up to par with other transit agencies. Capacity limits are too high and there are no mask dispensers or antibacterial wipes available. He urged the Board to invest in safety during the pandemic. The front-line staff doesn't feel like they are being taken care of. On buses, some people don't wear masks and there is no one to help drivers. Please take better care of workers and passengers.

Barry Taranto inquired about enforcement efforts. He urged the agency to help bus operators by working to keep the roads clear. On 24<sup>th</sup> Street and Mission, cars double park and block the bus zone and there's no enforcement. He also expressed concern about cab drivers not getting the COVID vaccine for months.

Nicole Christian discussed the safety and well-being of frontline workers, including PCO's, car cleaners, and street ambassadors. The agency was supposed to hire 50 new car cleaners and they only hired 25 temporary exempt employees. This move is disingenuous to staff morale. Regular hires create a pathway to union wages and temporary exempt employees can be let go anytime. She urged the Board to look at the health and safety of car cleaners.

Kimberly Cox discussed the culture at the SFMTA. Employees need respect. At partnership meetings with the unions and executive team only ten percent of employee issues are followed through. Staff is not being heard. Leadership needs to be more transparent. There are a lot of issues and it's getting worse. Recently, field staff shared their grievances with executive team members and now those employees are being retaliated against. The Racial Equity Action Plan is no help as most of this plan won't go into effect until 2023. Employees need help now.

Pete Wilson thanked the board for avoiding layoffs. He hopes that with the appointment of Pete Buttigieg as the new Secretary of Transportation, the agency will receive federal funding to continue to avoid any layoffs. He discussed the safety of operators who are frequently harassed and spat on. It's unfortunate that there are no sanitizers on the buses. Please provide more masks and more security as it's a major safety concern. He hopes tokens do come back as a form of payment on the buses. The cash receiving machines only want nice crisp bills. The public breathes on operators when trying to put in cash.

8. Presentation and discussion regarding post-COVID recovery programs and projects, Vision Zero progress and plans, priority setting for transit service and delivery, and capital investments. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jodie Medieros urged the Board to focus on cost effective proven solutions, more quick builds, and a more focused approach. Nobody should never feel okay with even one life lost or with holding steady on the numbers or that San Francisco is doing better than other cities. This is not a complete picture of traffic violence in San Francisco. The SFMTA streets budget is only ten percent of their overall capital budget. Prioritize the fastest and cheapest actions. She hopes the Board comes out of this workshop ready to protect Vision Zero funds.

Sterling Hayward stated that he works as a PCO and he feels that the Board is out of touch with frontline staff. No one has ever dealt with a pandemic before, but this is the time when the Board needs to listen to and value what people on the ground are doing. PCO's are getting assaulted and are often overlooked. He urged the board to talk to frontline staff.

Bob Planthold stated that staff neglected to do outreach with the paratransit community. The Multimodal Accessibility Advisory Committee and the Paratransit Coordinating Council did not get to review the recent changes on Better Market Street until after the SFMTA Board presentation. No one thought to present to interior groups before presenting to outside groups. He urged the Board to set that policy.

Edward Mason inquired when the agency was going to engage the San Francisco Police Department in Vision Zero. San Francisco has a culture that operates on a high-octane level of testosterone. We need more police availability because red light cameras aren't the same. He urged the Board to engage with the police department to reduce traffic deaths.

Hayden Miller discussed employees parking on the sidewalk at the Presidio yard. The agency is doing a decent job with transit service that was recently brought back. The 27 line has been redesigned to maximize transit benefits. He urged the Board to redesign more lines, such as the 57 line which doesn't

have a lot of coverage and is confusing. The Board should have service changes ready but do not be overambitious because you will lose riders if service fails.

Barry Taranto stated that outreach has been horrible, and he had to reach out to staff to learn about the Better Market Street changes. Slow Streets are here to stay but they need to be tweaked, particularly at Duboce Triangle and Noe Street. Lake and Page streets are doing great but they need better outreach. Scooters and bikes ignore laws which put pedestrians in danger. He urged staff to do better outreach and for staff to email surveys to taxi drivers too.

Teresa Rutherford stated that she supports SFMTA workers. For the economy to open, transit is key. There must be a focus on the safety of the public and workers. That's the only way to build trust and confidence for riders to come back. Make sure to create a safe environment for workers and provide them with Personal Protective Equipment. PCO's are struggling with assaults and the pandemic makes things worse.

Cat Carter stated that Vision Zero often seems divorced from transit but there is a clear overlap. When there is good access to transit and when it's easy to use, transit can reduce car usage which leads to safer streets. Funding needs to be balanced to meet mobility, equity, climate and Vision Zero goals. She'd like to see pilot projects evaluated in real time.

David Pilpel stated that the closed captioning isn't working. He noted that the Board of Supervisors passed an item urging the SFMTA to reinstate transit lines.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern that seamless transfer points have eroded with the consolidation of bus stops. He urged the Board to restore service as soon as possible. He asked that cyclists be charged for parking as autos must pay to park. He has seen more cars parked on the sidewalk with the deletion of parking spaces. The Board has a responsibility to motorists to balance the needs of all transit.

Rick Laubscher stated that he supports bringing back the F line as soon as possible. It's one of Muni's busiest lines that hasn't been restored yet. It is an important generator of revenue which is critical. Currently there is no service from the Ferry Building to Fisherman's Wharf. It's more than just a visitor line as residents use it too. The historic street cars attract discretionary riders which means more revenue. The line carries more than seven million riders a year. The F line also connects the Castro to the Wharf.

The meeting was recessed at 6:17 p.m.

The Chair called the meeting back to order at 1:00 p.m. on February 3, 2021. All board members were present.

9. Presentation and discussion regarding the SFMTA's operating and capital fiscal and structural deficits and possible options to address. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Danny Yeung stated that he is an SFMTA employee and he has seen how capable the agency is with finding creative solutions. The Board has several choices to make in crafting a budget. He urged the Board to focus on investing in staff and to say “no” to layoffs. He urged the Board to make a public commitment to not include layoffs. Staff morale and employee burnout is real. Staff morale and mental health are important. Budget staff are working hard, and a federal relief package is on the way.

Aleta Dupree discussed the importance of preserving capital funds. If funds are moved from the capital budget to the operating budget, ADA work will be compromised. It’s a priority as is the State of Good Repair. Do not raise fares during this crisis. People who use Muni are important.

Hayden Miller suggested bringing back tokens as a cost cutting measure. People love them and they bring in revenue. He also suggested selling multi-year passes at a discount. There are many opportunities for revenue in parking enforcement.

Kim Pham stated employees have taken on extra work as disaster service workers. Services should not be cut to close the budget gap. There is \$975 million dedicated for Bay Area transit agencies. The agency has 540 unfilled full-time positions which adds to costs savings. The SFMTA should provide services and a budget that supports city workers.

Nicole Christian stated that the narrative of the financial situation is very much gloom and doom. If we work together, we can rebuild the agency revenue. The agency has relied on the labor side and we haven’t had beneficial conversations. Just saying the word “layoff” makes staff uneasy. Front line staff want a seat at the table because they can tell you how to build revenue. There is also backup revenue from the city. Utilize every aspect to generate more revenue and stop with the layoff talk.

Sterling Harwood urged the Board to speak with ground level employees such as operators and parking control officers. The Board is hustling backwards. The agency is getting rid of parking meters, tow away zones which means that PCO’s can’t do their jobs at one hundred percent. No one is talking to employees about revenue generating ideas.

Aleta Dupree suggested that the agency monetize their real estate and focus on raising revenue through automobile parking. She supports congestion pricing, particularly for cars coming in and out of San Francisco. She’d like to have more information on the bundling of fare and parking products.

Hayden Miller supports the Board pursuing a mega ballot measure. Most voters don’t understand all that the SFMTA does. They only know that they get street cleaning citations and that the buses run late. There must be service increases when the agency goes to voters to ask for money. He urged the Board to look at what can be done without voter approval. Look at parking as a big way to make revenue.

Edward Mason stated that equity for curb space has increased. However, corporate commuter buses get a free pass. They should be charged a franchise fee to operate in the City. Taxi medallion holders must pay as there is no difference between taxis and large taxi buses sponsored by employers. The casino buses are unregulated and those buses block Muni bus zones and parking spaces.

Darryl Yip stated that he is an SFMTA employee and is concerned that reduction options take from workers. This isn’t the right approach. Employees are asked to do more with less. There are short term

options, position vacancies and a citywide reserve. The agency should think long term. We need a budget that values employees.

Trevor Adams stated that parking and traffic fees and fines are the number one contributor to the agency, yet parking control officers are underappreciated. The Agency does not take a proactive stance against PCO's getting assaulted. Employees are working in tight quarters during a pandemic and their director undermines the staggering numbers in positive COVID cases in the department. Because of a poor deployment plan, employees can't be efficient, and morale is low.

Barry Taranto suggested that staff focus on federal money and urge the state to help solve situations they helped create such as barring the city from making Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) more accountable. Congestion pricing impacts those that can't afford it. A lot of parking has been removed for car share and bike share. Staff should re-look at use of parking for small businesses and pick ups and drop offs.

Peter Straus asked the Board to be cautious in the short term and to be aggressive in the long term. He urged the agency to avoid a sales tax or any other regressive measure. He's glad to see congestion pricing as an option and urged that those funds be used to sustain transit service not just to pay for new service. There needs to be fee structures set up for autonomous vehicles. There is interest in a regional transit measure, but a significant portion of funding should be available for operating needs. The advocate community is ready to support transit funding.

Pete Wilson stated that flex pricing is great on coaches after the pandemic is over. He suggested charging less earlier in the morning when buses are now empty. Parking Control Officers are important because they bring in revenue and we may need more of them.

Evelyn Curiel discussed issues with the new supervisor at the Kirkland Division, specifically scheduling issues which affects costs.

Director Yekutiel left the meeting.

Sterling Haywood stated that the prioritization exercise was useless. When staff implements projects like Better Market Street and red transit only lanes, there is no enforcement from the police department so it's a waste of money. That money could be used to help frontline workers. The connection should be that the Board takes care of frontline workers and they take care of citizens and then citizens take care of employees. Get employee input before making budget decisions.

Edward Mason recalled that in 1989, Prop B was endorsed by the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor. It cited transportation projects and other programs, but the fine print read that it was to replace the property tax devoted to transportation. There was an expenditure plan and \$12 million for street tree planning. The Department of Public Works (DPW) drained current funds for tree planting. Now is the time to discuss whether we want Muni or trees. DPW could initiate their own tax for its own project. Be careful with the designation of taxes. Clarification and transparency are utmost in future funding requests.



Dominic Garrett stated that he is an SFMTA employee and that two employees are testing positive for COVID each week. Several shifts have had to quarantine. Nothing happens after talking to management. To help close the budget gap, he suggested offering early retirement and charging for the use of bike lanes. Register bikes for a fee. The SFMTA is losing money in street cleaning because there aren't enough employees to cover shifts and overtime isn't allowed. Don't hire more PCO's to cover Sunday meters as it costs more than overtime for current staff.

Hayden Miller stated that he hopes the Board is listening to employees that have called in, especially on COVID safety and other issues. Choose the bus lines that are most important. The prioritization exercise was frustrating and hard to use. A simple survey is better. Public outreach is valuable.

Cat Carter stated that there is interest in championing robust funding for public transit at a local and national level. She emphasized the importance of transit only lanes.

Hector Jimenez urged the Board to listen to the community and frontline workers. If we work together to find solutions, we won't have any layoffs.

Aleta Dupree stated that she enjoyed the presentation by Tilly Chang. She suggested pushing for re-authorization. San Francisco's transit tax is only ½ percent while other cities have a higher tax, so she is calling for a higher tax. Use the funds to invest and build infrastructure to last a hundred years.

Nicole Christian stated that if the agency believes in equity then community and resiliency should be the top priorities. Don't force the Board to choose between the two. The agency needs to find a way to generate new revenue and many employees have called in with ideas. Employee unions have been vocal on their ideas. Employees can tell you what does and doesn't work. Please listen to employees.

Barry Taranto stated that excluding community engagement is a huge mistake. There needs to be a balance between safety and expediency. He is happy to hear that the unions are interested in working together. To gain more revenue, he suggested staffing PCO's in off hours. He encouraged the board to think outside the box.

ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

  
Caroline Celaya  
Acting Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically

within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call (415) 554-5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call (415) 554-5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the web site: [sfgov.org/ethics](http://sfgov.org/ethics).

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on a agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than Monday, the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

#### KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [sfgov.org](http://sfgov.org).