



**SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND
PARKING AUTHORITY COMMISSION**

MINUTES

Tuesday, March 3, 2020
Room 400, City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

**REGULAR MEETING
1 P.M.**

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Malcolm Heinicke, Chair
Gwyneth Borden, Vice Chair
Cheryl Brinkman
Amanda Eaken
Steve Heminger
Cristina Rubke
Art Torres

Jeffrey Tumlin
DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Roberta Boomer
SECRETARY

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Heinicke called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call

Present: Gwyneth Borden – absent at Roll Call

Cheryl Brinkman

Amanda Eaken

Malcolm Heinicke

Steve Heminger

Cristina Rubke

Art Torres

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

Board Secretary Boomer announced that the ringing and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. The Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic device.

4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the February 18, 2020 Regular Meeting: unanimously approved (Borden-absent).

5. Communications

None.

6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

None.

7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

-Special Recognition

-Update on Vision Zero

-Update on Human Resource efforts

-Ongoing Activities

Director Borden arrived.

Julie Kirschbaum, Director, Transit, recognized the overhead line crew.

Kimberly Ackerman, Director of Human Resources, discussed hiring and retention.

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation, discussed recent fatalities and rapid response and safety efforts; Sunday Streets events and Transit Driver Appreciation Day.

Director Eaken requested a deeper dive on Vision Zero efforts with respect to what staff is learning from incidents and how the SFMTA's approach is evolving.

Chair Heinicke asked for a report back on the closure of Market Street to cars.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Herbert Weiner commended staff for addressing the wiring issues. The problems with service delivery are largely internal. The Muni Forward program doesn't address any of them. These items must be addressed but that hasn't been done.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

No report.

9. Public Comment

Joel Kamisher discussed school crossing guards. They help save money by preventing accidents. The City paid almost \$5 million in claims that could have been spent on better causes. Crossing guards can't prevent all accidents but everyday thousands of cars interact with thousands of distracted pedestrians. The odds of achieving our Vision Zero goal is high.

Robert Cesana asked for the transfer of Kate Toran out of the taxi director position. Nobody wants to come to a meeting because they don't believe what is being said. The information being given out isn't correct. The Supervisors and the City want a working taxi industry. Since the SFMTA took over taxis, the industry has gone downhill. It used to be known as one of the best systems in the nation.

Trinice Oliver discussed Bauer Transportation. They aren't paying her medical bills nor her insurance. The commuter shuttle buses take cars off the street. They did pay her a bonus. The drivers aren't getting paid what they deserve. The company is not following the "labor harmony" provision.

John Hamill discussed Bauer Transportation. There isn't a labor contract currently. They've been working to get one but it hasn't happened. There was a work stoppage three weeks ago but they want to keep negotiating. Drivers aren't getting any response from Bauer. He asked the SFMTA to look at the "labor harmony" provisions and contact Bauer about the contract provisions.

Raina Jones stated that Bauer drivers haven't had a contract for six months and their insurance hasn't been paid. The company didn't tell them they weren't going to pay for those expenses. They're doing the same job as everyone else but they are paid less. The head of Bauer is refusing to negotiate.

Joe Mattekkel discussed Bauer Transportation. They don't have labor harmony. They have left their drivers without health care and are behind in their retirement payments. He asked the SFMTA to pull their permit.

Cat Carter requested an update on the digital signage contract. There hasn't been a great history of good user experience. Signage shouldn't be considered an afterthought. They have advocated for two sided signs for users to make signs more accessible.

Herbert Weiner suggested that Bauer Transportation is inequitable. He addressed the elimination of the stop at 29th and Church Streets to the detriment of seniors and the disabled. He is concerned about the coronavirus. There should be a sign posted on every bus about prevention. The virus can be prevented if precautions are taken.

Evan Oraver discussed pedestrian safety in the Tenderloin. The recent fatality highlights the need for urgent action. There needs to be a deeper dive with the affected communities. He would like to meet with the Board members.

Mary Kate Bacalao discussed pedestrian safety, especially for homeless and low-income families. There are many homeless families in heavily trafficked areas near homeless services. Expansion of the crossing guard program could help resolve these issues and help mitigate risks for the families.

Anthony Carrasco agreed with Ms. Bacalao about the need for safety for pedestrians. He discussed a study about having crossing guards for children. The study said that crossing guards are a boon for children and support children in developing healthy and safe pedestrian behaviors for the rest of their lives. There should be investments in their safety.

Arnell Justin discussed the unfairness that Bauer bus drivers are experiencing. As bus drivers, they risk their lives every day but they aren't covered medically. She risks her life every day on the road but is paid less. They just want what they are owed as drivers. The company only gives excuses for why their medical insurance wasn't paid.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

(10.1) Approving the following traffic modifications:

- A. ESTABLISH – NO PARKING ANYTIME – Hawes Street, east side, between Fitzgerald Avenue and Egbert Avenue.
- B. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY, NO PARKING ANYTIME – ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME, Daniel Burnham Court, both sides, between Franklin Street and Van Ness Avenue
- C. ESTABLISH – CROSSWALK CLOSURE – Diamond Heights Boulevard at Berkeley Way (E), north leg.
- D. ESTABLISH – NO PARKING, 12:01 AM TO 6 AM, EVERYDAY – Hilton Street, east side, from Cortland Avenue to 240 feet southerly.
- E. ESTABLISH – NO PARKING ANY TIME – Dewey Boulevard, south side, from Dewey Circle to 55 feet easterly, Dewey Boulevard, north side, from Pacheco Street to 49 feet westerly, Dewey Boulevard, south side, from 15 feet to 45 feet west of Pacheco Street, Dewey Boulevard, north side, from 15 feet to 55 feet east of Pacheco Street, Dewey Boulevard, south side, from Pacheco Street to 39 feet easterly.
- F. RESCIND – TOW – AWAY, NO PARKING, 10 PM TO 6 AM, EVERYDAY – ESTABLISH – 45 DEGREE ANGLE PARKING, Alemany Boulevard, north side, between Sagamore Street and Habitat Terrace.
- G. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME, Alemany Boulevard, north side, between Habitat Terrace and Crystal Street.
- H. RESCIND – NO PARKING VEHICLES OVER 6 FEET – Sanchez Street, west side, from Alvarado Street to 89 feet northerly, Sanchez Street, west side, from Alvarado Street to 95 feet southerly.
- I. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE – Sanchez Street, west side, from Alvarado Street to 12 feet northerly Sanchez Street, west side, from Alvarado Street to 10 feet southerly.
- J. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME – Fulton Street, south side, from 20 feet east of 14th Avenue crosswalk to Park Presidio.
- K. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE – Fulton Street, south side, from west crosswalk at 18th Avenue to 20 feet easterly.
- L. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE – Fulton St., south side, from 75 feet to 95 feet east of Clayton St.
- M. ESTABLISH – PERPENDICULAR PARKING – ESTABLISH – NO VEHICLES OVER 18 FEET LONG – Gilman Avenue, north side, between Griffith Street and Arelious Walker Drive, temporarily until December 31, 2023.

- N. ESTABLISH – RED ZONE – Gilman Avenue, north side, from 40 feet east of Giants Drive to 74 feet westerly, Gilman Avenue, south side, from east curb line of Griffith Street to 26 feet westerly, Gilman Avenue, south side, from 30 feet to 50 feet west of Giants Drive.
- O. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE – Gilman Avenue, south side, from 50 feet to 240 feet west of Giants Drive.
- P. ESTABLISH – 60-DEGREE ANGLED PARKING – Carroll Avenue, south side, from west crosswalk to 290 feet westerly, temporarily until December 31, 2029.
- Q. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, FIRE LANE — 4th Street, west side, from 188 feet to 227 feet south of Howard Street and making environmental review findings. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution. For every parking and traffic modification that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code.)

All items were severed from the Consent Calendar at the request of members of the public.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Melodie and Flo Kelly

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Richard Hibbs

RESOLUTION 200303-025

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Brinkman, Eaken, Heinicke, Heminger, and Rubke

NAYES - Torres

REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Amending Transportation Code, Division II to designate new transit-only lanes on Powell Street and approving various parking and traffic modifications along Powell Street between Ellis Street and Geary Street as follows:

- A. ESTABLISH – LEFT TURN ONLY EXCEPT MUNI AND TAXIS - Powell Street, southbound, at O’Farrell Street
- B. ESTABLISH – NO RIGHT TURN - O’Farrell Street, eastbound, at Powell Street
- C. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING ANY TIME - Powell Street, west side, from Ellis Street to O’Farrell Street; Powell Street, east side, from Ellis Street to 80 feet northerly; Powell Street, east side, from 163 feet north of Ellis Street to O’Farrell Street; Powell Street, west side, from O’Farrell Street to 88 feet northerly; Powell Street, west side, from 147 feet north of O’Farrell Street to Geary Street; Powell Street, east side, from O’Farrell Street to 79 feet northerly; Powell Street, east side, from 175 feet north of O’Farrell Street to Geary Street;

O'Farrell Street, south side, from Powell Street to 148 feet easterly; O'Farrell Street, south side, from Powell Street to 23 feet westerly; Ellis Street, north side, from Powell Street to 25 feet easterly; Ellis Street, north side, from Powell Street to 24 feet westerly

- D. ESTABLISH – NO PARKING ANY TIME EXCEPT PASSENGER AND COMMERCIAL LOADING - Powell Street, east side, from 80 feet to 163 feet north of Ellis Street, Powell Street, west side, from 88 feet to 147 feet north of O'Farrell Street; Powell Street, east side, from 79 feet to 175 feet north of O'Farrell Street
- E. RESCIND – BUS ZONE - O'Farrell Street, south side, from Powell Street to Cyril Magnin St.
- F. ESTABLISH – PASSENGER LOADING ZONE AT ALL TIMES - O'Farrell Street, south side, from 23 feet to 43 feet west of Powell Street
- G. ESTABLISH – YELLOW METERED LOADING ZONE, 30-MINUTE TIME LIMIT, AT ALL TIMES - O'Farrell Street, south side, from 43 feet west of Powell Street to Cyril Magnin Street
- H. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE - O'Farrell Street, south side, from Powell Street to 130 feet easterly
- I. ESTABLISH – YELLOW METERED TRUCK LOADING ZONE, 30-MINUTE TIME LIMIT, AT ALL TIMES - O'Farrell Street, north side, from 6 feet to 73 feet east of Powell Street.
(Explanatory documents include a staff report, map, amendment and resolution. The proposed actions are Approval Actions as defined by S.F. Administrative Code Chapter 31.)

Mark Draeger, Transportation Planner, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Cat Carter

Director Heminger requested a report regarding methods of construction that can be used for projects that are in the pipeline and whether there are different ways to proceed with public engagement and construction.

RESOLUTION 200303-026

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Brinkman, Eaken, Heinicke, Heminger, Rubke, and Torres

12. Presentation and discussion regarding transit service. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Julie Kirschbaum, Director, Transit, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Herbert Weiner expressed appreciation for the improvements but said there are problems with surface transportation. He mentioned the schedule of the 2 Clement. There needs to be equity in transportation. There is still a “bully culture” in the SFMTA that employees are suffering from. This

must be addressed. He would like to see more focus on surface transportation. There's a lot of room for improvement.

13. Presentation and discussion regarding changes to various rates, fees, charges, and fines in the Fiscal Year 2021 and FY 2022 SFMTA Operating Budget. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, indexing plan, proposed fares, fees, fines, rates and slide presentation.)

Chair Heinicke left the meeting.

Leo Levenson, Director, Finance and Information Technology, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Rebekah Evenson discussed towing practices and fees. She represents people who are suing the SFMTA for unpaid parking tickets. These fees violate due process rights. There are proposals to reduce the fees charged for towing but even with that, there are still situations where people with low incomes are punished. She urged that the practice be discontinued.

Elisa Della-Piana discussed towing fees. The number of people who lose their cars after a tow is 50-60%. That's a total loss for some people. This is draconian impact but that's what's happening. There is a solution, which is to reduce or eliminate tows. It costs a lot and people are losing their homes when their cars are towed.

Tori Larson stated that she works with low-income clients. She hears from people every day who live in their vehicle and have their car towed. Reducing a fee to \$100 is reasonable. The SFMTA is adding an administrative step, to have to prove someone is homeless, which is offensive. People who are towed for "poverty tows" is 50%. Tows aren't the only deterrent that exists. The system isn't functioning.

Melodie asked the Board to stop towing people who live in their vehicles.

Flo Kelly stated that any fees for towing, including citations, that are slapped on people with low incomes, adds to the instability of their lives. All fees should be waived. She appreciated Director Torres's comment about whether the cost to administer fare evasion is worth it.

Herbert Weiner wondered if bicycles and scooters on the sidewalk were being cited. Every time he sees a tow truck, he thinks of a noose.

Anne Stuhldreher discussed low income discounts for towing. She expressed support for a reduced towing fee for people who are experiencing homelessness. She shared some examples of how fees impact people. It's difficult for people to come up with \$100 to pay a fine. She asked the SFMTA to make it easy for people to access programs.

Christa Brown asked for a more comprehensive plan to address fare evasion. She's been hearing about the impact of fare evasion tickets on people who live in poverty. Some can't afford the monthly rate of

\$40 as it's one-third of their entire income. She asked the SFMTA to ensure that everyone has access to public transportation.

Kate Richardson discussed the tow fee reduction program. The process is a problem. Reduced fees are great but the Board should consider the elimination of fines for poverty-related tows. Many people aren't able to access the programs designed to help them.

Chelsea Crumpler stated that this is a step forward. Fare evasion or towing citations aren't a deterrent because there isn't a choice to people who can't get to work. There's an ongoing problem with access to resources. There needs to be less red tape and bureaucracy. Think of a way to combine public transit with the free lunch program at schools.

Kelley Cutler stated that towing is a major issue. A vehicle is someone's home and it's a huge hit when the vehicle is towed. Eliminating those fees is a great direction but \$100 is still a huge obstacle. There are 1,000 people on the shelter waitlist. The City is currently targeting people who live in their vehicles which leads to people losing their home.

Armando Garcia stated that he hears from people who need help with towing issues or tow evasion citations. He's encouraged that the SFMTA is looking into this and eliminating some of the pressures of people who live in poverty. Many people are confused about how to resolve a ticket. There's a runaround that isn't helping people.

Miquesha Willis said that she has lost her cars due to towing or booting. She can't afford the tickets and has been in a downward spiral. Towing doesn't help people who are homeless. Let us keep our property. There are many ways to help people.

Paul Briley said there's not community interest for expanding meter hours. There should be a payment plan to help people with low incomes. Fees and tows push people further into poverty.

Ben Linshinger said that it's a disaster to be targeted when living in a vehicle. He agrees with the idea of making Muni free and making other programs more accessible. Any effort towards financial justice is worth doing.

June Whitehorse stated that there are barriers to getting a low-income certification. Raising fees isn't a deterrent to people who make a lot of money. There aren't enough safe parking spots in San Francisco. The SFMTA should focus on finding places to park rather than on increasing fees. There's a lot of discussion nationally about free transit. The SFMTA should look into that.

Brian Edwards echoed previous concerns. The financial justice program is ameliorating some issues but it's ridiculously expensive to go that route. Many people who have their car towed will never know about the programs that are available to people with low incomes. There should be no charge and no additional bureaucracy.

ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.



Roberta Boomer
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call (415) 554-5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call (415) 554-5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the web site: sfgov.org/ethics.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than Monday, the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.