

**THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO. : 10.3**

**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY**

**DIVISION:** Finance and Information Technology

**BRIEF DESCRIPTION:**

Approving a revised inter-agency transfer discount fare between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA), which operates the Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services, and provide for the transfer discount fare to Clipper® card customers only.

**SUMMARY:**

- Pursuant to Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) Resolution No. 3866, the MTC is mandated by Section 66516 of the California Government Code to promote the coordination of fares between transit agencies within its jurisdiction.
- The SFMTA is committed to updating and equalizing all existing inter-agency transfer agreements for customers transferring to the Municipal Railway from other Bay Area transit agencies, and introducing reciprocal transfer discounts for Muni customers transferring to other transit agencies.
- WETA and the SFMTA desire to increase the transfer of customers between systems, thereby improving the quality of transit service and encouraging transit use.
- In 2000, the SFMTA entered into a formal transfer agreement with the City of Alameda, the former operator of the ferry services, intended to facilitate the transfer of customers and encourage transit use which included a free two-part roundtrip ticket for transferring to Muni service (\$4.00 value) for Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers.
- The SFMTA and WETA are proposing to modify the current transfer arrangement by reducing the amount of the transfer discount to \$1.00 per round trip with each agency providing a \$0.50 discount off their respective adult cash fare, and making this transfer discount available only to Clipper® card customers.

**ENCLOSURES:**

1. SFMTAB Resolution
2. Title VI Analysis

**APPROVALS:**

**DATE**

DIRECTOR \_\_\_\_\_ 08/13/12

SECRETARY \_\_\_\_\_ 08/13/12

**ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE:** August 21, 2012

## **PAGE 2.**

### **PURPOSE**

Approving a revised inter-agency transfer discount fare between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA), which operates the Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services, and provide for the transfer discount fare to Clipper<sup>®</sup> card customers only.

### **GOAL**

Approval of this fare policy modification would support the following Strategic Plan goals:

- Goal 2: Make transit, walking, bicycling, taxi, ridesharing, and carsharing the preferred means of travel.  
Objective 2.2: Improve transit performance  
Objective 2.3: Increase use of all non-private auto modes
- Goal 3: Improve the environment and quality of life in San Francisco  
Objective 3.5: Reduce capital and operating structural deficits

### **DESCRIPTION**

#### **Background**

The SFMTA, in coordination with WETA, currently provides a free round-trip transfer ticket valued at \$4.00 for adult full-fare customers transferring from the Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay Ferry services to the Municipal Railway. Alameda/Oakland ferry customers who purchase a 10, 20, or 40 ride ticket book receive the transfer ticket as an attachment to the ticket book. Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers obtain the transfer ticket onboard the vessel during the weekday morning and evening commute times, from 6 a.m. to 8:30 a.m. and 4 pm to 7 pm. The transfer ticket is time-stamped and is valid for the first ride within 2 hours of the timestamp, and the second ride within 24 hours of the timestamp. The SFMTA absorbs fifty-percent of the total value of the transfer discount and is reimbursed by WETA the remainder of this discount (currently \$2.00 per round-trip ticket). It is estimated that there are approximately 100 customers between the two ferry services that utilize this transfer benefit per day.

The SFMTA and WETA are proposing to do the following:

- Eliminate the free round-trip Muni transfer and create a transfer discount of \$0.50 off each agency's respective adult full fare for a total discount of \$1.00 per round-trip.
- Provide for transfer availability to Clipper<sup>®</sup> card customers only and eliminate the paper transfer tickets.
- Eliminate the need for reconciliation or payments between agencies, since the transfer discount will be electronically deducted from the transit fare by the transit system operator the customer is transferring to.

**Rationale for Proposed Change**

It is the goal of the SFMTA to update all existing agreements and create an equitable and consistent transfer discount policy for all customers who link with Muni, reduce the financial impact to the SFMTA associated with these discounts, and promote the use of Clipper® cards by requiring that these discounts be offered only to Clipper® card customers. Furthermore, this policy change is consistent with the existing transfer discount agreements for Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART), and Golden Gate Transit and Ferry customers. The net impact will be to decrease the benefit from \$4.00 per transfer (free round-trip) for Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers to \$1.00 per round-trip for either ferry or Muni customers.

Transitioning this discount to the Clipper® system will eliminate the accounting, reconciliation, invoicing and payment steps required between SFMTA and WETA. It will also create a streamlined customer experience by making these transfers automatically available on the Clipper® system and allowing customers to pay each fare with a single fare payment card. Finally, it will generate a benefit for Muni customers who transfer to ferry service, whereas the current transfer arrangement primarily benefits ferry customers who transfer to Muni service.

**Legislative Authority for Proposed Change**

Pursuant to Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) Resolution No. 3866, MTC is mandated by Section 66516 of the California Government Code to promote the coordination of fares between transit agencies within its jurisdiction, and updating and equalizing SFMTA's inter-transit agency transfer policies serves to support this mandate.

Additionally, per MTC Resolution No. 4060, which outlines the results of MTC's Transit Sustainability Project, the region's transit agencies are recommended to: "Continue to work towards a more consistent regional standard for fare discount policies and minimize transfer penalties so that customers can choose the most optimal route for their transit trip." Enhancing the transfer discount available to Muni customers utilizing ferry services and transitioning the transfer discount to Clipper® card customers both serve to address this recommendation.

**Published Notice**

Charter Section 16.112 requires published notice and hearing before the SFMTA may institute or change any fare, fee, schedule of rates or charges which affect the public. Section 10 of the Board's Rules of Order require that the advertisement run for at least five days and not less than fifteen days prior to the public hearing. In compliance with this requirement, an advertisement ran in the San Francisco Chronicle for a five-day period beginning on July 30, 2012 for the August 21, 2012 hearing.

**Environmental Clearance**

Modifications to fees, fares, rates and charges are subject to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). CEQA provides a statutory exemption from environmental review for the establishment, modification, structuring, restructuring or approval of rates, tolls, and other charges pursuant to California Public Resources Code section 21080(b)(8) and CEQA implementing guidelines, Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations section 15273 if these rates, tolls, and other charges will be

**PAGE 4.**

used to meet operating expenses, including employee wage rates and fringe benefits, or purchase or lease supplies, equipment, or materials.

Under the authority granted by the Planning Department, SFMTA staff has determined that the proposed change to the transfer discount fare discussed in this calendar item is statutorily exempt from environmental review under the above cited provisions.

**Impact of Proposed Change on Individuals Protected by Title VI**

Pursuant to the requirements contained in the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Circular 4702.1A, "Title VI and Title VI-Dependent Guidelines for FTA Recipients," Chapter V part 4, the SFMTA has conducted an evaluation of the proposed change to the transfer discount as described in this document and does not foresee discriminatory impacts resulting from the proposed change. Data from a recent survey of WETA's ridership shows that the majority of the users of the current transfer are not protected by Title VI, which indicates that Title VI-protected communities will not be disproportionately impacted by the proposed change. A copy of the Title VI analysis is attached as Exhibit A.

**ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED**

The SFMTA evaluated all existing inter-agency agreements and determined that continuing the current free roundtrip transfer discount to Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers creates inequity in SFMTA's fare policy for transfer customers and that reducing this discount to be consistent with other connecting agencies was the preferred alternative.

**FUNDING IMPACT**

It is estimated that the current subsidy that SFMTA provides to Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay customers at \$2.00 per round trip equals approximately \$50,000 a year. The proposed transfer discount at \$0.50 per single-ride would reduce this subsidy by approximately \$40,000 a year.

**OTHER APPROVALS RECEIVED OR STILL REQUIRED**

WETA is projected to consider implementing the reciprocal fare discount on the ferry services in September, 2012.

The City Attorney has reviewed this calendar item.

**RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors approve a revised inter-agency transfer discount fare between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA), which operates the Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services, and provide for the transfer discount to Clipper<sup>®</sup> card customers only.

SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. \_\_\_\_\_

WHEREAS, The SFMTA is committed to creating a uniform and consistent policy for all inter-agency transfer discount fares for customers transferring between the Municipal Railway and other Bay Area transit agencies; and,

WHEREAS, The existing agreement between the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA), which operates the Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services, and the SFMTA provides a free round-trip transfer for these ferry customers; and

WHEREAS, Under the existing agreement, no discount is available to Muni customers transferring to Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services from the Municipal Railway; and

WHEREAS, The SFMTA and WETA support the implementation of a new transfer discount agreement that is equitable for all modes and would be implemented through customers who use Clipper cards; and,

WHEREAS, The proposed agreement would establish a \$0.50 discount provided by the SFMTA to both Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers transferring to Muni and a \$0.50 reciprocal discount for Muni customers transferring to Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services; and,

WHEREAS, Pursuant to Section 10 of the SFMTA Rules of Order and Charter Section 16.112, a duly noticed public hearing was conducted on August 21, 2012; and,

WHEREAS, The SFMTA, under the authority granted by the Planning Department, has determined that the proposed change to the transfer discount fare between the SFMTA and the WETA is statutorily exempt from environmental review under California Public Resources Code section 21080(b)(8) and CEQA implementing guidelines, Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations section 15273 because the increases will be used to meet operating expenses including employee wage rates and fringe benefits, purchase or lease supplies, equipment, or materials, meet financial reserve needs and requirements, and obtain funds for capital projects necessary to maintain service within existing service areas; and,

WHEREAS, Said CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors and is incorporated herein by this reference; and,

WHEREAS, The proposed agreement would also promote the transition to Clipper<sup>®</sup> by eliminating paper transfer tickets and offering the transfer discount fare only to Clipper<sup>®</sup> card customers; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors approves a revised inter-agency transfer discount fare between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA), which operates the Alameda/Oakland and Alameda Harbor Bay ferry services, and provide for the transfer discount fare to Clipper<sup>®</sup> card customers only.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of August 21, 2012.

---

Secretary to the Board of Directors  
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

## EXHIBIT A

### **Title VI Fare Equity Analysis:**

#### **WETA Inter-Agency Discount Fare Change**

##### **Background**

Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color or national origin in programs and activities receiving Federal financial assistance. Specifically, Title VI provides that "no person in the United States shall, on the grounds of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance." (42 U.S.C. Section 2000d)

The analysis below responds to the reporting requirements contained in the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Circular 4702.1A, "Title VI and Title VI-Dependent Guidelines," which provides guidance to transit agencies serving large urbanized areas and requires that these agencies "shall evaluate significant system-wide service and fare changes and proposed improvements at the planning and programming stages to determine whether these changes have a discriminatory impact" and to assess these impacts, if any, on minority and low-income populations. (Circular 4702.1A, Chapter V part 4)

The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), a department of the City and County of San Francisco, was established by voter proposition in 1999. One of the SFMTA's primary responsibilities is running the San Francisco Municipal Railway, known universally as "Muni." Muni is the largest transit system in the Bay Area and the seventh largest in the nation by ridership, with approximately 700,000 passenger boardings per day and serving more than 200 million customers a year. The Muni fleet includes: historic streetcars, biodiesel and electric hybrid buses and electric trolley coaches, light rail vehicles, paratransit cabs and vans and the world-famous cable cars. Muni provides one of the highest levels of service per capita with 63 bus routes, seven light rail lines, the historic streetcar F Line and three cable car lines and provides seamless connections to other Bay Area public transit systems such as BART, AC Transit, Golden Gate Transit and Ferries, SamTrans, Caltrain and the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority.

As part of a regional effort mandated by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC), the SFMTA and several other transit properties in the Bay Area, including BART, Golden Gate Transit and AC Transit, changed their forms of fare media from paper and magnetic fare media to a smart card system known as "Clipper." The Clipper program is a regional program to create a smart card-based fare collection system

common to all transit systems serving the Bay Area. As the regional transportation and coordination agency for the Bay Area, MTC, created by the California State Legislature in 1970, is managing the implementation of the Clipper program.

Included in this Title VI analysis is a description of the proposed fare changes and an analysis of any potential impacts on minority and/or low-income communities.

## **I. Description of Proposed Fare Changes**

The SFMTA, in coordination with the Water Emergency Transit Authority (WETA), currently provides a free round-trip transfer ticket valued at \$4.00 for adult full-fare passengers transferring from the Oakland/Alameda and Oakland/Harbor Bay Ferry services to Muni. Alameda/Oakland ferry customers who purchase a 10, 20, or 40 ride ticket book receive the transfer ticket as an attachment to the ticket book. Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers obtain the transfer ticket onboard the vessel during the weekday morning and evening commute times, from 6 a.m. to 8:30 a.m. and 4 pm to 7 pm. The transfer ticket is time-stamped and is valid for the first ride within 2 hours of the timestamp, and the second ride within 24 hours of the timestamp. The SFMTA absorbs 50% of the total value of the transfer discount and is reimbursed by WETA for the remainder of this discount - \$2.00 per round-trip ticket. It is estimated that there are approximately 100 customers between the two ferry services that utilize this transfer per day.

The SFMTA and WETA are proposing the following:

- Eliminate the free round-trip transfer and create a transfer discount of \$0.50 off each way for a total of \$1.00 per round-trip.
- Provide for transfer availability on Clipper® only and eliminate the paper transfer tickets.
- The transfer discount will be electronically deducted from the cash fare of the operator the customer is transferring to, eliminating the need for reconciliation or payments between agencies.

This change is intended to create a consistent fare policy for customers transferring from other regional service to Muni and is consistent with the existing transfer discount agreements between the SFMTA and the Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) and the SFMTA and Golden Gate Transit and Ferry customers. The net impact will be to decrease the overall benefit from \$4.00 per transfer (free round-trip) to \$1.00 per round-trip.

The elimination of the paper transfer ticket and transitioning the discount to the Clipper® system will eliminate the accounting, reconciliation, invoicing and payment required



between the two agencies. It will also create a streamlined customer experience by making these transfers automatically available on the Clipper® system and allowing customers to pay each fare with a single fare payment card. Finally, it will generate a benefit for Muni customers who transfer to ferry service, whereas the current transfer arrangement primarily benefits ferry customers who transfer to Muni service.

The tentative start date for this revised transfer arrangement is October 1, 2012, pending necessary board approvals.

## II. Effects of the Proposed Fare Changes on Minority and/or Low-Income Communities

Based on FTA C 4702.1A, for proposed changes that would increase or decrease fares on certain transit modes or by fare payment type or payment media, the SFMTA should analyze any available information generated from ridership surveys, indicating whether minority and low-income customers are more likely to use the mode of service, payment type or payment media that would be subject to the fare change.

WETA conducted an on-board passenger survey in August 2011 for Oakland/Alameda, Oakland/Harbor Bay and Vallejo Ferry customers. The passenger survey was conducted over several days with a 10% sample size of customers on the ferry. Of the 1,160 survey respondents, 77 indicated that they either 1) use Muni as an access mode to the Downtown Ferry Terminal, or 2) use Muni as an egress mode from the Downtown Ferry Terminal.

Below is a summary of responses from these respondents:

	Responses	Percent
<b>Do you speak a language other than English:</b>		
Yes	20	26%
No	52	68%
No Response	5	6%
<b>How well do you speak English:</b>		
Very Well	67	87%
Well	7	9%
Not Well	0	0%
Not at All	0	0%
No Response	3	4%
<b>Are you of Hispanic, Spanish, or Latin Origin</b>		
Yes	6	8%
No	63	82%

	Responses	Percent
No Response	8	10%
<b>What is your race or ethnic identification (select one or more):<sup>1</sup></b>		
White	44	57%
Black/African American	5	6%
American Indian/Alaska Native	0	0%
Asian Indian	1	1%
Chinese	9	12%
Filipino	5	6%
Japanese	0	0%
Korean	1	1%
Vietnamese	0	0%
Other Asian	1	1%
Pacific Islander	0	0%
<b>What is your annual household income before taxes:</b>		
Under \$15,000	3	4%
\$15,000-24,999	1	1%
\$25,000-49,999	5	6%
\$50,000-74,999	9	12%
\$75,000-99,999	10	13%
\$100,000-149,999	16	21%
\$150,000-199,999	11	14%
\$200,000+	10	13%
No Response	12	16%

For the purposes of this analysis, as defined by FTA C 4702.1A, “low-income” means a person whose median household income is at or below the Department of Health and Human Services’ 2012 poverty guidelines.

**2012 Poverty Guidelines for the  
48 Contiguous States and the District of Columbia**

<b>Persons in family/household</b>	<b>Poverty guideline</b>
<b>1</b>	\$11,170
<b>2</b>	15,130

<sup>1</sup> The responses to this question do not correspond to 100% because the question allowed for multiple responses.

<b>Persons in family/household</b>	<b>Poverty guideline</b>
<b>3</b>	19,090
<b>4</b>	23,050
<b>5</b>	27,010
<b>6</b>	30,970
<b>7</b>	34,930
<b>8</b>	38,890
For families/households with more than 8 persons, add \$3,960 for each additional person.	

In summary, the findings indicate that the majority of customers most likely utilizing the existing transfer discount between the WETA ferry services are non-minority (57%), speak English very well (96%) and have incomes well above the federal poverty guideline.

According to the 2010 U.S. Census, 33.9% of Alameda County residents, 25.9% of Oakland residents and 50.8% of the City of Alameda residents are non-Hispanic whites. This is lower than the 57% of ferry customers who responded to the survey question about race/ethnicity and identified themselves as white.

Only approximately 5% of WETA customers earned \$25,000 or less, which would be considered poverty for a household with 4 people. (The survey did not correlate income with household size, so this does not necessarily indicate the actual number of ferry users in poverty.)

Based on the 65 ferry survey participants who answered the question about income, the median household income of ferry customers was between \$100,000 and \$150,000. This was significantly higher than the 2010 median household income of \$69,384 for Alameda County, \$74,221 for the City of Alameda, or \$49,721 for the City of Oakland, as reported by the U.S. Census Bureau.

This data suggest that the WETA ferry customers are disproportionately non-minority and higher-income than the typical resident of the system's residential catchment area. Because there is a relatively small number of minority and low-income riders (both in terms of the overall ferry customer base and in relation to the population as a whole), the proposed fare changes are unlikely to have a disproportionate impact on minorities and low-income customers.

### **III. Transit/Fare Alternatives for Impacted Customers**

Customers also have the option of taking other forms of public transportation. The Oakland/Alameda and Harbor Bay Ferries operated by WETA serve three East Bay

locations: the Oakland Ferry Terminal located at Jack London Square, the Alameda Ferry Terminal located in West Alameda and the Harbor Bay Ferry Terminal located in Bay Farm Island in Alameda. AC Transit and BART provide East Bay connections with San Francisco. In many cases, switching to AC Transit and/or BART may actually eliminate the need to transfer to Muni. The AC Transit stop at the Temporary Transbay Terminal (Howard and Beale Streets) is within walking distance of Financial District and South of Market employment. BART shares four stations along Market Street (Embarcadero, Montgomery, Powell and Civic Center).

The following table shows alternative transit options for customers traveling to San Francisco from each of the three East Bay ferry terminals:

East Bay Ferry Terminal	Ferry One-Way Fare	Ferry Monthly Fare	Alternative Transit Option*	Alternative One-Way Fare	Alternative Monthly Fare
Oakland (Jack London Square)	\$6.25	\$170.00 (based on 20 round trips)	BART 12 <sup>th</sup> Street Station	\$3.15	\$126.00 (based on 20 round trips)
Alameda (Main St, West Alameda)	\$6.25	\$170.00 (based on 20 round trips)	AC Transit O, OX or W*	\$4.20	\$151.20
Harbor Bay (Mecartney Rd., Bay Farm Island)	\$6.50	\$185,00	AC Transit OX	\$4.20	\$151.20

\* With three stops in Oakland and Alameda, WETA ferries are highly dependent upon other access modes because the ferry terminals are located away from major residential areas. BART stations and AC Transit stops may actually be located closer to where East Bay commuters travelling to San Francisco live. Broadly speaking, the alternative transit options listed in the table serve similar catchment areas as the ferries.

#### IV. Disparate Impacts/Mitigation Measures

As part of a fare equity analysis, the SFMTA must describe the actions it proposes to minimize, mitigate or offset any adverse effects of a proposed fare change on minority and low-income populations. A disproportionately high and adverse effect is one that (1) is predominately borne by a minority population and/or a low-income population, or (2) will be suffered by the minority population and/or low-income population and is appreciably more severe or greater in magnitude than the adverse effect that will be suffered by the non-minority population and/or non-low-income population. In making determinations regarding disproportionately high and adverse effects on minority and low-income populations, mitigation and enhancements measures that will be taken and

all offsetting benefits to the affected minority and low-income populations can be taken into account.

By its very nature, a fare increase will have a greater impact on low-income customers, because the increase represents a larger portion of their fixed income than higher-income customers. Based on the customer survey that was conducted above, the proposed fare change does not appear to have a foreseeable disparate impact on low-income and minority populations as primary usage of the current discounted transfer is by non-low-income, non-minority customers.

In general, the SFMTA makes a substantial effort to minimize the negative impact of any fare changes to minority/low-income communities, even in cases where no foreseeable disparate impact can be demonstrated. The SFMTA will continue to offer its Lifeline Pass at a 50% discount relative to the Muni-Only pass to qualified San Francisco residents. The Lifeline Pass, priced at \$32.00 as of July 1, 2012, was created by the SFMTA in 2005 in conjunction with the San Francisco Human Services Agency in order to minimize the impact of fare increases being implemented at that time. Eligibility for the Lifeline Fast Pass is based on three criteria: (1) enrollment in the Working Families Tax Credit, the local version of the Earned Income Tax Credit; (2) enrollment in another income support program administered by the Human Services Agency (e.g., food stamps, County Adult Assistance Program, or CalWORKS); or (3) income at or below 200 percent of the federal poverty level, which is a pre-tax income of approximately \$46,100 for a family of four people. Lifeline Passes are restricted to San Francisco residents. Because WETA ferries primarily serve residents outside of San Francisco who commute into the city for employment, the SFMTA does not anticipate that customers impacted by changes to the WETA/SFMTA transfer will switch to the Lifeline Pass.

However, some eligible customers may be able to take advantage of other fare discounts. The SFMTA also offers the Single Ride-Senior/Youth/Disabled fare, which is available to senior (aged 65 or older), disabled (with valid monthly sticker and disabled identification card), youth (aged five to 17) and Medicaid-eligible customers. For minority/low-income patrons who fall into those groups, this category is priced significantly under the amount allowable by the FTA, which requires that “elderly persons and persons with disabilities, or an individual presenting a Medicare card will be charged, during non-peak hours for transportation using or involving a facility or equipment of a project financed under Section 5307, not more than 50 percent of the peak hour fare.” (49 U.S. Code Chapter 53) The existing Single Ride Discount Fare is \$0.75, which is a 62.5 percent discount off the existing Single Ride-Adult Fare of \$2.00. Moreover, the SFMTA’s Single Ride-Senior/Youth/ Disabled cash fare is valid all day, exceeding the FTA requirement that discounted fares be valid only during non-peak periods.

In addition, as discussed in Section III above, customers have the option of taking other

forms of public transportation (BART and AC Transit) that are less expensive than taking the ferry alone or in combination with Muni. In some cases, these alternatives may actually more conveniently serve both the origin and destination end and eliminate the need to transfer to Muni.

### **Clipper Card Usage**

As part of the proposed change, the reduced discount of \$.50 each way on Muni for customers transferring from the ferry will be available only through a Clipper Card. This could result in a potential impact to those low-income Alameda Harbor Bay ferry customers who otherwise pay with cash (Alameda/Oakland customers are only able to access the transfer by purchasing a ticket ride book) when the Metropolitan Transportation Commission selects to reinstate a one-time three dollar fee to obtain a Clipper® card on September 1, 2012. The SFMTA has committed to mitigating this impact by making cards available to low-income customers at their sales locations at 11 South Van Ness Avenue and Geary and Presidio Avenues. In addition, an extensive public outreach campaign has been conducted since June 2010 to distribute as many free Clipper cards as possible. MTC, SFMTA and other regional agencies have participated in these campaigns and as a result, over one million free cards have been distributed.

## **V. Public Comment and Outreach**

Pursuant to Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and its implementing regulations, as well as state and local laws, the SFMTA takes responsible steps to ensure meaningful access to the benefits, services, information, and other important portions of SFMTA's programs and activities for low-income, minority, and Limited-English Proficient individuals and regardless of race, color or national origin. Given the diversity of San Francisco and of Muni's ridership, the SFMTA is strongly committed to disseminating information on both fare and service changes that is accessible to Limited English Proficient (LEP) persons. The SFMTA will post a notice of public hearing for this fare change in the City's official public newspaper 21 days prior to the public hearing. The hearing is scheduled to take place on August 21, 2012.

In addition, customers obtaining the paper transfer will be provided with a multilingual handout that outlines the proposed changes and contains details on the public hearing. Multilingual signs will also be posted at the sales location where tickets are currently obtained. Details will be included on how to submit feedback via letter, e-mail or phone. Multilingual signage will also be posted at the ferry terminals with the pertinent information.

---