

THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO. : 13

**SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY**

DIVISION: Transit Services

BRIEF DESCRIPTION:

Adopting the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2017 and 2018.

SUMMARY:

- In 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted the Muni Service Equity Policy requiring the submission of a biennial Service Equity Strategy to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods and develop strategies to address those major challenges before the SFMTA's two-year budget request. The policy also directs staff to establish a performance baseline and conduct annual monitoring to track progress.
- In collaboration with community advocates, SFMTA staff identified seven Service Equity Strategy neighborhoods based on a number of demographic factors, including: concentration of households with low-income; concentration of people of color; household density; and vehicle ownership. In addition, SFMTA staff identified and evaluated routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities based on feedback from community advocates.
- Transit performance for identified routes was evaluated for on-time performance, service gaps, crowding, transit travel time competitiveness (relative to driving) and accessibility-related customer complaints.
- Key needs and strategies were identified based on an analysis of key performance metrics for each neighborhood and for routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities.

ENCLOSURES:

1. SFMTAB Resolution
2. Muni Service Equity Policy
3. Equity Strategy Report

APPROVALS:

DATE

DIRECTOR _____

3/29/16

SECRETARY R. Boomer _____

3/29/16

ASSIGNED SFMTAB CALENDAR DATE: April 5, 2016

PURPOSE

Adopting the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2016-17 and 2017-18.

GOAL

This item will meet the following goal and objectives of the SFMTA Strategic Plan:

Goal 2: Make transit, walking, bicycling, taxi, ridesharing and carsharing the preferred means of travel

Objective 2.1: Improve customer service and communications

Objective 2.3: Increase use of all non-private auto modes

DESCRIPTION

In 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted the Muni Service Equity Policy requiring the submission of a biennial Service Equity Strategy to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods, and develop strategies to address the identified major challenges before the SFMTA's two-year budget request. The policy also directs staff to establish a performance baseline and conduct annual monitoring to track progress. The policy requires staff to present this Service Equity Strategy prior to adoption of the SFMTA's two-year budget and calls out specific metrics, such as on-time performance, which the Service Equity Strategy should evaluate.

Neighborhood Selection

The Service Equity Policy directs SFMTA staff to identify "Service Equity Strategy" neighborhoods based on the percentage of low income households, private vehicle availability, race/ethnicity demographics, and disability status, and to establish a performance baseline. In collaboration with the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group, whose members represent advocacy and community-based organizations, SFMTA staff identified seven equity strategy neighborhoods: Chinatown, Tenderloin/SoMa, Western Addition, Mission, Bayview, Visitacion Valley, and Excelsior/Outer Mission.

In addition, while the policy does not require consideration of routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities, SFMTA staff chose to include accessibility for seniors and people with disabilities based on feedback from community advocates that participated in the Service Equity Strategy working group.

Data Analysis

The data analysis considered transit performance across all different time periods, including peak commute hours as well as early morning and late evening hours. Based on the results of the data

analysis, different key needs were identified for each neighborhood. For example, for some neighborhoods, improving travel time on one or more lines was identified as one the most important need(s), while for other neighborhoods improving reliability or addressing crowding appeared to be more pressing. The following metrics were analyzed:

- On-Time Performance
- Service Gaps
- Crowding
- Transit Travel Time Competitiveness (relative to driving)
- Accessibility-Related Customer Complaints

Key Needs and Recommended Strategies

SFMTA staff identified two to three key needs for each neighborhood and for routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities based on where data revealed underperformance relative to peer lines. SFMTA staff were not looking to develop strategies that could address every single challenge for transit performance in the neighborhoods, but rather focus on a few actionable strategies that could be implemented quickly and are expected to make a significant difference in the reliability and quality of service.

In many cases, some identified needs were already addressed through work the SFMTA had underway, particularly through Muni Forward implementation. These strategies were documented through this process and proved to affirm the Muni Forward investment framework when analyzed from a neighborhood-based lens. In other cases, our data analysis was able to uncover needs and responsive strategies that were not captured through Muni Forward investments, indicating the complementary way these two efforts have identified transit service improvements. Below are the key needs and new strategies for each neighborhood. More detail on each strategy, as well as work underway, is provided in the Service Equity Strategy Report, included as an enclosure.

Key Needs and New Strategies for the Bayview

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
Improve service reliability on the K-T line from Downtown towards the Bayview	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Redesign weekday rail schedule, with running time adjustments ▪ Address train congestion at West Portal through train signal and traffic management investments ▪ Redesign the train interlock at 4th and King
Address schedule delays that are impacting reliability on the 23 Monterey towards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Run the 23 on Industrial and Palou instead of deviating to Produce Market; reinvest travel time to improve on-time performance

Bayview	
Improve service reliability and reduce crowding on the 29 Sunset	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increase peak period service in FY17 on the 29 Sunset

Key Needs and New Strategies for Chinatown

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
Reduce crowding on Routes 1, 30, and 45	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Assign 60ft buses to 30 Stockton long line between Marina and Caltrain
Improve service reliability on the 8 Bayshore	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Begin increased use of non-freeway route in AM Peak after Potrero Ave. construction is completed ▪ Develop capital project to improve transit and walking conditions on Kearny Street ▪ Create transit/pedestrian street on lower Stockton Street ▪ In the longer-term, the SFMTA is partnering with MTC, Caltrans and SFCTA to identify potential strategies to manage freeway traffic, such as HOV and/or transit-only lanes.

Key Needs and New Strategies for the Excelsior-Outer Mission

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
Improve service reliability in the outbound direction for the 14 Mission, 14X, and 49 Van Ness-Mission	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pending the effectiveness of improvements underway and completed, no additional recommendations ▪ In the longer-term, the SFMTA is partnering with MTC, Caltrans and SFCTA to identify potential strategies to manage freeway traffic, such as HOV and/or transit-only lanes (14X).
Improve service reliability and reduce crowding on the 29 Sunset	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Increase peak period service in FY17 on the 29 Sunset

Key Needs and New Strategies for the Inner Mission

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
Improve reliability of 9/9R San Bruno	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pending the effectiveness of improvements underway and completed, no additional recommendations
Improve reliability for 27 Bryant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Implement travel time and reliability toolkit north of Market Street where 27 Bryant travel time is slowest
Improve reliability for 12 Folsom Pacific	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Implement Rincon Hill Recommendations to reroute the 12 Folsom ▪ Explore a more direct route to 24th Street BART Station

Key Needs and New Strategies for the Tenderloin/South of Market (SoMa)

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
Improve service reliability on the 19 Polk, 27 Bryant, 31 Balboa, and 47 Van Ness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Adjust schedule for the 19 Polk (to address congestion variability through Tenderloin) ▪ Shorten 19 Polk at SFGH proposed to reduce crowding and improve on-time performance, part of proposed 19/48 reroute (public outreach is planned for Winter 2016) ▪ Add bus bulbs on 31 Balboa in Tenderloin as part of DPW curb ramp project ▪ Rebuild 47 schedule and run on Townsend instead of Harrison and Bryant ▪ Implement travel time and reliability toolkit north of Market Street where 27 Bryant travel time is slowest
Reduce crowding on 38R Geary Rapid in the PM peak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Reinvest travel time savings from Phase 1 of Geary BRT into increased peak period service

Key Needs and New Strategies for Visitation Valley

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
<p>Improve reliability on the 8 Bayshore routes, and reduce crowding on 8AX inbound</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Begin increased use of non-freeway route in AM Peak after Potrero Ave. construction is completed ▪ Develop capital project to improve transit and walking conditions on Kearny Street ▪ Create transit/pedestrian street on lower Stockton Street
<p>Improve service reliability on 9/9R San Bruno Rapid</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pending the effectiveness of improvements underway and completed, no additional recommendations

Key Needs and New Strategies for the Western Addition

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
<p>Improve service reliability on the 7R Haight-Noriega and 5 Fulton local in PM peak period</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All day rapid service and service increases recommended for 7R Haight-Noriega in 2017 ▪ Gap management for 7R Outbound ▪ Implement 5 Fulton Muni Forward Project on McAllister, Central, Fulton
<p>Faster transit times to key destinations, such as SFGH and City College</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Add transit signal priority on Fillmore Street

Key Needs and New Strategies for Routes that are Heavily Used by Seniors and People with Disabilities

Key Need	FY17 and FY18 Strategies
Improve reliability of 31 Balboa Outbound	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Add bus bulbs on 31 Balboa in Tenderloin as part of DPW curb ramp project
Improve service reliability on 9/9R San Bruno Rapid	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pending the effectiveness of improvements underway and completed, no additional recommendations
Improve reliability and increase capacity on 14 and 14R to address pass-ups and lack of priority seating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pending the effectiveness of improvements underway and completed, no additional recommendations
Improve reliability and capacity on 38 and 38R to address pass-ups and lack of priority seating	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Reinvest travel time savings from Phase 1 of Geary BRT into increased peak period service

TITLE IV ANALYSIS

Federal Transit Administration’s (FTA) Circular 4702.1B, "Title VI and Title VI-Dependent Guidelines" provides guidance to transit agencies serving large urbanized areas and requires that these agencies "shall evaluate significant system-wide service changes and proposed improvements at the planning and programming stages to determine whether these changes have a discriminatory impact.” (Circular 4702.1B, Chapter IV-10) The FTA requires that transit providers evaluate the effects of service changes that qualify as major service changes under the SFMTA’s approved definition on low-income populations in addition to Title VI-protected categories (race, color and national origin). In addition, upon completion of the service equity analysis, SFMTA is required to submit the equity analysis to the SFMTA Board of Directors for its consideration, awareness and approval of the analysis and provide a copy of the board resolution to the FTA as documentation.

Approval of the Service Equity Strategy Report does not require a Title VI Service Equity Analysis at this time. However, some individual service and route changes that are discussed in this Report may require a Title VI analysis prior to SFMTA Board approval to implement the proposed service or route change. For these service or route changes, following additional outreach, SFMTA staff will conduct any required Title VI analysis and submit a Title VI report for approval by the SFMTA Board.

PUBLIC OUTREACH

SFMTA formed a Service Equity Working Group that met regularly to advise on the development and implementation of the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report. Working Group members represent non-profit and community-based organizations that advocate in areas including public transportation, accessibility for seniors/people with disabilities, affordable housing, equity/social justice, and public health. Outreach during this first phase of work also included presentations to groups in the Bayview and Chinatown. We have secured a Caltrans Planning Grant to fund community-based outreach to seek further input on key needs across all Service Equity Strategy neighborhoods in the next year. This work is expected to include collaboration with several community-based organizations to conduct targeted outreach to reach transit riders in Service Equity Strategy neighborhoods to distill our data analysis on key needs in lay-person friendly messages and graphics. Through this outreach, we hope to learn where our data-based findings are confirmed by lived experiences (as well as any departures) so future Service Equity Strategy recommendations can respond accordingly.

ALTERNATIVES CONSIDERED

Because the Service Equity Strategy is a requirement, no alternatives were considered. For individual key needs, a range of alternative were considered. Moving forward, outreach will be conducted in each of the focus neighborhoods. If, during this process, alternative strategies are identified that are more cost effective and address key needs, staff will bring this information to the SFMTA Board at a future date.

FUNDING IMPACT

Table 21 of the Report identifies \$21 million in new capital expenditures. These expenditures have been integrated into the five-year Capital Improvement Program and the SFMTA's two-year capital budget for FY2017 and FY2018. Additionally Table 20 in the Report identifies \$2.6 billion in capital projects that pre-dated the Service Equity Strategy in their planning, but will provide both Citywide and focused neighborhood investments to customers from low-income households and communities of color. The largest expenditure is for Central Subway, which will benefit Chinatown most directly, as well as the Bayview and Visitación Valley. The second largest investment is the bus fleet replacement, which replaces our entire current fleet with cleaner, quieter and more reliable vehicles by 2019.

Table 21 of the Report lists the new service strategies and their associated costs. While these strategies are expected to cost \$7.5M annually, they will be offset by efficiency investments such as travel time savings from Muni Forward and the identification and elimination of unproductive routes or route segments. All service changes are cost-neutral.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) applies to “projects” that have the potential for resulting in either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment. On March 3, 2016, SFMTA staff, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the SFMTA Board’s adoption of the Muni Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2016-17 and 2017-18 is not a “project” for purposes of CEQA and, therefore, does not require environmental review pursuant to Article 5 and Article 13 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c)(2) and 15378, respectively. A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors.

The City Attorney’s Office has reviewed the item.

RECOMMENDATION

SFMTA staff recommend that the SFMTA Board adopt the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2016-17 and 2017-18.

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

RESOLUTION No. _____

WHEREAS, In 2014, the SFMTA Board of Directors adopted the Muni Service Equity Policy requiring the submission of a biennial Service Equity Strategy to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods, and develop strategies to address the identified major challenges before the SFMTA's two-year budget request; and

WHEREAS, SFMTA staff have prepared the first Service Equity Strategy Report for the FY16-17 and FY17-18 prior to adoption of the SFMTA's two-year budget; and,

WHEREAS, In collaboration with the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group, SFMTA staff identified seven equity strategy neighborhoods based on the percentage of low income households, private vehicle availability, race/ethnicity demographics, and disability status, and to establish a performance baseline; and,

WHEREAS, In addition, while the policy does not require consideration of routes heavily used by seniors and persons with disabilities, SFMTA staff chose to include accessibility for seniors and persons with disabilities based on feedback from community advocates that participated in the Muni Service Equity Strategy working group; and,

WHEREAS, The following metrics were used to analyze transit performance for across all different time periods, including peak commute hours as well as early morning and late evening hours: on-time performance, service gaps, crowding, transit travel time competitiveness (relative to driving) and accessibility-related customer complaints; and

WHEREAS, SFMTA staff identified the key needs and strategies for each of the neighborhoods and for routes heavily used by seniors and people with disabilities based on data analysis of these performance metrics; and

WHEREAS, Approval of the Service Equity Strategy Report does not require a Title VI Service Equity Analysis at this time, and

WHEREAS, Some individual service and route changes that are discussed in this Report may require a Title VI analysis prior to SFMTA Board approval to implement the proposed service or route change, and for these service or route changes, following additional outreach, SFMTA staff will conduct any required Title VI analysis and submit a Title VI report for approval by the SFMTA Board; and

WHEREAS, On March 3, 2016, the SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, determined that the Muni Service Equity Strategy is not defined as a “project” under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations Sections 15060(c) and/or 15378(b); and,

WHEREAS, A copy of the CEQA determination is on file with the Secretary to the SFMTA Board of Directors, and is incorporated herein by reference; and,

WHEREAS, To document the Equity Strategy process, findings and recommendations, SFMTA staff prepared a Service Equity Strategy Report; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors adopts the Muni Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2017 and 2018.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors at its meeting of April 5, 2016.

Secretary to the Board of Directors
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency

Muni Service Equity Policy

Pursuant to SFMTA's core value of social equity and access, the SFMTA shall adopt a Service Equity Strategy every two years on the same cycle as SFMTA's biannual budget to assess Muni service performance in select low income and minority neighborhoods, identify major Muni transit-related challenges impacting selected neighborhoods with community stakeholder outreach, and develop strategies to address the major challenges. The Service Equity Strategy will complement, but will not replace, the annual service monitoring program that SFMTA conducts as part of the SFMTA Title VI program.

SFMTA shall develop performance targets for each strategy based on peer Muni route performance and track progress compared to baseline conditions, performance targets, and year-over-year progress. Performance metrics will include:

- On-Time Performance
- Service Gaps
- Crowding (also serves as a proxy for pass-ups)
- Capacity Utilization
- Travel Times to/from key destinations such as the nearest grocery store, nearest medical facility, City College, downtown, and nearest major park
- Customer satisfaction information

Metrics will include data by time of day (including midday and late evening). Where available, data will be evaluated for conditions within the neighborhood, as well as the route as a whole.

The Service Equity Strategy shall be presented to the SFMTA Board of Directors before the two-year budget request and the two-year budget request shall include, if needed, budget allocation requests to implement the Service Equity Strategy to the extent resources are available¹. In difficult financial times, the Service Equity Strategy may not recommend increased funding levels, but will focus on more effectively using available resources. If service reductions need to be considered, the Equity Strategy will also guide how to consider the needs of low-income and minority neighborhoods. The Service Equity Strategy shall also be adopted by the SFMTA Board of Directors and presented for input to the San Francisco County Transportation Authority (SFCTA). The performance of routes and impacts of the strategies on performance included in the Service Equity Strategy shall be reported annually to the SFMTA Board of Directors and the SFCTA Board.

Beginning in spring 2014, staff will select neighborhoods based on percentage of low income households, private vehicle availability, race/ethnicity demographics, and disability status and establish a performance baseline. Subsequently, the Service Equity Strategy Policy requires the following steps as part of the Two Year Budget Cycle:

¹ In addition to equity needs, it is anticipated that other service objectives will also inform the budget development including ridership growth, overall system performance and conditions on the Rapid network.

Muni Service Equity Policy

- Re-evaluate census data to determine if demographic changes warrant additional or fewer neighborhoods be evaluated. Summer/Fall Year 1
- Analyze performance data for key transit routes in each focus neighborhood and outline the top two-to-three Muni challenges and strategies to improve service performance. Document year-over-year progress against the baseline. Summer/Fall Year 1
- Conduct outreach to community stakeholders to confirm key Muni service issues in each neighborhood and adjust as needed. This may include community groups, community based organizations, stakeholder interviews, and community meetings. Fall Year 1
- Refine key issues on community input and finalize Service Equity Strategy. Winter Year 1
- SFMTA Board of Directors reviews and approves Service Equity Strategy. Winter Year 1
- SFMTA prioritizes resources to implement strategies as needed in conjunction with two year budget cycle. Spring Year 1
- Implement Service Equity Strategy and track results compared to baseline conditions and performance targets. Summer Year 1
- Adjust strategies as needed to meet goal. Summer Year 1 – Summer Year 2
- Report back to the SFMTA Board and SFCTA Board on results Fall/Winter Year 2
- Start process again in Summer/Fall Year 2