



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

---

**MEETING MINUTES** • Meeting Date: Tuesday, November 15, 2022

## **REGULAR MEETING**

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
Room 400, City Hall

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020 emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the SFMTA Board of Directors may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or online at [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE). Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm the day before the meeting or call 415.646.4470.

## **REMOTE MEETING ACCESS**

WATCH: [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE) or  
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-november-15-2022>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 Access Code: 2498 299 4934

## **SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Gwyneth Borden, Chair  
Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair  
Stephanie Cajina  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Manny Yekutieli

## **DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION**

Jeffrey Tumlin

## **BOARD SECRETARY**

Christine Silva



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Borden called the meeting to order at 1:05pm.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Stephanie Cajina  
Fiona Hinze  
Manny Yekutieli  
Amanda Eaken  
Gwyneth Borden

Absent (with notification): Steve Heminger

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva announced that ringing and the use of cell phones and similar sound-producing electronic devices were prohibited at the meeting.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

David Pilpel suggested a correction on page 3, changing a reference from the 16<sup>th</sup> Street Improvement Project to the Valencia Corridor Project.

On motion to approve the minutes of the November 1, 2022 Regular Meeting with correction:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Hinze, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden  
ABSENT – Heminger

### 5. Communications

None.

### 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Director Eaken shared about her experience taking the 43 Masonic line to Tunnel Tops in the Presidio.



No public comment.

7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Election Update
- Central Subway Project Update
- Shared Spaces Update
- Ongoing Activities

Director Tumlin shared about Rosa Parks signage, election results, Central Subway Project opening, and an extension to the Shared Spaces application deadline.

Director's Yekutieli requested a report back on the Better Market Street Project.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Fisher expressed concern about the lack of street sweeping and accumulating debris because of Shared Spaces.

Dave Alexander commented on parking reform and was excited about parking garage changes in Golden Gate Park.

Herbert Weiner shared that the SFMTA should benefit everyone including seniors and those with disabilities.

Edward Mason expressed concern about access to the Conservatory of Flowers with the closure of JFK Drive.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

None.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Flo Kelley expressed concern for sidewalk sweeps and asked the SFMTA when sweeps would be heard at a Board meeting.



Kathy Richter expressed support to restore the 3 Jackson line.

Nancy Mullane reminded the Board of their August 2021 vote to make Lake Street a Slow Street, further reminding their Board of their previous commitment.

Roz Arbel shared about accessibility and safety and expressed support for Slow Lake Street.

Daniela Kirshenbaum shared about the difficulty to get downtown and urged the SFMTA to restore service to pre-pandemic levels.

Kevin expressed concern about transit safety and shared about being assaulted while waiting on a Muni platform.

Aaliyah expressed concern about park closures and parking access.

Herbert Weiner urged the SFMTA to restore service, including the 47 Van Ness and 3 Jackson lines.

David Pilpel thanked staff for recent work on transit shelters as well as a Nextbus system upgrade and expressed support for full transit service restoration.

Speaker asked the Board to restore the 2 Clement and 1AX/1BX California lines to get downtown and to consider reopening Lake Street.

Susan Cieutat asked when the Board would have a hearing about tows.

Barry Taranto expressed concern over taxi access in Golden Gate Park and at the Chase Center, sharing that access is very difficult.

Linda urged the SFMTA to remove barriers on Lake Street and shared that there should be better ways to get around.

Speaker expressed support for Slow Lake Street.

Robert Cesani expressed concern about taxi medallions and SFMTA's management of medallions.

Richard Parena expressed concern about safety and shared about recent experiences getting mugged and assaulted.



Jordan Smith submitted a public records request for records related to a tow he experienced.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA:

- A. Tawnya Sterling v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-20-587832 filed 11/18/2020 for \$135,000 (SFMTA to pay \$80,000). Litigation involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (revenue vehicle and automobile).
- B. Pureza Jimenez v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-20-587341 filed 10/13/2020 for \$25,000. Litigation involving alleged dangerous condition of public property (pedestrian/private vehicle).
- C. Tania Walker v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-21-596696 filed 10/30/2021 for \$15,000. Litigation involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (revenue vehicle and automobile).
- D. Jeffery Scott Crowell v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-21-596331 filed 11/16/2021 for \$5,500. Litigation involving allegations of personal injury from driver of SFMTA nonrevenue vehicle negligence (bicycle and nonrevenue vehicle).
- E. Lily Liu v. CCSF, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-21-590244 filed 3/10/2021 for \$1,000. Litigation involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (operator/passenger). (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 221115-107



- 10.2. Establishing the 2023 SFMTA Board of Directors/Parking Authority Commission and Policy and Governance Committee meeting schedule. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 221115-108

- 10.3. Amending Transportation Code, Division II, Sections 101, 201, and 202 to provide that the requirement for the City Traffic Engineer to hold a public hearing may be met by either an in-person or teleconference hearing, or a period of virtual public outreach of at least 10 days and accepting public comment by mail, telephone, and online platforms. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Item 10.3 was severed from the Consent Calendar.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: David Pilpel

On motion to approve Item 10.3:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Hinze, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden  
ABSENT – Heminger

RESOLUTION No. 221115-109

PUBLIC COMMENT (Consent Calendar):

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: David Pilpel (10.1 and 10.2)

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar (Item 10.3 severed):

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Hinze, Yekutieli, Eaken and Borden  
ABSENT – Heminger

## **REGULAR CALENDAR**

11. Presentation and discussion regarding the legal responsibilities of the SFMTA Board of Directors. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation. Fulfills Charter Section 8A.102 (c)(3) training requirements.)



Susan Cleveland-Knowles and Stephanie Stuart, Deputy City Attorneys, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel agreed with the presentation and shared about previously serving with Director Hinze on the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.

12. Presentation and discussion regarding a Muni Service Plan Update. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jaime Vilorio expressed concern about service restoration and suggested that the SFMTA use community liaisons for project-based outreach.

Speaker asked about hiring more security suggesting that fare inspectors double up as security.

Peter Strauss appreciated the presentation and expressed concern about service levels and restoration.

Herbert Weiner was opposed to bond measures and expressed concern about transit and tradeoffs.

David Pilpel expressed concern about rail service beyond the Embarcadero, sharing that forced transfers at 4<sup>th</sup> and King are problematic, and suggested various service changes.

13. Presentation and discussion regarding a Vision Zero Quarterly Update. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Tom Maguire, Director of Streets, introduced Uyen Ngo, SFMTA Livable Streets, Acting Vision Zero Program Manager, Thalia Leng, SFMTA Livable Streets, Senior Planner, and Devan Morris, Dept. of Public Health, Integrated Business Systems Analyst, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:



Jaime Vilorio thanked staff for work in the Tenderloin community and suggested further improvements, including paint at scramble intersections and better quick-build posts.

Edward Mason asked about additional data, including absolute numbers and percentages, and expressed concern over enforcement

14. Amending Transportation Code, Division II, Article 1100, Sections 1119-1121 to remove outdated references to the Board of Appeals. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Kate Toran, Director of Taxis, Access & Mobility Services, and Jonathan Rewers, Chief Strategy Officer, presented the item.

Director Yekutieli left the meeting.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Members of the public expressing opposition: Robert Cesani, Mark Gruberg, Charles Strathmore, Mary Maguire, David Pilpel, Evelyn Engel, Barry Taranto, Marcelle Canseco, and Speaker

On motion to approve:

FAILED:           AYES – Hinze, Eaken and Borden  
                      NAYES – Cajina  
                      ABSENT – Heminger and Yekutieli

**ADJOURN** – The meeting adjourned at 6:36pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

  
Christine Silva  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code





Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.