



SFMTA
Municipal
Transportation
Agency

SAN FRANCISCO
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL

MINUTES

Thursday, November 5, 2015
Room 7080, Union Square Conference Room
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor

REGULAR MEETING
5:30 P.M.

COUNCIL MEMBERS

Daniel Weaver (Chair), Daniel Murphy (Vice Chair), Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell,
Joan Downey, Steve Ferrario, Katie Haverkamp, Steve Taber,
Alex Reese, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Roland Wong, and Frank Zepeda

COUNCIL LIAISON
Roberta Boomer

ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chairman Weaver called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Neil Ballard, Stephen Cornell, Katie Haverkamp, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Roland Wong

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Mark Ballew Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy, Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent: Steve Ferrario and Alex Reese

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

CAC Liaison Boomer made the announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes:

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of October 28, 2015:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Stephen Cornell, Katie Haverkamp, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Roland Wong

ABSENT – Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Steve Ferrario Daniel Murphy, and Alex Reese and Frank Zepeda

5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

No report.

Councilmembers Ballew, Downey and Murphy arrived at 5:34pm

6. Public Comment:

Patrick Monette-Shaw stated that the commuter shuttle evaluation report was premature. It stated that there were zero blocked buses at Van Ness and California Street, which is either a lie or false. Mr. Monette-Shaw reported that he has had to exit a bus into traffic at least ten times because commuter shuttle buses were parked in the bus zone. There are too many errors. He is tired of worrying about his safety. At a recent deposition staff said that they had been unable to get shuttle providers to provide regular data. He will send an article to the CAC. (Mr. Monette-Shaw provided written testimony which can be found on page 8.)

Councilmember Zepeda arrived at 5:35pm

Bill Oberhoffer stated that drivers don't ask passengers to pay their fare but they should. People walk onto a bus through the back door without paying. The operators don't care and Muni loses a lot of money that way. Something should be done.

Anastasia Yovanopoulos stated that Muni started a program that provided free transit to youth, seniors and people with disabilities. At least once a month, she sees fare inspectors who catch people who don't pay their fare.

REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding preliminary findings from the Residential Parking Permit Study. (Kathryn Studwell, Senior Analyst, Andy Thornley, Senior Analyst and Mark Dreger, Planner I)

Kathie Studwell, Andy Thorney and Mark Dreger presented the item. They provided an overview of the project including components, key issues, next steps, the timeline and plan for public outreach. There hasn't been an examination of the program since it was established in 1976. There are 29 Residential Parking Permit (RPP) areas in San Francisco which cover 135,000 households and 28% of San Francisco's curb space. The size of each RPP area varies. The SFMTA sold over 90,000 permits in the last fiscal year. A majority of households only buy one permit. There's a wide range of permit saturation but on average, they are balanced with between 80-120% permit saturation. In certain areas, such as Chinatown and North Beach, the SFMTA is selling 1.5 permits for every on-street parking space.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anastasia Yovanopoulos inquired about what the \$111 fee covers.

Andrew Stadler stated that there used to be "drive now cars" in his RPP area but that ended and suggested that electric cars be allowed a parking permit. The SFMTA should consider the impact on those who live just outside of an RPP zone. The only alternative for those residents is to get themselves inside a zone because, for them, parking has gotten worse. He suggested making the whole city "RPP".

Mark Miller stated that staff spent a lot of money on *SFpark* and wondered if staff looked at that data. He also questioned the terms of the grant.

CAC Motion 151105.01

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA investigate limiting residential parking permits to the number of licensed drivers in any given household.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, Roland Wong, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Alex Reese and Steve Ferrario

CAC Motion 151105.02

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA investigate making temporary parking passes easier to obtain.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, Roland Wong, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Stephen Cornell and Susan Vaughan

ABSENT – Alex Reese and Steve Ferrario

CAC Motion 151105.03

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA investigate eliminating parking permits for buildings built with fewer parking spaces than residential units.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, Roland Wong, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Alex Reese and Steve Ferrario

8. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the Commuter Shuttle Permit Program.
(Hank Willson, Project Manager)

Hank Willson discussed the evolution of the commuter shuttle pilot program. The City can't ban shuttle buses from city streets and they are free to stop in white zones and use curb space. Mr. Willson reviewed various elements of the pilot program including the evaluation report, data collection, shuttle stop events, boarding, shuttle user transportation choices, enforcement and the regulatory framework. There are approximately 3,000 stop events each day. The network is heavy in some corridors, particularly on Van Ness. There are 17,000 boardings per weekday. These shuttles have reduced vehicle miles traveled by 4.3 million. A shuttle bus blocks Muni 2.7 percent of the time which is a 35 percent reduction from before the pilot. Mr. Willson discussed "near side" versus "far side" stops and the impact shuttle buses have on pedestrians and cars. The most common concerns about the shuttles were vehicles that idle, blocking a traffic lane, being on an unauthorized street or stop and shuttles that were disruptive, loud or unwelcome. He reviewed the proposed changes in the permanent program. The biggest change will be that buses over 30 feet in length will be required to travel on arterial streets. This addresses the community's top concern about large buses on small streets. There will be increased enforcement and capital improvements at locations where the shuttle and Muni use the same

stop. Staff will expand GPS data systems to allow greater enforcement and regulation and will address emissions by requiring newer, greener vehicles. Included in the permanent program will be “labor harmony” conditions.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Christine Rogers stated that some progress had been made but there is room for improvement. She is happy to hear about larger buses using the arterial network. She wants to see buses that are “right-sized” because now, buses are too large for her street, double. These buses cause lots of congestion and cause major degradation to city streets. She stated that she now has a layer of black soot on her house and yard.

Amy Feiring stated that it’s disconcerting to have no limit on the number of permits issued. This doesn’t address the changes in the areas where people are being picked up. Rents are going and people have had to move. It’s false to say that the shuttles are getting cars off of the road. San Francisco is bearing the brunt of other cities’ decisions to not allow more homes to be built.

Ken Stadler thinks that this is fantastic opportunity for people to change their commute pattern. These shuttles aren’t bad for Muni. Passengers can put bikes on their shuttle. These programs provide significant positive benefits.

Will Rostoff stated that it’s illegal for the buses to stop in red zones. These vehicles should use white zones. He inquired about environmental review for this program and whether a categorical exemption was being sought for each permit. The statistic about one conflict every two hours is laughable.

Christopher Whirl stated that he understands the concerns about these shuttles but people couldn’t pay him to live in Mountain View. He wants to live in San Francisco and if the shuttles didn’t exist, he would find a new job but wouldn’t have as much discretionary money to spend in the city.

James Driscoll stated that he chose to live in San Francisco. People want to live in a place where they can feel welcomed and loved. San Francisco brings culture to technology.

Anastasia Yovanopoulos thinks that these buses leave filth, congest city streets and impact the quality of air. Residents should be given a break. Caltrain should ferry people to work. Muni should shuttle people to Caltrain. Big buses impact the streets, pedestrians and result in accidents. Neighbors can’t tolerate them. They drive up housing costs and drive families out, including teachers and firefighters.

Edward Mason stated that over the last ten years, there has been no effective enforcement. He has made multiple complaints since the program began. This plan serves one percent of San Francisco’s population. There are consequences when a person lives far from where they work. He inquired about the back-up plan if the environmental impact report is challenged and expressed concern about the turning radius of the buses.

CAC Motion 151105.04

The CAC recommends that the SFMTA Board recommend that the Planning Department do a full Environmental Impact Report.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTED: AYES – Susan Vaughan

NAYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, Roland Wong, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Steve Ferrario and Alex Reese

CAC Motion 151105.05

The CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to remove the commuter shuttle buses from the red zones and create shuttle hubs or legal spaces that are in compliance with the law.

On motion to approve:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES – Neil Ballard, Stephen Cornell, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and

NAYES – Mark Ballew Joan Downey Steve Taber, Roland Wong and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Steve Ferrario and Alex Reese

Councilmember Wong left at 8:34p

CAC Motion 151105.06

The CAC urges the MTA Board of Directors to investigate pricing by weight of commuter shuttle buses to encourage appropriate sized buses and cost recovery of road wear.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Steve Ferrario, Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 151105.07

The CAC recommends that Parking Control Officers who have been tasked with monitoring the shuttle buses prioritize enforcement of the rule regarding unnecessary idling of buses

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES - Steve Taber and Dorris Vincent
ABSENT – Steve Ferrario, Alex Reese and Roland Wong

CAC Motion 151105.08

The CAC recommends that the SFMTA Board of Directors adopt the Commuter Shuttle Program conditioned on inclusion of the other CAC recommendations.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp,
Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda
NAYES – Susan Vaughan
ABSENT – Steve Ferrario Alex Reese and Roland Wong

9. Presentation, discussion and possible action regarding the Engineering, Maintenance and Safety Committee (EMSC) report and recommendations.

EMSC Motion 151028.01

The SFMTA CAC recommends that Muni staff evaluate the process of bus zone expansions and curb bulb-outs design to ensure that pedestrians are safe from unintended consequences and that Muni's line performance is not impacted because of delays from rounding bulb-outs.

No public comment.

Chairman Weaver referred the motion back to the Engineering, Maintenance and Safety Committee.

10. Discussion and possible action regarding:

CAC Motion 151105.09

RESOLVED, That the CAC recommends that prior to adopting the final configuration for the Geary BRT, a conceptual study be done regarding the proposed Geary rail project and that the Geary BRT be designed in a manner to facilitate the rail project, including making the segment between Palm Avenue and 27th Avenue “rail ready” (including subsurface work, track bed and track) in order to avoid disruptive and expensive demolition and construction in connection with the rail project.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason stated that the Transportation Authority Citizens' Advisory Council has gone back and forth regarding whether Geary should be made rail ready. It depends on the topography of Geary Blvd.

CAC Motion 151105.09

RESOLVED, That the CAC recommends that prior to adopting the final configuration for the Geary BRT, a conceptual study be done regarding the proposed Geary rail project and that the Geary BRT be designed in a manner to facilitate the rail project, including making the segment between Palm Avenue and 27th Avenue “rail ready” (including subsurface work, track bed and track) in order to avoid disruptive and expensive demolition and construction in connection with the rail project.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Stephen Cornell, Joan Downey, Katie Haverkamp, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Steve Ferrario, Alex Reese and Roland Wong

11. Committee Members’ requests for information. (For discussion only)

Steve Cornell requested advice regarding whether shuttle buses are required to register to do business in San Francisco and are subject to the same taxation rules and regulations as every other business in San Francisco.

Katie Haverkamp asked about the advertising wrap policy for the new Siemens vehicles and whether full wraps, including windows and doors, would be allowed.

Steve Cornell asked how an LRV operator could be identified when they’re in the cab and their cap number can’t be easily seen.

12. Schedule upcoming calendar items. (For discussion only)

Next regular meeting: Thursday, December 3 at 5:30 p.m.

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor, Union Square Conference Room, # 7080

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 9:10 p.m.

Submitted by:

Roberta Boomer

SFMTA CAC – Staff Liaison

Written 150-Word Public Testimony by Patrick Monette-Shaw for Inclusion in Minutes of SFMTA’s CAC Meeting November 5, 2015: **Agenda Item #8: Commuter Shuttle Permit Program**

SFMTA’s four-month premature “Commuter Shuttle Pilot Program Evaluation Report” dated October 5, 2015 claims on page 25 that of 28 shuttles using the Muni bus stop at Van Ness and California Street per hour, that there were *zero* blocked Muni buses per hour. That claim is either an outright lie, or simply false, as I can attest from my daily experience. I had to exit Muni bases in the middle of traffic lanes at least ten times during October 2015 alone at the northeast corner of Van Ness Avenue and

California Street coming home from work at 5:30 p.m. when shuttle buses — sometimes two shuttles at a time! — were parked in the Muni bus red zones. I'm distributing the long version of my article published in the November issue of the *Westside Observer* to be copied and distributed to CAC members. There's too many false "educated guesses" in this report!