



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council

---

**MINUTES** • Meeting Date: March 6, 2025

## **REGULAR MEETING**

5:30 pm

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Room 7080, Union Square Conference Room

## **SFMTA CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS**

Aaron Leifer, Chair  
Chris Arvin, Vice-Chair  
Sascha Bittner  
Jonathan Bünemann  
Queena Chen  
Steve Cornell  
John Lisovsky  
Eliza Panike  
Yensing Sihapanya  
Connor Skelly  
Susan Vaughan  
Frank Zepeda

## **COUNCIL LIAISON**

Christine Silva

## **COUNCIL SECRETARY**

Keka Robinson-Luqman



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Leifer called the meeting to order at 5:34 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Chris Arvin, Jonathan Bünemann, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Eliza Panike, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent at Roll Call: Connor Skelly

CAC members absent with notification: Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, and Yensing Sihapanya

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound-producing devices during the meeting.

CAC Secretary Robinson-Luqman made the announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes:

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of February 6, 2025:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Jonathan Bünemann, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Eliza Panike, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Connor Skelly

ABSENT – Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, and Yensing Sihapanya

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Chair Leifer welcomed Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation and Brent Jones, Acting Director of Transit. Director Kirschbaum gave a brief history of her time at the agency. She discussed her focus and plans as the new Director of Transportation.

Director Jones talked about efficiency, accountability, and development. He discussed his work to improve the training process, soft skills, and employee development. Director Jones said he has an innovative, futuristic vision for Muni service and that he is ready for the challenge.

### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason discussed Transit Operator Appreciation Day. He stated that the birthrate is not sustaining the population and encouraged Muni to create a training program



## 6. Public Comment

Edward Mason said that 24<sup>th</sup> street is experiencing sewer replacement and repair which has affected parking lanes by converting them into temporary traffic lanes. Commuter shuttle buses are taking up the white zones which are now traffic lanes and Muni buses are being impacted. He said the 48 lines have been bunching due to the delays caused by construction and the inconsistency of the reroute amongst the Operators.

## **REGULAR CALENDAR**

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Third Party Up-Front Fare Pilot and the Upfront Fare Pilot. (Maddy Ruvolo, Principal Access and Mobility Planner, Taxis, Access & Mobility Services. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

No Public Comment.

## CAC MOTION 250306.01

The SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to continue to require that upfront fares be within 10 percent or less of taximeter fares. The current regulated system has been in place for decades to provide reasonable charges to customers and fair rates of return for taxi drivers. It now creates a buffer against the unregulated and potentially exploitative system employed by the TNC industry.

Furthermore, the SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to delay action on adopting a permanent program for Third Party Dispatch until accurate data from the latest quarters is available. If and when the Board of Directors does take action on Third Party Dispatch, the SFMTA CAC urges the Board of Directors to set meter rates for taxis dispatched by third parties and to demand greater data sharing by Third Party Dispatch companies. The SFMTA CAC notes that according to Sec. 8A.101 of the city charter, the SFMTA has "exclusive authority over ... taxi-related fares, fees, charges, budgets and personnel".

Chair Leifer moved to strike the second paragraph of the motion.

On motion to approve the amendment:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Jonathan Bünemann, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer,  
John Lisovsky, Eliza Panike, Connor Skelly, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Susan Vaughan

ABSENT – Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, and Yensing Sihapanya



Members of the public expressing opposition to the amendment: Mark Gruberg and Evelyn Engel

CAC MOTION 250306.01

The SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to continue to require that upfront fares be within 10 percent or less of taximeter fares. The current regulated system has been in place for decades to provide reasonable charges to customers and fair rates of return for taxi drivers. It now creates a buffer against the unregulated and potentially exploitative system employed by the TNC industry.

Members of the public expressing support: Mark Gruberg and Evelyn Engel

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chris Arvin, Stephen Cornell, Aaron Leifer, John Lisovsky, Eliza Panike, Connor Skelly, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Jonathan Bünemann

ABSENT – Sascha Bittner, Queena Chen, and Yensing Sihapanya

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding Muni Service Cuts. (Sean Kennedy, Transit Planning Manager. Explanatory documents include the SFMTA website project page.)

Kate McCarthy, Public Outreach and Engagement Manager, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason stated that Muni should ask Elon Musk for his petty cash to fund the budget shortfall.

9. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

Chair Leifer asked for an update on cell service in the tunnels.

Sue Vaughan asked how many school-tripper buses Muni has and what are the routes.

**ADJOURN** - The meeting was adjourned at 7:49 p.m.



Submitted by:

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'KAR Luqman'.

Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next regular meeting: Thursday, April 3<sup>rd</sup> at 5:30pm | Union Square Conference Room



## ACCESSIBLE MEETING POLICY

The Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council will meet in the Union Square Conference Room at One South Van Ness Ave. 7<sup>th</sup> Floor, San Francisco, CA. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center Station at United Nations Plaza and Market Street. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: Muni Metro Lines J-Church, K-Ingleside, L-Taraval, M-Ocean View, N-Judah and T-Third at Van Ness and Civic Center Stations; F-Market-Wharves; 47-Van Ness; 49-Mission-Van Ness; 6-Haight-Parnassus, 21-Hayes; 9-San Bruno; 7R-Haight-Noriega Rapid; 9R-San Bruno Rapid; and 7-Haight-Noriega. For information about MUNI accessible services call 701.4485.

Members of the Council will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person. Members of the public attending the meeting in person will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every item.

Union Square Conference Room is wheelchair accessible. Remote public participation is available upon request for individuals who cannot attend in person due to disability. Making a request to participate remotely no later than one (1) hour prior to the start of the meeting helps ensure availability of the meeting link. Sign Language Interpretation is also available upon request. Captions can be enabled if participating remotely.

If requesting remote Sign Language Interpretation, please submit an accommodation request a minimum of 4 business hours prior to the start of the meeting. Allowing a minimum of 48 business hours for all other accommodation requests (for example, for other auxiliary aids and services) helps ensure availability. To request accommodation, please contact CAC Secretary Keka Robinson-Luqman by email at [CAC@SFMTA.com](mailto:CAC@SFMTA.com) or by phone at 415.646.2388.

To assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

## KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102.4689; by phone at 415 554.7724; by fax at 415 554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <http://www.sfgov.org>.

## LANGUAGE ASSISTANCE



**311 Free language assistance** / 免費語言協助 / Ayuda gratuita con el idioma / Бесплатная помощь переводчиков / Τῆρ giúp Thông dịch Miễn phí / Assistance linguistique gratuite / 無料の言語支援 / 무료 언어 지원 / ความช่วยเหลือท"งก"ษ"โดยไมเส"ยค่าใช้จ่าย / Libreng tulong para sa wikang Tagalog



**415.646.2388:** For free interpretation services, please submit your request 48 hours in advance of meeting./ 如果需要免費口語翻譯，請於會議之前 48 小時提出要求。/ Para servicios de interpretación gratuitos, por favor haga su petición 48 horas antes de la reunión. Para sa libreng serbisyo sa interpretasyon, kailangan mag-request 48 oras bago ang miting.