



Surveillance Impact Report

San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency - SFMTA
Security Cameras

As required by San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B, departments must submit a Surveillance Impact Report for each surveillance technology to the Committee on Information Technology ("COIT") and the Board of Supervisors.

The Surveillance Impact Report details the benefits, costs, and potential impacts associated with the Department's use of surveillance cameras.

DESCRIPTION OF THE TECHNOLOGY

The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) is a multi-modal transportation organization responsible for operating buses, rail, world-famous cable cars and an historic fleet of streetcars, as well as developing and implementing innovative transportation solutions to benefit auto drivers, transit riders, taxicab users, bicyclists and pedestrians. The SFMTA's programs and services promote safe, efficient and convenient mobility alternatives for San Francisco residents, commuters, businesses and visitors.

In line with its mission, the Department shall use security cameras only for the following authorized purposes:

Authorized Use(s):

1. Live monitoring.
2. Recording of video and images in the event of an incident.
3. Reviewing camera footage.
4. Providing video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident.
5. Enforcing parking and driving violations.

Prohibited use cases include any uses not stated in the Authorized Use Case section.

Further, processing of personal data revealing racial or ethnic origin, political opinions, religious or philosophical beliefs, trade union membership, gender, gender identity, disability status, or an individual person's sex life or sexual orientation, and the processing of genetic data and/or biometric data for the purpose of uniquely identifying an individual person shall be prohibited.

Surveillance Oversight Review Dates

COIT Review: March 18, 2021

Board of Supervisors Review: August 4, 2021

Department technology may be deployed in the following locations, based on use case:

System	Description
SFGO	Cameras installed on signal poles
Facilities	Locations where employees work
Transit platforms and subway	Locations where the public wait to access our vehicles
Vehicles	Cameras in Buses, LRV's Cable Cars, Taxis, trucks, etc.
PARCS (Parking Access and Revenue Control System)	Cameras in our parking garages

Technology Details

The following are product descriptions:

- The department maintains various surveillance cameras throughout San Francisco. Although there are various legacy systems that are still in operation, the department has been working to standardize surveillance systems. The legacy systems use the same technology but may not be from the standard vendors.
- The departments typical security cameras are IP based cameras that are supplied by Hanwha or Axis. These cameras stream video footage across the network to the datacenter where video management solution (VMS) stores the footage. Genetec is the manufacturer of our VMS platform.
- Mobile video recorders from DTI (a third-party vendor) are used in buses and trains to record footage from inside and outside of the vehicle. This digital video recording (DVR) technology captures digital, color images and allow easier transmission, storage, and portability of those images.
- DriveCam is a G-Force triggered digital event recorder that saves triggered events and forwards them via the Internet. Each video is scanned for behavior-based actions and then analyzed by DriveCam safety experts and commented on accordingly. These analyzed events and data are then sent back to the client (SFMTA) for review and follow up to identify and address behavior-based actions that triggered the recording.

How It Works

To function, SFMTA has installed surveillance cameras to monitor critical aspects of our business so we can monitor the safety and quality of services we provide to the citizens of San Francisco. These cameras also stream the video across our network to the SFMTA datacenter where the footage is stored for later review in the event of an incident.

Data collected or processed by security cameras will not be handled or stored by an outside provider or third-party vendor on an ongoing basis. The Department will remain the sole Custodian of Record.

IMPACT ASSESSMENT

The impact assessment addresses the conditions for surveillance technology approval, as outlined by the Standards of Approval in San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 19B:

1. The benefits of the surveillance technology outweigh the costs.
2. The Department's Policy safeguards civil liberties and civil rights.
3. The uses and deployments of the surveillance technology are not based upon discriminatory or viewpoint-based factors and do not have a disparate impact on any community or Protected Class.

The Department's use of the surveillance technology is intended to support and benefit the residents of San Francisco while minimizing and mitigating all costs and potential civil rights and liberties impacts of residents.

A. Benefits

The Department's use of security cameras has the following benefits for the residents of the City and County of San Francisco:

- Education
- Community Development

Health Protect safety of staff, patrons, and facilities while promoting an open and welcoming environment.

- Environment

Criminal Justice Review video footage after a security incident; provide video evidence to law enforcement or the public upon request by formal process, order, or subpoena.

- Jobs
- Housing

Other Job Training and Safety – Review video footage from on-board cameras to train transit operators and improve on-board conditions and safety for customers.

B. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards

The Department has considered the potential impacts and has identified the technical, administrative, and physical protections as mitigating measures:

SFMTA strives to mitigate any potential civil rights impacts by ensuring the responsible usage of surveillance cameras. SFMTA restricts access to video footage. Only authorized trained staff has access to the cameras that pertain to their job roll. Additionally, the ability to export or save video footage is blocked by default for all users and only specific individuals are allowed this type of access. SFTMA Video Management System has extensive auditing capabilities so that all access requests are

logged, including date, time and requestor. Furthermore, where practical, watermarks are added to the footage to show the requester on the footage. SFMTA staff consider privacy and civil rights impacts when they choose camera locations and to try to minimize the potential compromising footage.

C. Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits

The Department’s use of surveillance cameras yields the following business and operations benefits:

Benefit	Description
X Financial Savings	Department Security Camera Systems will save on building or patrol officers.
X Time Savings	Department Security Camera Systems will run 24/7, thus eliminating building or patrol officer supervision
X Staff Safety	Security cameras help identify violations of Department Patron Code of Conduct and provide assurance that staff safety is emphasized and will be protected at their place of employment.
X Data Quality	Security cameras run 24/7/365 so full-time staffing is not required to subsequently review footage of security incidents. Data resolution can be set by level and is currently set to high resolution.

The total fiscal cost, including initial purchase, personnel and other ongoing costs	SFMTA maintains numerous systems that were purchased at different times; therefore, it would be very difficult if not impossible to provide specific numbers. These numbers are approximations.	
Number of FTE (new & existing) and Classification	10 – 7318 Electronic Maintenance Tech 1 – 1044 IS Engineer-Principal 3 – 14xx Surveillance Clerks	
	Annual Cost	One-Time Cost
Software	~\$100,000	~\$3,000,000
Hardware/Equipment	\$50,000-\$100,000	~\$1,000,000
Storage (excluding mobile vehicle video)	~\$200,000	~\$1,000,000
Professional Services	\$50,000-\$100,000	~\$500,000
Training	\$5,000	\$20,000

Other		
Total Cost	\$205,000	~\$4,520,000

Cost on Public Requests and Crime

SFPD request in 2018 accounted for 12% of SFMTA video pulls requiring 238 staff hours per month. In this same time frame, 34% of SFMTA video pulls and approximately 673 staff hours were public request which encompassed 311, Sunshine and TOLE.

The Department funds its use and maintenance of the surveillance technology through general operations budget and occasional grants

COMPARISON TO OTHER JURISDICTIONS

Surveillance cameras are currently utilized by other governmental entities for similar purposes.

Appendix A: Crime Statistics

Department: Municipal Transportation Authority

Section 19B requires each department in their Surveillance Impact Report to respond to the following question if applicable, "the general location(s) [of the surveillance technology] may be deployed and crime statistics for any location(s)."

The Municipal Transportation Authority operates approximately 15,000 Security Cameras throughout its transit system and associated properties.

The department maintained an internal incident log for 2020:

Category	Number of Incidents	% of Incidents
Assault & Battery	283	3.17%
Burglary	69	0.77%
Criminal Activity	135	1.51%
Fatality	2	0.02%
Fire	19	0.21%
Homicide	117	1.31%
Ill Passenger	264	2.96%
Inattentiveness	140	1.57%
Injured Passenger	30	0.34%
Intoxicated passenger	146	1.64%
Accidents	1,010	11.32%
Non-Muni Incidents/Collisions	169	1.89%
Operator assault	34	0.38%
Operator Conduct	895	10.03%
Operator Injury	39	0.44%
Passenger Altercation	1,620	18.15%
Pick pocket	66	0.74%
Red Light Violation	68	0.76%
Rendering Aid	298	3.34%
Robbery	321	3.60%
Sexual Battery	10	0.11%
Shooting	105	1.18%
Slip & Fall	502	5.62%
Sleeper on Board	325	3.64%
Sunshine Requests	39	0.44%
Suspicious Behavior/Person	17	0.19%
Theft/ Stolen Cellphone	237	2.66%
Title VI Complaint/Harassment	113	1.27%
Transit-Only Lane Enforcement (TOLE)	694	7.78%
Tunnel Intruder	21	0.24%
Vandalism	1,062	11.90%

Violation	75	0.84%
Total	8,925	