



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: Tuesday, April 1, 2025

REGULAR MEETING

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
Room 400, City Hall

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE or
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-april-1-2025>

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Janet Tarlov, Chair
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair
Mike Chen
Alfonso Felder
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze

DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Julie Kirschbaum

BOARD SECRETARY

Christine Silva



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Tarlov called the meeting to order at 1:05pm.

2. Roll Call

Present: Mike Chen
Alfonso Felder
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Janet Tarlov
Stephanie Cajina

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes

- March 4, 2025, Regular Meeting
- March 18, 2025, Regular Meeting

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the March 4 and 18, 2025, Regular Meetings:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

5. Communications

None.

6. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Special Recognition
- Muni Funding Working Group Update
- Legislative/Government Affairs Update
- Transit Updates
- Ongoing Activities & Events



Director Kirschbaum introduced Viktoriya Wise, Director of Streets, who recognized the Meter Shop staff. Director Kirschbaum then shared about the Muni Funding Working Group (MFWG), Senate Bill (SB) 63, the Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit Evaluation Report, and cell and mobile service in the subway.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Patricia Vaughey expressed concern over the loss of parking meters in the Marina and called for better public outreach and consistent processes.

Speaker expressed concern over the MFWG's lack of diversity of opinion and shared the need to continuing conversations.

Michael Curtain thanked the agency for implementing underground cell phone service.

Griffin Lee echoed concerns about a lack of diverse perspectives in the MFWG and the group's reliance on passing a ballot measure.

Dylan Fabris appreciated the MFWG's work and encouraged exploring a larger funding measure to not just maintain but expand service.

Audrey expressed support for a forward-looking investment in Muni service and was optimistic about the future.

Speaker thanked the agency for cell service and expressed support for SB 63 as a funding solution.

Herbert Weiner suggested that salaries for Muni management making over \$100K a year and Bicycle Coalition funding be frozen until the crisis passes.

7. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

No report.

8. New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Chair Tarlov welcomed Alfonso Felder to the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENT:



Speaker welcomed Director Felder to the Board.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Bob Feinbaum emphasized that San Francisco is a Transit First city, requiring robust and well-funded transit service and urged the Board to prioritize Muni funding.

John Gomez proposed restructuring fares, improving enforcement and implementing an independent auditing office.

Michael Curtain suggested more accessible public comment opportunities and proposed charging the same for car parking as for market-rate housing.

Tom Radulovich warned against hater strategy and urged the agency to stay inclusive and multi-modal.

Speaker expressed concern about scooters monopolizing public bike parking and suggested regulating scooter companies similar to bikeshare.

Speaker expressed support for maintaining a car-free Market Street, highlighting safety and transit improvements, and warning against pressure from businesses to reopen to cars.

Patricia Vaughey expressed frustration over parking losses, Uber drivers, and RVs, urging the agency to collaborate better and bring back small business and economic vitality.

Griffin Lee expressed support for reopening Market Street, suggesting that it could help revitalize areas like Mid-Market.

Speaker expressed support for car-free Market Street.

Speaker expressed support for prioritizing Muni funding through fare enforcement and other internal cost-saving initiatives.

Herbert Weiner shared that he could not access the meeting on SFGovTV and expressed concern about declining community trust.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA



DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be simple or routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claim against the SFMTA: (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

- A. Rosemarie Elumba v. City and County San Francisco et al., Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-23-609405 filed 09/29/2023 for \$80,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (Plaintiff and revenue vehicle).
- B. CSAA Insurance Exchange, Unlitigated Claim No. C24-0321 for \$29,538.11 (SFMTA to receive). Claim involving allegations of property damage to City property.

RESOLUTION No. 250401-023

10.2. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications (The Planning Department has found that Items A-H are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. For these parking and traffic modifications that received a categorical exemption, the proposed SFMTA Board action constitutes the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.):

- A. ESTABLISH – BUS ZONE – Sacramento Street, south side, from 78 feet to 98 feet west of Presidio Avenue (removes one metered commercial loading space).
- B. ESTABLISH – YELLOW METERED ZONE, COMMERCIAL LOADING, 8AM-6PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY – Sacramento Street, south side, from 120 feet to 142 feet west of Presidio Avenue.
- C. ESTABLISH – YELLOW ZONE, COMMERCIAL LOADING, 30-MINUTE LIMIT, 7 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY, TOW AWAY NO STOPPING ALL OTHER TIMES – Willow Street, south side, from 40 feet to 60 feet east of Van Ness Avenue.



- D. ESTABLISH – YELLOW ZONE, COMMERCIAL LOADING, 60-MINUTE LIMIT, 7 AM TO 7 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY, TOW AWAY NO STOPPING ALL OTHER TIMES – Willow Street, south side, from 68 feet to 169 feet east of Polk Street.
- E. ESTABLISH –GREEN ZONE, SHORT-TERM PARKING, 10-MINUTE LIMIT, 9 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY, TOW AWAY NO STOPPING ALL OTHER TIMES – Willow Street, south side, from 5 feet to 47 feet west of Larkin Street.
- F. ESTABLISH – TOW AWAY NO STOPPING ANY TIME – Willow Street, south side, from 60 feet east of Van Ness Avenue to Polk Street Willow Street, south side, from 47 feet to 247 feet west of Larkin Street.
- G. ESTABLISH – GENERAL METERED PARKING, 2-HOUR TIME LIMIT, 9 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY – Willow Street, south side, from Van Ness Avenue to 20 feet easterly.
- H. ESTABLISH-DUAL USE ZONE: METERED 6-WHEEL COMMERCIAL LOADING, 30-MINUTE LIMIT, 7AM to 6PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY; WHITE ZONE, PASSENGER LOADING, 5-MINUTE LIMIT, ALL OTHER TIMES – 818 Van Ness Avenue, east side, from 27 feet to 59 feet north of Eddy Street.

RESOLUTION No. 250401-024

10.3. Approving parking restrictions and amending Transportation Code, Division II, Section 801 to allow only marked San Francisco Fire Department (SFFD) vehicles to park on the east side of Stanford Street, from Townsend Street to 220 feet northerly at all times and converting existing 2-Hour Residential Permit Parking from 220 feet to 440 feet north of Townsend Street Monday through Friday from 6 AM to 4 PM to SFFD vehicle restricted parking (The SFMTA, under authority delegated by the Planning Department, has determined that the proposed parking and traffic modifications are categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by the S.F. Administrative Code Chapter 31. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.):

- A. RESCIND – 2-HOUR PARKING, 8 AM TO 10 PM, EVERYDAY, EXCEPT VEHICLES WITH AREA Y PERMITS
Stanford Street, east side, from 100 feet to 440 feet north of Townsend Street
- B. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT VEHICLES WITH PERMITS ISSUED BY SFFD.
Stanford Street, east side, from Townsend Street to 100 feet northerly
- C. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, EXCEPT MARKED SFFD. VEHICLES, AT ALL TIMES
Stanford Street, east side, from Townsend Street to 220 feet northerly



- D. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, 6 AM TO 4 PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY, EXCEPT MARKED SFFD. VEHICLES
Stanford Street, east side, from 220 feet to 440 feet north of Townsend Street

RESOLUTION No. 250401-025

- 10.4. Approving a Roadway Shared Spaces street closure application by a local saloon for Jack Kerouac Alley between Grant and Columbus avenues, Sunday, April 6, 2025, through Sunday, April 5, 2026, 1 pm to 10 pm, each Wednesday, Friday, Saturday, and Sunday; and making environmental review findings. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250401-026

- 10.5. Approving the SFMTA’s 2025 Public Transportation Agency Safety Plan (PTASP). (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250401-027

- 10.6. Approving a Second Amendment to Contract No. SFMTA-2023-52, Budget Support, Financial Reconciliation and Procedure Documentation Consulting Services with Equilibrium Collaborative, LLC, to retroactively extend the agreement term for an additional nine months until October 23, 2025, with no increase to the contract amount. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 250401-028

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Marie Hurabiell

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

REGULAR CALENDAR

- 11. Approving the Oak Street Quick-Build Project to improve transportation safety and connectivity, including the establishment of a new Class IV separated bikeway on Oak Street between Stanyan and Baker streets, the conversion of the existing Class III bikeway on Baker Street between Fell and Oak streets to a Class IV separated bikeway, and other related traffic and parking modifications. (The Planning Department has determined that the Oak



Street Quick-Build Project is statutorily exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. The proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by the S.F. Administrative Code Chapter 31. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

- A. ESTABLISH – CLASS IV BIKEWAY
 - i. Oak Street, eastbound, from John F. Kennedy Drive/Stanyan Street to Baker Street
 - ii. Baker Street, southbound, from Fell Street to Oak Street
- B. RESCIND – CLASS III BIKEWAY
 - i. Baker Street, southbound, from Fell Street to Oak Street
- C. ESTABLISH – NO TURN ON RED
 - i. Baker Street, northbound, approaching Oak Street
- D. ESTABLISH – SECOND LEFT-TURN LANE
 - i. Oak Street, eastbound, approaching Masonic Avenue (adds one left-turn lane to existing single left-turn lane)
- E. RESCIND – ANGLED PARKING
ESTABLISH – PARALLEL PARKING
 - i. Baker Street, west side, between Oak Street and Fell Street
- F. ESTABLISH – TOWAWAY NO STOPPING AT ALL TIMES
 - i. Oak Street, north side, from Cole Street west curb line to Cole Street east curb line
 - ii. Oak Street, north side, from Clayton Street west curb line to Clayton Street east curb line
 - iii. Oak Street, north side, from Ashbury Street west curb line to Ashbury Street east curb line
 - iv. Oak Street, north side, from Ashbury Street to Masonic Avenue
 - v. Oak Street, north side, from 15 feet west of Central Avenue to 50 feet easterly
 - vi. Oak Street, north side, from Lyon Street west curb line to Lyon Street east curb line
 - vii. Oak Street, north side, from Baker Street to 40 feet westerly
 - viii. Baker Street, west side, from Oak Street to 55 feet northerly
- G. ESTABLISH – YELLOW ZONE, 30-MINUTE COMMERCIAL LOADING, AT ALL TIMES
 - Oak Street, north side, from Clayton Street to 40 feet easterly

Mark Dreger, Project Manager, presented the item.

Supervisor Mahmood expressed support for the project emphasizing widespread support due to its benefits and urged the Board to uphold the City’s transit-first and safety commitments.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Tim Hickey, Michel Creehan, Megan Roche,



Robin Kutner, Kevin Rehak, Sarah Katz-Hyman, Jordan Schneider, Adam Bristol, Brendan Powell, Emily Steinglass, Kat Siegal, Michael Balsamo, Stephen Braitsch, Hanz Gillman, Rebecca, Theodore Randolph, David Friedlander-Holm, Peter, Julia Danielle, Tom Radulovich, Rebajava, Reeza Bodel, Rachel Clyde, Zach Lipton, Michael Curtion, Anthony, Sean Burgest, and Brian

Members of the public expressing opposition: Vanessa Kerr, Marie Hurabiell, Brad McMillan, Patricia Vaughey, John Gomez, Deann Matthews, Charlotte, Patrice Thompson, Griffin Lee, Jaime Sevilla, Rick Correll, Bob Feinbaum, and Herbert Weiner

On motion to amend the resolution, Item G to Establish – Yellow Zone, 30-min commercial loading from “at all times” to “9am-6pm” and approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

RESOLUTION No. 250401-029

Chair Tarlov recessed the meeting at 4:15pm and reconvened the meeting at 4:37pm.

12. Approving an increase for the annual Contractor Parking Permit from \$2,412 to \$3,074 and from \$1,206 to \$1,537 for a six-month permit and directing staff to publish the new fees consistent with the Transportation Code. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Diana Hammons, Senior Manager - Revenue Collection & Sales, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Joel Koppel

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Cyrus Hall

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, Cajina, and Tarlov

RESOLUTION No. 250401-030

13. Presentation and discussion regarding a Streets Quarterly Update. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)



Viktoriya Wise, Director of Streets, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Sarah Katz-Hyman expressed support for the statewide daylighting law, emphasizing its importance for improving visibility and safety at intersections.

SPECIAL ORDER – The following item not to begin before 4:00pm.

14. Presentation, discussion and possible action to direct staff to move forward with the final Muni service cut proposal for Summer 2025 to address a \$7.2M gap in the Fiscal Year 2025-2026 operating budget for future action and consideration, including the results of the required Title VI Service Equity Analysis. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Sean Kennedy, Chief Planning and Implementation Officer, presented the item.

Supervisor Mahmood expressed opposition to service cuts, warning that they would set the foundation for difficult decisions that will need to be made over the coming years.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Cal Law expressed support for using reserves to avoid cuts and maintain public trust.

Speaker commented on discount programs and the agency's lack of communication, urging the agency to improve feedback and responsiveness.

Matthew Thompson expressed opposition to service cuts, highlighting that they hurt workers and riders, eroding long term trust in the agency.

Brian Donahoe urged the Board to reject service cuts and preserve trust in public transportation.

Speaker expressed support for using reserves to stop the cuts and maintain support for future transit funding.

Speaker expressed support for using reserves.

Michael Curtain shared about frustration with ongoing service reductions and commented that promised bus lines have not returned, making the City less accessible.



Deeann Matthews questioned why there was protected funds for street safety but not for transit service.

Zach Lipton urged the Board to use the reserves and emphasized the loss of public trust.

Rachel Reynolds expressed opposition to cutting the 5 Fulton line and the impact it would have on workers' commute reliability.

Anthony Ballester expressed support for using the reserves.

Sara Greenwald expressed support for using the reserves and encouraged long-term planning for a better, more sustainable system.

Speaker shared about using Muni to get to the theatre and was supportive of using the reserves.

Danielle Truppi opposed service cuts, supporting the use of reserve funds to address next year's deficit.

Speaker expressed opposition to service cuts and urged the Board to use the reserves.

Rishav Rout urged the Board to use the contingency reserve.

Sonya Herrera urged the Board to preserve service and use the reserve or request a general fund transfer.

Colette Crutcher proposed that the agency should tax Uber and Waymo to help fund Muni.

Teri Adams urged the Board to protect Muni and was supportive of using the reserves.

Matthew Coleman urged the Board to reject summer service cuts and approve use of the reserves.

Bob Feinbaum shared that SaveMuni voted unanimously to oppose service cuts and use the reserve.

Pete Wilson expressed support for improving bus routes and opposition to service cuts, warning that cuts would erode rider confidence and hurt Muni.

Jaime Viloría urged the Board to use the reserve and seek out long-term funding solutions,



emphasizing the importance of reliable service for building ridership.

Emily Horseman shared that service cuts will erode voter support, expressed support for using reserve funds.

Aiden Jones expressed concern about service cuts and support for using the reserves a general fund transfer.

Chris Arvin shared about a 6 Haight/Parnassus line experience and called for preserving service to maintain public trust.

Shaya French emphasized how cuts would negatively impact seniors and the disability community, expressing support for using reserves to avoid cuts.

Yolando Catzalco commented about equity and expressed support for using reserves to avoid service cuts.

Wendy Park urged the Board to reject service cuts, urging the use of reserves to protect service.

PJ Eugenio was opposed to service cuts and urged the Board to use the reserves to protect communities.

Adam warned that cuts would deteriorate public trust and future funding, urging the Board to use reserve funds.

Rachel Clyde urged the Board to use reserve funds to prevent cuts and give a longer runway to address next year's larger deficit.

Sasha Maldonado expressed opposition to service cuts and to use reserve funds.

Robert shared about being a longtime Muni rider and emphasized the importance of consistent service, urging the Board to use the reserve to prevent cuts.

Tom Radulovich urged the Board not to cut service and instead use the reserve or charge for parking.

Audrey urged the Board to use the reserves to prevent summer cuts, emphasizing the importance of maintaining service to keep voter support for future funding.

Micah shared that service cuts now would distract from the larger \$322M deficit next year



and harm rider trust.

Sarah Katz-Hyman warned that cutting service erodes trust and expressed support for using reserves to prevent cuts.

Kat Seigal urged the agency to use the reserves instead of cutting service, sharing that cutting service would be immobilizing.

Jerry Parleko Reeba urged the Board to use reserve funds instead of service cuts, sharing that service is rarely added back.

Cyrus Hall commented about the connection and identity people have with specific Muni lines and urged the Board to use reserve funds.

Sophie urged the use of contingency reserves to avoid cuts.

Palavi expressed support for the use of operational reserves, sharing that now is the time to protect Muni.

Erica Wright expressed concern that cuts would lead to overcrowding and unsafe conditions, urging the Board to use the reserve.

Gabriel warned that cuts affect students and essential services, urging the Board to prioritize service.

Deon Anderson expressed concern about cuts leading to impacts such as overcrowded buses and safety issues.

Sergio Torres emphasized the importance of Muni for school children and urged the Board to consider the impact of cuts to the City's future.

Scott Feeney urged the Board to avoid cuts, sharing that it would be fiscally irresponsible to not use the reserve.

Speaker suggested reaching out to wealthy individuals and corporations for funding contributions and was critical of the agency for not seeking out additional sources.

Herbert Weiner questioned management salaries over \$100K and bicyclists not paying for licenses, sharing that the sacrifices should be mutually shared.



On motion to direct staff to pursue the final Summer service cut proposal including the Title VI Service Equity Analysis for consideration and future approval:

ADOPTED: AYES – Chen, Felder, Hinze, and Tarlov
 NAYES – Heminger, Henderson, and Cajina

ADJOURN – Chair Tarlov adjourned the meeting at 6:49pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Christine Silva'.

Christine Silva
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax:



415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication by 12pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.