



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: Tuesday, February 7, 2023

SPECIAL MEETING

9:00am

49 South Van Ness Avenue
Training Rooms, Rooms 132-136

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020 emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the SFMTA Board of Directors may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or online at www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to MTABoard@sfmta.com by 5pm the day before the meeting or call 415.646.4470.

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE or
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-special-meeting-february-7-2023>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 Access Code: 2494 746 9838

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Amanda Eaken, Chair
Gwyneth Borden, Vice Chair
Stephanie Cajina
Steve Heminger
Fiona Hinze
Manny Yekutieli

DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Jeffrey Tumlin

BOARD SECRETARY

Christine Silva



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Eaken called the meeting to order at 9:07am.

2. Roll Call

Present: Stephanie Cajina
Steve Heminger
Fiona Hinze
Manny Yekutieli
Gwyneth Borden
Amanda Eaken

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva announced that ringing and the use of cell phones and similar sound-producing electronic devices were prohibited at the meeting.

4. Welcome and introduction. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Jeff Tumlin, Director of Transportation, presented the item.

No public comment.

5. Presentation and discussion of city financial projections and context and agency financial outlook. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation. Fulfills Charter Section 8A.102 (c)(3) training requirements.)

Ben Rosenfield, Controller, Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer, and Jonathan Rwers, Chief Strategy Officer, presented the item.

Chair Eaken recessed the meeting due to technical challenges at 10:26am and reconvened the meeting at 10:40am.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jodie Medeiros expressed concern for street safety and fatalities.

Jaime Vilorio expressed concern regarding raising fares and asked the SFMTA to include the community in discussions.



Cyrus Hall asked the SFMTA about ridership and commented on building trust.

Vinita Goyal commented on providing revenue options for the future and asked the SFMTA to expand services with residents in mind.

Edward Mason shared about medallion fees for corporate commuter buses.

Zach Lipton was in support of Seamless Bay Area's call for regional partners and asked the Board to consider time and speed in which the agency makes decisions.

Peter Straus expressed concern for the structural deficit and asked that the Board consider long-term strategies to get to long-term recovery.

Speaker shared that short term and long-term instances of funding needed and that there is a need to look at it holistically and in coordination.

Ian Griffith shared that the SFMTA needs more revenue to continue and hoped that the SFMTA would work in partnership with other agencies.

After Item 5, the Board will recess and suspend Brown Act requirements for lunch and to view staff posters and demonstrations. Viewing posters and demonstrations will contain less than a majority of board members.

Members of the public may view staff posters and demonstrations in person at the meeting location or on the meeting webpage: <https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-special-meeting-february-7-2023>

Possible topics for posters and demonstrations include:

- Bus Fleet Management
- Bus Transit Signal Priority
- Climate Roadmap
- Gratitude Campaign
- Light Rail Fleet Expansion & Replacement
- Muni Forward
- Ombuds Office
- Practical Communication Tools (PaCT) Program
- Road to Fitness
- Service Equity Expansion
- Subway Renewal



- Transit Operations Recognition & Accountability
- Wellness Program Resources

The Board will reconvene its Brown Act meeting at approximately 2:00pm.

Chair Eaken recessed the meeting at 12:15pm and reconvened the meeting at 2:00pm.

6. Presentation and panel discussion regarding building trust with our communities. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Viktoriya Wise, Chief of Staff, and Melissa Culross, Public Information Officer, presented the item.

Panelists included: Albert Chow (President, People of Parkside Sunset), Milan Duong-Gordley (Member, SFMTA Youth Transportation Advisory Board), Sebastian Vera Cuevas (Member, SFMTA Youth Transportation Advisory Board), Preston Kilgore (District 5 Aide, SF Board of Supervisors), Jessica Lehman (Executive Director, Senior and Disability Action), Eleazar Martinez (Program Director, Family Connections Centers), Kevin Ortiz (Chair, SFCTA Community Advisory Committee and Co-Founder, Misión Destino), Tacing Parker (Senior Executive Director, Bayview Hunters Point YMCA), Masood Samereie (President, San Francisco Council of District Merchants Associations), and Malcom Yeung (Executive Director, Chinatown Community Development Center).

The SFMTA's Chief of Staff, Viktoriya Wise, opened the afternoon discussion with a panel on Building Trust with the City's Communities. In her opening remarks, Chief of Staff Wise acknowledged both a trend in loss of faith in the institution of government and that historical racial discrimination by government agencies, including the SFMTA, has contributed to an environment of distrust. This panel was only the first conversation in the agency's endeavor to build trust with San Francisco communities, and SFMTA acknowledges that it has a lot of progress to make. Most members of the panel were familiar with some of the challenging projects that generated mistrust (e.g., the Central Subway, wherein Chinatown and the neighborhood's merchants had to endure many challenges and delays). Chief of Staff Wise expressed that for the SFMTA to achieve its goal of being at the forefront of rebuilding people's trust in government, the agency must examine what the agency's practices are when making decisions and prioritizing projects, programs and funding and center racial equity in those decisions. We must ask ourselves how we engage with communities of color who are not in constant communication with our agency. Ultimately, relationship and trust building can move us towards achieving our racial equity goals. The panel's participants were leaders from a wide range of organizations in San Francisco.



As panelist Tacing Parker, Senior Executive Director with the Bayview Hunters Point YMCA, offered, trust is unique, looks different for different communities and can be surface level or can be deep. A key step is to recognize with whom we need to build trust. Community is not just based on geography, it spans a variety of identities and experiences, including those who have experienced racism, who face risk given their place on the gender or identity spectrum, and more specifically Trans and LGBTQ+, those with disabilities or other vulnerabilities, including people who are unhoused. The discussion centered on the necessity of establishing respect in order to build trust and the fact that building trust starts on the ground between people. At the SFMTA, this can be put into action by staff hearing what community members think, learning from what they know and experience so that challenges can be defined and then building solutions together. Vice Chair Borden aptly noted that it does not work when the SFMTA alone defines the problem and the solution.

Three major themes emerged from the panel discussion with the Board: 1) serving with care, 2) decision-making and power sharing and 3) transparency.

Serving with Care

Ms. Parker remarked that it is imperative for the agency to serve the public with care, ensuring that people are seen, valued and feel cared for by the SFMTA. What came out of the discussion was a call to create a culture of caring by building relationships through:

- establishing the SFMTA's presence in community spaces without an agenda;
- providing reliable and accessible service and clean transit shelters and stations;
- creating safety on transit and on our streets (Vision Zero);
- communicating with the public about decision making; and
- directly engaging people who are affected by our decisions.

Panelist Kevin Ortiz, Chair of the SFCTA Community Advisory Committee and Co-Founder of Misión Destino, suggested that this shift asks the agency to prioritize the people taking transit who are most vulnerable, such as seniors, people with disabilities and single mothers working non-traditional hours. This resonated with Chair Eaken, who asked how to create a culture of caring that extends to both the public and the SFMTA workforce. The agency's internal culture shapes how staff feel and work together as well as how staff work with communities. To this point, relationships need to be built both inwards and outwards. As Ms. Parker said, people need to feel cared about in the city that they love.

Sharing Power and Decision-making

Decision-making and power sharing came up as a key theme in terms of who makes decisions: the public, the agency and both in collaboration. Panel members agreed that the SFMTA should be able to make difficult decisions and referred to the recent success of the agency's POETS program and contributions from staff like Lulu Feliciano. However, they also stressed



that there must be involvement from people being affected by decision making and communication with public about the agency's decision-making rationale. There is power in making decisions and there was recognition that power can and should be shared. Panelist Malcolm Yeung, Executive Director of Chinatown Community Development Center (CCDC), emphasized that trust needs tending and attention, as it can come and go, and trust between individuals is different from trust between individuals and an organization. For example, individual staff may leave the agency or project, but the community remains and remembers. Also, Mr. Yeung emphasized that trust also requires the agency to share power, which can be hard for an organization that is so heavily responsible for delivering systems every day under stressful circumstances. However, being honest about those realities and challenges can lead to trust and understanding. Building trust looks different in different communities.

One outstanding question is how trust can be a key performance metric and how we can track the agency's progress in building trust. Another is how equity can be embedded in the decision-making process. How can different community members express their perspectives when not everyone has the access, time and familiarity with the process to engage in the process or even voice an opinion.

Fostering Transparency

Finally, transparency was a universal interest of the panelists, specifically transparent communication with the public about decision-making as well as about construction and planned projects. The panelists appreciated the honesty the Board showed when directors spoke about the agency's challenges in delivering service and projects. The panelists, as well as members of the public in attendance, also expressed an interest in data transparency – making it available to the public, using data in decision-making and supplementing quantitative data with qualitative data.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jaime Vilorio urged the SFMTA to create working groups and taskforces, also requesting that when presenting data to include qualitative data as well.

Paula Katz submitted the following public comment summary per Administrative Code Section 67.16:

1. Removing bus stops creates hardship for many riders. Before removing stops, surveys should specifically ask riders if it's ok to remove bus stops to create more reliable service if it means seniors, riders with mobility issues, etc. had to walk farther, even if this would be a hardship for them.
2. When the Taraval construction ends in 2024 and L Taraval trains return, don't approve any plan that interlines the L Taraval and the K Ingleside, forcing L & K riders to transfer at West Portal in both directions. This will create a horrible



user experience for tens of thousands of L & K riders, and can be dangerous for many seniors, riders with mobility issues, parents with young children, etc. Riders will be furious at SFMTA if they are forced to transfer at West Portal. L & K riders are united with J Church riders in opposition to forced transfers!

Speaker shared about continued mistrust of the SFMTA, also commenting about private electrical vehicles and a deficient Transportation Element.

David Pilpel commented on outreach and the importance of documenting public comment, also suggesting that responses should show how a project has changed over time.

Speaker expressed concern regarding data and restoration of the J Church line.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern about decisions being pre-made.

Claudia Lewis commented about poor outreach done for Lake Street.

7. Board Workshop Conclusion

Jeff Tumlin, Director of Transportation, presented the item.

Board members shared their top three priorities for the year.

Director Heminger was interested in the budget and salary savings, Vision Zero, and appreciated the staff poster session.

Director Yekutieli shared that he would be focused on the state of the city's streets, street paving and maintenance of transit shelter and stations.

Director Cajina's priorities included a deep dive on safety, a strategy or audit to understand how the public is engaging on current transit services, and a community and outreach engagement strategy that is authentic.

Director Hinze is interested in Vision Zero, a deep dive on safe and open spaces within the context of the Active Communities Plan, and the state of good repair.

Director Borden's priorities included service and reliability, improving communications, Vision Zero and the safety of the streets, and improving staff culture.

Chair Eaken shared that she plans to focus on Vision Zero, promoting and sustaining a culture of care, and agency hiring.



PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jodie Medeiros was encouraged by the day and appreciated the mention of Vision Zero.

ADJOURN – The meeting adjourned at 4:53pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.


Christine Silva
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax:



415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.