

Minutes
PCC Executive Committee Meeting
March 15, 2023

PCC Executive Committee Members Present: Marty Smith, PCC Chair; Jane Redmond, PCC Vice Chair; Cheryl Damico, PCC Secretary; Mara Math, PC&O Chair, Craig Nelson; Jessica Felix; Joan Kwansa; Mary McLain; Roland Wong; Susan Kitazawa

PCC Members and Guests: Tracey Gamedah; Chris Sweis; Jon Canapary; Paul Lanzi

PCC Executive Committee Member Excused:

SF Paratransit Staff: Marc Soto; Kevin McDonald; Justin Leong; Carol Osorio; Matthew Teixeira; Cheryl Hac; Rico Auga; Imogen Budetti

SFMTA: Annette Williams; Jonathan Cheng

Marty Smith, PCC Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:35 a.m.

Read and Approve Agenda

Marty Smith, PCC Chair, read the agenda. The agenda were motioned/seconded/approved.

Approve Minutes of January 25th meeting

The minutes were motioned/seconded/approved.

Comments from the Chair

Marty Smith acknowledged that the last meeting ended soon and would appreciate advance notice in the future. Jonathan Cheng stated that the meeting ended early due to a last-minute meeting and in the future, SFMTA would provide advance notice but indicated that this was an anomaly.

2022 Paratransit Customer Satisfaction Survey

Jonathan Cheng introduced Jon Canapary who led a discussion on the results from the 2022 Paratransit Customer Satisfaction Survey. Telephone surveys were conducted in September/October 2022 with 507 riders. Surveys were conducted in several languages. Among the findings include:

- There was an 89% satisfaction with the SF Paratransit program; 5% indicated dissatisfaction with the service, which was slightly higher than previous years.
- Medical appointments were the highest trip purpose, followed by errands and social visits.
- There was a 92% satisfaction with the surveyed trip. Individual aspects related to the surveyed trip, including courtesy, and driving skills of driver, were on par to previous years.

- There was a 93% satisfaction with the on-time performance of the surveyed trip among taxi riders.
- There was a 91% satisfaction with the on-time performance of the surveyed trip among SF Access riders.
- There was a 96% overall satisfaction with the SF Paratransit Broker's office rating; this was higher than previous years.
- 85% of ridership own cell phone, of which 61% are smartphones. 69% of riders have never used an app to request a trip while 38% have visited the SF Paratransit website.
- 89% of riders received the Trip Reminder call and 98% indicated that the calls are helpful.

Marc Soto thanked Jon Canapary for this report. He mentioned that it would be good to compare the key indicators to the fixed route in terms of satisfaction. Marc also acknowledged that on-time performance correlates to customer satisfaction rating and was surprised about the low rating regarding cleanliness of vehicle. Jon added that other transit agencies are also seeing lower rating in terms of cleanliness in light of COVID-19 pandemic. Marty Smith mentioned that Yellow Cab has cleaning supplies readily available. Susan Kitazawa stated that she believes that higher customer satisfaction is matching with the improvements in the SF Access program. She was interested in knowing why riders expressed dissatisfaction with the SF Paratransit program. Jon stated that the reasons for dissatisfaction include late drivers and misuse of taxi meter.

Craig Nelson asked if the survey data was broken down by user type. Jon Canapary said that the data is broken down by service mode. Susan Kitazawa asked about the types of disabilities among those surveyed. Jon indicated that the report does list the data by disability type. Craig requested that ramp taxi driver be included in the next survey.

Marty Smith requested a copy of the report. Jonathan Cheng said that once the report is finalized, a copy of the executive summary will be sent out to members.

Update on Scooter Share Program

Annette Williams introduced Danny Yeung and Forest Barnes, who led a discussion on updates to the Scooter Share Program.

Forest Barnes stated that the current iteration of the scooter share program will run through June 2023, with two permittees, Lime and Spin. Since July 2021, there have been 2.5M trips with 15,000 citations and 14,000 311 complaints. Data shows there were fewer trips during the winter months when compared to summer months while most complaints along the marina and northeast section of city. The established goals of the Scooter Share program include providing safe and equitable mobility, diverse ridership, and helping with first/last mile trips. Some ongoing issues include unsafe riding including sidewalk riding and riding wrong way, improperly parked scooters, and ensuring equitable distribution throughout city. Most citations are related to improper parked scooters and illegal sidewalk riding.

Among the key requirements for companies to participate in the Scooter Share program include safety and rider accountability, equity including an adaptive program and plans with distribution in low-income neighborhood, community engagement, labor harmony, and parking

requirements. SFMTA has had biweekly meetings with the permittees and have built an online portal to centralize complaints. In addition, events were held with disability community to show the adaptive scooters. Permittees also pay a fee for bike rack program, leading to the installation of over 3K racks installed since program launched. In addition, five percent of on-street fleet must be adaptive to people with disabilities. SFMTA held a demonstration on new technology to prevent sidewalk riding in December 2021, May 2022, and September 2022.

Among the next steps include completing an evaluation of the program with SFMTA making recommendations to the next version of the permit program. It is expected to include a focus on sidewalk technology to prevent illegal riding, vehicle design requirements, and a climate and equity focus. Plans are to request an extension of current permit to allow for time for program evaluation and potential recommendation to update permit terms.

Mara Math asked who issues the citations. Forest Barnes said that investigators are on the street and will issue the citation if they see any violations and will take a picture and pass it on to company. Mara followed up by asking if fines are passed through to individual riders or amortized to all riders. Forest replied that the citation is passed to individual rider. Cheryl Damico requested more details about the adaptive scooter programs. Forest stated that there are two programs; one is available on demand with scooters available at stations and users are charged the same rate as the regular scooter program while the other program requires reservations but can be rented long term.

PC&O Taxi/Ramp Taxi Subcommittee Report

Jessica Felix read the following report:

The agenda for 02/01/2023 was read and approved. Jonathan Cheng asked to move the Service Quality Item to #6 and to have the Broker Report follow. The agenda was approved with the one change. The minutes were also approved as written.

- **Election of the PC&O Vice Chair**

Jessica Felix was nominated and reelected Vice Chair.

- **Comments from the Chair**

Jessica said she was excited to see so many people in attendance and she is hoping they can get to the root of the issues making it difficult for people to get taxis.

- **Service Quality Issues**

Kate Toran of the SFMTA and the team from Taxi Services, including Philip Cranna and Danny Yeung were in attendance. Kate thanked the PCC members for their valuable input. The Taxi Services team provided an informative presentation discussing the state of the taxis in San Francisco along with initiatives to support the industry. There were a few questions and Philip directed people to report any issues to 311.

- **Driver & Cab Company Issues**

Jessica noted Yellow dispatch issues regarding information and estimated pickup times for ramp taxis, as well as having her calls being hung up on. Chris Sweis, Yellow Cab,

responded that if someone doesn't pick up a ramp call the dispatchers will begin reaching out to individual drivers, and to notify him on hang ups. Mara Math asked about the policy when a driver arrives but declines due to the destination. Philip advised he should be informed so they may investigate, as that is considered fare refusal and subjects drivers to discipline.

Barry Taranto provided feedback on the presentation, inquiring about the driver numbers as it compared two pandemic impacted years to 2022. He added Yellow drivers report they cannot keep up with dispatch calls and therefore are not interested in third-party participation. Barry asked that inspections of spare cabs should increase from every six months to four months. He also noted up the lack of spare ramp taxis. Jessica inquired about the rate of third party-app pickups and its contribution to the paratransit riders' problems in obtaining a cab. Hansu Kim, Flywheel, reported they have over 100 drivers participating and soon will have 200. He claimed they have not seen drivers opting for Uber riders over regular orders. Hansu discussed the profitability of ramp taxi service given the high cost of the vehicles and time involved. Chris also discussed the lack of workers in all areas of the service industry.

- **Rider Issues**

Susan Kitazawa noted it would be very helpful if drivers were trained on assisting people with various disabilities. Barry added he believed the online driver training was not sufficient and resuming in-person taxi driver training would help with driver retention.

- **Broker Report**

Marc Soto thanked the industry representatives who attended the meeting. Justin Leong stated that the number of taxi trips in November was 23,278 and in December 22,203. OTP is climbing to 93.5% in December, and trending at 95% for January. Complaints per 1,000 trips remained low, 0.16 in November and 0.13 in December. Ramp incentives paid were \$8,900 in October, \$9,445 in November and \$8,610 in December.

SFMTA and SF Paratransit are hosting a CTAA PASS Train-the-Trainer course will be held at the Paratransit Broker on Thursday & Friday February 23rd and 24th at no cost to the drivers. Drivers who complete the training would receive a stipend for completion and training their first five drivers.

The next PC&O Taxi/Ramp Taxi subcommittee meeting will be on May 3, 2023.

PC&O SF Access Subcommittee Report

Mary McLain read the following report:

- **Election of Vice Chair**

Mary McLain was elected Vice Chair for 2023.

- **Service Quality Update**

Mary McLain reported they continue to hire and train new drivers, with new classes starting each week. She also reported they have experienced some driver tablet issues

recently but advised the problem is shrinking as they work closely with IT on addressing the issues.

- **SF Paratransit Broker's Report**

Justin Leong of the Brokers Office reported on service statistics:

- SF Access trip counts in December and January held steady at approximately 13,000 per month, with a small decline in February at approximately 12,500.
- SF Access On-Time Performance was 96.4% in December, slightly dipped to 95.2% in January, and rebounded to 97.3% in February.
- Complaints per 1,000 trips trended down overall, with approximately 1.5 per 1,000 in December, 0.8 per 1,000 in January, and 1 per 1,000 in February.
- The Trapeze V21 upgrade is still on track for an April roll out.
- Work on finalizing the new Riders Guide is almost complete.
- The Brokers Office hosted a CTAA PASS (Passenger Assistance Safety and Sensitivity) Train-the-Trainer workshop with both van and taxi provider staff in attendance.

- **Rider Service Feedback**

Riders discussed topics including use of GPS navigation and things that may need updating on Google maps. The topic of participation and outreach for the PCC was also brought up.

Paratransit Broker Report

Marc Soto, Justin Leong, and Mary McLain reported as follow:

- **Service Level Statistics**

SF Access operated about 13,000 trips for January and February 2023. Paratransit taxis completed approximately 21,000 trips in January and February 2023. Group Van is at around 4,200 trips in January and February 2023.

- **On Time Performance**

On time performance for taxis was 100%. For the SF Access service, the on-time performance in 95% in January and 97% in February. Group Van on-time performance was 88% for January and February

- **CTAA Train the Trainer**

SF Paratransit sponsored a CTAA Train the Trainer workshop on February 23 and 24. Two taxi representatives participated and were certified as ramp taxi trainers.

- **2022 Customer Satisfaction Survey**

Staff reviewing the final report. As mentioned in the presentation, there was high overall satisfaction, but opportunities exist to improve.

- **Paratransit Facility**

Brisbane is in the process of negotiating lease agreements to extend the terms for the existing SF Access operation facilities.

- **Broker/Operations IT Activities**

Tablets are changing communication to FirstNet and while there were some difficulties with the shift, they have largely been resolved. The Trapeze v21 update was intended to go live soon with 95% of testing having been completed. This needs to be completed before Clipper 2.0 occurs, which is expected to happen in Spring 2024. The phone system for Broker and operations offices have passed their shelf life and staff will be looking at a cloud-based solution to enhance performance.

- **SF Paratransit Staffing Update**

Boris Dvorkin has joined as the Administrative Assistant at the Broker's office. The position of Contract Administrator remains vacant.

Roland Wong asked if there will be a presentation on Clipper 2.0. Marc Soto indicated that there will be one in the future but there are not many details right now.

Jonathan Cheng led a discussion on the possible resumption of in-person meetings for the PCC Executive Committee and PC&O subcommittees. Roland Wong stated as a member of BART's accessibility taskforce, they must follow the Brown Act. Cheryl Damico wanted to hear what other paratransit advisory committee are doing. Marty Smith would like to have the meeting in person. A motion to resume in person meetings for PCC Executive Committee and PC&O subcommittee was made and approved.

Public Comments

Roland Wong commented that he recently used the YoTaxi app and got his order was accepted immediately. Jessica Felix would like the on-time performance for taxis to be redefined and suggested it will be discussed at the next PC&O taxi/ramp taxi subcommittee meeting. Mara Math would like to have new members at meetings and actions taken to strategize improved outreach. Susan Kitazawa suggested that we have this item discussed at the next SF Access subcommittee meeting. Paul Lanzi, representing the Dorado Terrace Safe Neighborhood Group, has been in contact with SF Paratransit about issues with vehicle double parking in front of the dialysis center along Ocean Avenue. He believes that drivers should not make illegal maneuvers and block traffic. Jessica Felix acknowledge that the location is poorly configured, and the paratransit vehicles are trying to provide on-time service to dialysis patients.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 12:40 pm.

The next PCC meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 10th from 10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.