



**SFMTA**  
Municipal  
Transportation  
Agency

**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**MINUTES**

**Thursday, March 1, 2018  
Room 7080, Union Square Conference Room  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor**

**REGULAR MEETING  
5:30 P.M.**

**COUNCIL MEMBERS**

**Daniel Weaver (Chair), Frank Zepeda (Vice Chair), Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew,  
Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Steve Cornell, Joan Downey, Michael Eshleman, Cesar  
Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, and Dorris Vincent**

**COUNCIL LIAISON  
Roberta Boomer**

**COUNCIL SECRETARY  
Keka Robinson-Luqman**

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Vice Chairman Zepeda called the meeting to order at 5:38 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

CAC members present at Roll Call: Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

CAC members absent with notification: Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

CAC Secretary Robinson-Luqman made the announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes:

PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel stated that he has not seen the minutes but he is sure that they are correct.

On motion to approve the minutes of February 1, 2018:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

### 5. Report of the Chair (For discussion only)

Vice Chairman Zepeda stated that he will postpone item 10 until the March 22<sup>nd</sup> special meeting. He also stated that Secretary Robinson-Luqman should call items 9 and 11 together.

No public comment.

### 6. Public Comment:

Edward Mason stated that the SFMTA worked for three weeks to replace the track at 24<sup>th</sup> and Church streets. They replaced ties and rail due to rail-slapping, which is when vehicles cross the tracks perpendicularly. The problem is exacerbated by the commuter shuttle buses. Also, commuter shuttle buses are still operating at closed bus stops. He stated that he is backlogged in documentation of the violations. The stop at 24<sup>th</sup> and Church streets has been discontinued

since September 2017, but shuttle buses continue to stop there. It takes neighborhood persistence and diligence to get the program to work. It's not working in a lot of areas.

John Goldsmith stated that he is the Park Steward for the Pink Triangle Park. There is a lot of community interest in the park. The park honors LGBT victims of the Holocaust. Tour groups and individuals jaywalk to get there because there is no crosswalk. In the interest of pedestrian safety, he would like to see crosswalks leading to the park added to the Upper Market Street Safety Project. There are plans to make the park ADA accessible. The Castro Muni station has a small group that want to demolish it.

David Pilpel stated that the Public Outreach and Engagement Team Strategy (POETS) is different than efforts at City Hall and efforts around the Agency to try and make things better. There are a lot of things going on so it should be clear. Several responses on the requests for information matrix say there was no analysis done. He stated that he doesn't want to have to follow up with a public records request. He doesn't need an exact answer, he just wants an order of magnitude on the fare policy options. It is not clear what the format is or what the public should anticipate for the budget town hall meeting. He expressed concern as to whether it will be worth the public's time to attend and inquired if the SFMTA is going to do anything different as a result of the meeting.

#### REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding improvements to public notification standards. (Deanna Desedas, Manager, Public Outreach & Engagement. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Lulu Feliciano presented the item. She discussed the requirements for public outreach and engagement and the resources to build skills and support staff. She stated that the SFMTA is committed to not only support project delivery to benefit the City but to engage community members as well.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason expressed support for the POETS program. He stated that he has attended some of the meetings and there were just poster boards and post it notes. There is no engagement. Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority does poster boards and then has a conversation with the people in the audience. The Haight Ashbury Neighborhood Council has a lot of unhappy campers. They were totally against having bikes take up sidewalk space. Ford Go Bike being is imposed on them. It was a disaster.

John Goldsmith asked who the District Liaison is for the Castro and Market area. He stated that the property owner next door to the Castro Muni station offered \$500,000 to do a memorial improvement to Harvey Milk Plaza. Then, a group came along and asked to demolish the Castro Muni station. The community is very upset because they are trying to refurbish a beautiful train station. It's a beautiful piece of architecture and the only Muni

station with open space and landscaping. The group has total disregard. The community is being silenced and not listened to. They are wondering where Muni falls into all of this.

David Pilpel expressed support for POETS. He stated that it is important that the rest of the Agency get on board with POETS, not just Lulu Feliciano, Deanna Desedas, and their staff. He stated it should also be applied to other city agencies. This is one of the things that are happening to try to fix the SFMTA. Otherwise there are charter amendments and all kinds of things the SFMTA must deal with because one thing didn't get dealt with properly on the front end. This is part of rebuilding trust between the agency and the community because it is fractured. People aren't happy with the way the SFMTA does things. The CAC should be an important entity in this Agency.

8. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the SFMTA FY 2019-2020 Budget. (Sonalı Bose, Director, Finance & Information Technology. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Sonalı Bose presented the item.

9. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Operations and Customer Service Committee (OCSC) report and recommendations.

CAC MOTION 180301.01 (OCSC Motion 180213.01)

The SFMTA CAC recommends continuing and expanding the Muni etiquette campaign.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

10. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Engineering, Maintenance and Safety Committee (EMSC) report and recommendations.

This item will be discussed at the March 22<sup>nd</sup> special CAC meeting.

11. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the Finance and Administration Committee (FAC) report and recommendations.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason stated that Santa Clara Valley Transportation (VTA) Ordinance 98.1 says use of VTA property is charged market rate. There's precedence that VTA says charge market rate.

Everybody doesn't want to pay full freight. The revenue generated flows to the operating VTA fund.

CAC MOTION 180301.02 (FAC Motion 180221.01)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 1 to maintain fares for Single Ride fares for Clipper/Muni Mobile.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.03 (FAC Motion 180221.02)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 2B to limit 'A' pass to a 20% premium above the 'M' pass.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.04 (FAC Motion 180221.03)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 3 to implement fare differentials for visitor passports.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.05 (FAC Motion 180221.04)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 4 to adopt a new low-income single ride fare product.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

FAC Motion 180221.05

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 5A to implement a new day pass at two times the regular fare.

On motion to amend to change “5A” to “5B” and change “two” to “two and a half”:

FAILED ADOPTION: AYES – Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Cesar Magdaleno, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
NAYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Joan Downey, Daniel Murphy  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC Motion 180301.06 (FAC Motion 180221.05)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 5A to implement a new day pass at two times the regular fare.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.07 (FAC Motion 180221.06)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 6 to authorize a 10% discount for bulk purchases of 100 or more Cable Car tickets and Passports.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda  
ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.08 (FAC Motion 180221.07)

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 7 to expand the use of institutional pass models to other groups and organizations.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

FAC Motion 180221.08

The SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to hold a public hearing before April 17<sup>th</sup> on fee setting for commuter shuttles and private transportation vehicles that use City streets as places of enterprise for private gain to consider establishing additional, non-regulatory, revenue generating fees for the benefit of the SFMTA. A privileged and confidential city attorney memo exists that addresses the matter of fees that can be charged for use of city streets as places of enterprise for private gain. Publically available evidence indicates that the SFMTA can charge more.

On motion to amend to add “to consider raising fees to fair market value for commuter shuttles and private transportation vehicles e.g. Chariot” and strike “A privileged and confidential city attorney memo exists that addresses the matter of fees that can be charged for use of city streets as places of enterprise for private gain. Publically available evidence indicates that the SFMTA can charge more.”:

ADOPTED: AYES –Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Steve Taber and Dorris Vincent

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.09

The SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to consider raising fees to fair market value for commuter shuttles and private transportation vehicles e.g. Chariot that use City streets as places of enterprise for private gain to consider establishing additional, non-regulatory, revenue-generating fees for the benefit of the SFMTA.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Steve Taber and Dorris Vincent

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

FAC Motion 180221.09

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA use some population-based Prop B funds for operating instead of capital. Future capital projects should have operations costs factored into their budgets.

On motion to amend to add “for FY19 and FY20 budget” and strike “Future capital projects should have operations costs factored into their budgets.”:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Steve Taber

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.10

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA use some population-based Prop B funds for operating instead of capital for FY19 and FY20 budget.

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda

NAYES – Steve Taber

ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

CAC MOTION 180301.11

The SFMTA CAC recommends future capital projects should have operations costs factored into their budgets.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard, Mark Ballew, Barbara Bocci, Jarie Bolander, Joan Downey, Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Murphy, Steve Taber, Susan Vaughan, Dorris Vincent, and Frank Zepeda



ABSENT – Stephen Cornell, Michael Eshleman, and Daniel Weaver

12. Council Member Information and Agenda Item Requests. (For discussion only)

No requests.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Edward Mason recommended a presentation on why the subway is dysfunctional and having problems. There is still bunching and gapping on the J Church line. There should be a presentation on subway operations.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 8:56 p.m.

Submitted by:



Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next meeting: Thursday, March 22<sup>nd</sup> at 5:30pm (special)  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor, Union Square Conference Room, #7080