



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

**MEETING MINUTES** • Meeting Date: Tuesday, November 7, 2023

## REGULAR MEETING

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
Room 400, City Hall

Members of the SFMTA Board of Directors will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every action or discussion item.

In addition to in-person public comment, the Board will hear up to 10 minutes of remote public comment on each action or discussion item. The Board will hear remote public comment on items in the order that commenters add themselves to the queue to comment on the item. Because of the 10-minute time limit, it is possible that not every person in the queue will have an opportunity to provide remote public comment. Remote public comment from people who have received an accommodation due to disability (as described below) will not count toward the 10-minute limit.

Members of the public are encouraged to provide public comment via email. Send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm the day before the meeting to ensure your comment is received by the Board in advance of the meeting.

## REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE) or  
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-november-7-2023>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 ACCESS CODE: 2662 744 8044

## SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Amanda Eaken, Chair  
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair  
Steve Heminger  
Dominica Henderson  
Fiona Hinze  
Lydia So

## DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Jeffrey Tumlin

## BOARD SECRETARY

Christine Silva



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Eaken called the meeting to order at 1:05pm.

Board Secretary Silva announced the 10-minute time limit for remote public comment.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Steve Heminger  
Dominica Henderson  
Fiona Hinze  
Lydia So  
Amanda Eaken

Absent (with notification): Stephanie Cajina

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the October 17, 2023, Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, and Eaken  
ABSENT – Cajina

### 5. Communications

None.

### 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Chair Eaken recognized former Director Manny Yekutieli for his service on the Board.

Directors Heminger, So, Henderson, and Hinze appreciated Director Yekutieli for his work.

Director Yekutieli reflected on his service on the Board.



PUBLIC COMMENT:

Speaker thanked Director Yekutieli for his joy, patience, humor, and service.

7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Special Recognition
- Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation Leaders Meeting
- Autonomous Vehicles Update
- Funding for Transit Operations and Bikeshare
- Ongoing Activities

Director Tumlin introduced Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, and Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer, who recognized Leslie Bienenfeld, Manager of the Transit Special Operations, and Diana Hammons, Senior Manager of Revenue Collection & Sales, for their contributions to Outside Lands.

Director Tumlin shared about the upcoming Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation Leaders Meeting (APEC), autonomous vehicles (AV), state funding distribution, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission's (MTC) bikeshare investment and expansion, a recent committee meeting for the International Association of Public Transit (UITP) and North America Workshop on Zero Emission Fleets, a recent racial equity event with the Office of Racial Equity and Belonging, and about the Bus Rodeo.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Speaker reflected on the future and expressed concern about bikes.

Mark Leeson expressed concern about AVs and AV crashes, applauding City Attorney David Chiu's efforts to challenge the state decision and urging the SFMTA to join the effort.

Stacey Randecker shared that the AV issue is a people issue, urged the City to use APEC resources for San Franciscans, and was supportive of the bikeshare funding.

Pete Wilson expressed concern about APEC impacts and asked staff supervisors for patience towards transit operators.

Luke Bornheimer commented on AVs and asked AV companies to instead fund the SFMTA.

Herbert Weiner urged the SFMTA to add more trolleys to the fleet.



Barry Taranto commented on APEC, asked that taxi stop information be shared, and expressed concern for residents that live near Moscone Center.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

No report.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Anthony Ballester expressed concern for senior transit operators and their inability to go on vacation.

Kate Blumberg commented on the 48 Quintara/24th Street bus line, expressed concern for students getting skipped at bus stops near schools, and shared that bus reliability is critical.

Stacey Randecker commented about decision making and taking into consideration the City's Transit First principles when making decisions.

Fred Muhlheim expressed support for transit and shared concern about the Frida Kahlo Quick-Build Project.

Speaker expressed concern about a lack of parking, impacts to small businesses, and asked the SFMTA to add more parking.

Wendy expressed concern about removing parking and the need for a car for basic needs such as grocery shopping.

Li Chun Li expressed concern about parking availability in Chinatown and hoped that a lot could be opened there.

Speaker expressed concern about parking availability and asked the SFMTA to create more parking so that the elderly and working people could travel more easily.

Speaker expressed concern about unreliable transit and asked the SFMTA to move bicycle parking to the sidewalk to open up more parking on the curb.

Rex Ridgeway urged the SFMTA to increase bus service due to pass ups at schools.



Julia Toscano shared her experience about parking citations received while living near and attending San Francisco State University.

Jenny expressed concern about parking and asked for more angled parking in the Sunset neighborhood.

Pete Wilson expressed concern about treatment of fare inspectors.

Josephine expressed concern for multi-generational families that live in Chinatown, sharing that cars are needed for basic needs.

Luke Bornheimer urged the Board to approve a no turn on red citywide policy and expressed concern about Valencia Street crash and injury data.

Herbert Weiner commented about remote public comment and urged the SFMTA to add more buses to the fleet.

Adam expressed concern about street safety in the SoMA neighborhood and about safety on Valencia Street.

Speaker urged the SFMTA to improve bus service for students, adding that poor service leads to truancy and attendance issues for the school district.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA (Explanatory documents include a resolution.):



- A. Mohammed Samer Jabri v. SFMTA, Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-22-602481 filed 10/19/2022 for \$1,690 (SFMTA to receive). City’s Cross-complaint involving allegations of property damage to City property (Plaintiff vehicle and revenue vehicle).
- B. Dennis Alberto Diaz Mejia v. Adebiyi Shamonda, et al., Superior Ct. Case No. CGC-22-601228 filed 08/12/2022 for \$40,000. Lawsuit involving allegations of personal injury from operator negligence (Plaintiff vehicle and revenue vehicle).

RESOLUTION No. 231107-086

- 10.2. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications and making environmental review findings: (The Planning Department has found that Items A-D are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. For these parking and traffic modifications that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

- ~~A. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA HV.~~
- B. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA X – 301 Rhode Island Street, 370 De Haro Street.
- C. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA I 991 Valencia Street.
- D. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA G – 1659 Divisadero Street.

Board Secretary Silva announced that Item 10.1A was removed and would be heard at a future meeting.

RESOLUTION No. 231107-087

- 10.3. Authorizing the Director of Transportation, or their designee, to execute a grant agreement, and any amendments to such grant agreement, with the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) to receive \$1,322,832 in discretionary funding for the SFMTA’s Embarcadero Mobility Resilience Plan. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 231107-088

- 10.4. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to approve amendments to two As-Needed Specialized Training Services contracts: (1) Amendment No. 6 to Contract No. SFMTA-18-39-A with Moran Consulting, Inc. to extend the contract duration 15 months beyond the contract’s 5-year term, and to increase the contract amount by \$1,000,000 from a not-to-exceed amount of \$3,821,598.22 to a not-to-exceed



amount of \$4,821,598.22; and (2) Amendment No. 3 to Contract No. SFMTA-18-39-B with DTUI.com LLC to extend the contract duration 15 months beyond the contract's 5-year term without increasing the not-to-exceed amount of \$3,000,000. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 231107-089

- 10.5. Approving a reduced Roadway Shared Spaces Closure of Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets, 4 pm to 10 pm each Friday and 1 pm to 10 pm each Saturday from November 10, 2023, through Saturday, October 19, 2024, consistent with the SFMTA Board of Director's recommendation given at the October 17, 2023 Board meeting (application from the Hayes Valley Merchant's Council for a Roadway Shared Spaces permit is to close Hayes Street between Gough and Octavia streets Fridays from 4 pm to 10 pm, and Saturdays and Sundays from 10 am to 10 pm); and making environmental review findings. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 231107-090

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: David Robinson (10.5), Robin Blenden (10.5), Andrew Signer (10.5), Jennifer Laskin (10.5), Adam (10.5), and Susan (10.5)

Members of the public expressing opposition: Stacey Randecker (10.5), Alan Burdell (10.5), Richard Johnson (10.5), and Barry Taranto (10.5)

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Stacey Randecker (10.3)

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar:

ADOPTED:       AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, and Eaken  
                  ABSENT – Cajina

**REGULAR CALENDAR**

11. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to issue a Request for Proposals for Contract No. SFMTA-2024-20-FTA for Consulting Services supporting the Communications-Based Train Control Upgrade Project for an initial term of five years in an amount not to exceed \$25,000,000, with five options to extend the term for an additional year, for a total of ten



years in an amount not to exceed \$36,000,000. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Dan Howard, Train Control Upgrade Project Manager, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Aleta Dupree

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED:       AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, and Eaken  
                  ABSENT – Cajina

RESOLUTION No. 231107-091

12. Approving an amendment to the SFMTA's Zero Emission Vehicle (ZEV) Policy to allow for future trolleybus acquisition and extend the timeline for achieving a 100% zero emission fleet to align with the California Air Resources Board's (CARB) Innovative Clean Transit (ICT) regulation timeline, which is currently 2040. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Alex Lantsberg, Mark Sawchuk, Stacey Randecker, Cyrus Hall, Peter Straus, and Herbert Weiner

Members of the public expressing opposition: Pete Wilson

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Aleta Dupree and Speaker

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED:       AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, and Eaken  
                  ABSENT – Cajina

RESOLUTION No. 231107-092





**ADJOURN** – Chair Eaken adjourned the meeting at 4:39pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Christine Silva', is positioned above the printed name.

Christine Silva  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving



such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.