



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

The following cost analysis is in support of proposed amendments to the Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA) between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and the Transport Workers’ Union (TWU), Local 200. The analysis below covers three proposed changes:

- 1) to add three classifications to the existing Expert Employee Premium
- 2) to adjust the base wage rate of class 7412 to match the Citywide pay rate, and
- 3) to adjust the start time to qualify for Night Duty Pay for class 8121 only.

First Proposed Change:

Addition of 7412, 9144, and 9520 Classifications to the Expert Employee Premium

Cost Analysis

The three proposed changes included in this Side Letter reflect additions to existing programs that are included in the current [Collective Bargaining Agreement \(CBA\) between the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency \(SFMTA\) and the Transport Workers’ Union \(TWU\), Local 200 covering the period of July 1, 2022 to June 30, 2024.](#)

TOPIC	FIRST PROPOSED CHANGE	FY2023-24
Expert Employee Premium	Addition of the 7412 Automotive Service Worker Assistant Supervisor using existing criteria.	25,365
Expert Employee Premium	Addition of the 9144 Investigator, Taxi & Accessible Services using modified criteria.	81,515
Expert Employee Premium	Addition of the 9520 Transportation Safety Specialist using existing criteria.	139,156
Total (\$)		246,036

The proposal included in this Side Letter reflects an estimated cost to SFMTA of \$246,036 in FY 2023-24. According to the Finance, Information and Technology Division, funds are available to cover these costs and will be funded by the FY 2023-24 SFMTA operating budget and does not require a supplemental appropriation.

The cost analysis above is based on a head count of budgeted positions and distribution of Tiers 1, 2 and 3 based on the past year of Premium eligibility for existing classifications. The table below reflects the fiscal impact in year 2023-24, which is the point in time when the new classifications would earn a premium according to Tiers 1, 2, and 3. The sum of this impacts equals \$246,036.00.



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

Job Code	Job Description	FTE	FY2024			
			Hrly Rate	Premium	SS/Unempl/ LTD	Increase (plus SS/Unempl/ LTD)
Tier 1 @ 2%						
7412	Automotive Service Worker Assistant Sprv	-	\$46.99	\$0.94	8.14%	\$0
9520	Transportation Safety Specialist	9.00	\$73.65	\$1.47	8.14%	\$29,819
9144	Investigator, Taxi and Accessible Servic	6.00	\$60.40	\$1.21	8.14%	\$16,303
Total tier 1		15.00				\$46,122
Tier 2 @ 4%						
7412	Automotive Service Worker Assistant Sprv		\$44.91	\$1.80	8.14%	\$0
9520	Transportation Safety Specialist		\$73.65	\$1.47	8.14%	
9144	Investigator, Taxi and Accessible Servic		\$60.40	\$1.21	8.14%	
Total tier 2		-				\$0
Tier 3 @ 6%						
7412	Automotive Service Worker Assistant Sprv	4.00	\$46.99	\$2.82	8.14%	\$25,365
9520	Transportation Safety Specialist	11.00	\$73.65	\$4.42	8.14%	\$109,337
9144	Investigator, Taxi and Accessible Servic	8.00	\$60.40	\$3.62	8.14%	\$65,212
Total tier 3		23.00				\$199,914
Total		38.00				\$246,036

Comparison of proposed changes to the current CBA

Expert Employee Premiums are discussed in Article III.C, Section 15, of the current CBA, which is reprinted here:

Current CBA (Article III.C, Section 15)

Effective the first pay cycle in July 2022, employees in the 9136 Training Specialist, 9139 Transit Supervisor, 9153 Transportation Controller, and 9160 Transit Operations Specialist classifications who meet the criteria below shall be paid an Expert Premium as follows:

- 1) Tier 1: Employees will be paid a Tier 1 Premium of two percent (2%) of the hourly rate of pay per hour for all pay periods in which they meet all of the following conditions:



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

- a. Worked at least 1776 regular hours (excluding overtime hours but including time the employee would have worked but for leave taken under the Family and Medical Leave Act, the California Family Rights Act, the Uniformed Services Employment and Re-Employment Rights Act, California Kin Care, or as required by law) in the previous twelve (12) months;
 - b. No AWOL occurrences in the previous twelve (12) month period;
 - c. Served no disciplinary suspensions in the previous twelve (12) month period;
 - d. Employees in classification 9139 who have not voluntarily transferred out of a VTP assignment in the previous three (3) years and who meet all the rest of the qualifications for this premium will receive an additional zero point five percent (0.5%).
- 2) Tier 2: Employees will be paid a Tier 2 Premium of four percent (4%) of the hourly rate of pay per hour for all pay periods in which they meet all of the following conditions:
- a. All requirements of Tier 1;
 - b. No more than one hundred four (104) hours of unscheduled absences (excluding bereavement leave and jury duty) in the previous twelve (12) month period;
 - c. No substantiated violations of safety rules in the previous twelve (12) month period;
 - d. Employees in classification 9139 who have not voluntarily transferred out of a VTP assignment in the previous six (6) years and who meet all the rest of the qualifications for this premium will receive an additional one percent (1%).
- 3) Tier 3: Employees will be paid a Tier 3 Premium of six percent (6%) of the hourly rate of pay per hour for all pay periods in which they meet all of the following conditions:
- a. All requirements of Tiers 1 and 2;



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

- b. No fit for duty infractions as defined in sections 2.6 and 2.28 of the SFMTA Rules and Instructions Handbook, as may be amended from time to time, in the previous twelve (12) month period;
- c. Employees in classification 9139 who have not voluntarily transferred out of a VTP assignment in the previous nine (9) years and who meet all the rest of the qualifications for this premium will receive an additional one-point-five percent (1.5%).

Addition of the 7412 Automotive Service Worker Assistant Supervisor classification follows the existing criteria in the parties' CBA. The parties have agreed to explicitly include the 7412 classification into this provision of the parties' successor CBA in 2024.

Premiums for the 9144 Investigator, Taxi & Accessible Services classification will use different criteria than that set forth in the parties' CBA, as follows:

- 1) Tier 1: Employees will be paid a Tier 1 Premium of two percent (2%) of the hourly rate of pay per hour for all pay periods in which they meet all of the following conditions:
 - a. Worked at least 1776 regular hours (excluding overtime hours but including time the employee would have worked but for leave taken under the Family and Medical Leave Act, the California Family Rights Act, the Uniformed Services Employment and Re-Employment Rights Act, California Kin Care, or as required by law) in the previous twelve (12) months;
 - b. Conducted enforcement activities in all of the following permit programs in the previous twelve (12) month period:
 - Taxis
 - Commuter Shuttles
 - Electric Scooters
 - Bikeshare
 - c. Served no disciplinary suspensions in the previous twelve (12) month period.
- 2) Tier 2: Employees will be paid a Tier 2 Premium of four percent (4%) of the hourly rate of pay per hour for all pay periods in which they meet all of the following conditions:



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

- a. All requirements of Tier 1;
 - b. Of the employee’s agreed upon regular schedule in the previous twelve (12) month period, at least 25% of the hours were outside of the regular business hours of Monday through Friday, 09:00 to 17:00;
 - c. No substantiated violations of safety rules in the previous twelve (12) month period.
- 3) Tier 3: Employees will be paid a Tier 3 Premium of six percent (6%) of the hourly rate of pay per hour for all pay periods in which they meet all of the following conditions:
- a. All requirements of Tiers 1 and 2;
 - b. Received no written reprimands or written warnings in the previous twelve (12) month period.

The parties agree to incorporate the newly agreed upon terms into the parties’ successor CBA in 2024.

Addition of the 9520 Transportation Safety Specialist follows the existing criteria in the parties’ CBA. The parties have agreed to explicitly include the 9520 classification in this provision of the parties’ successor CBA in 2024.

**Second Proposed Change:
 Adjustment of 7412 Base Wage Rate**

Cost Analysis

TOPIC	SECOND PROPOSED CHANGE	FY2023-24
7412 Automotive Service Worker Assistant Supervisor City Pay Parity	Adjust base wage rate for the 7412 classification to match the base wage rate of the 7412 under the Citywide CBA, as required by the Charter, retroactive to the start of the current CBA term.	
Total (\$)		26,927

The second proposal included in this Side Letter reflects an estimated cost to SFMTA of \$20,287 in FY 2023-24. According to the Finance, Information and Technology Division, funds are available to



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

cover these costs and will be funded by the FY 2023-24 SFMTA operating budget and does not require a supplemental appropriation.

Cost is a combination of retroactive pay, which is based on actual salary costs for class 7412 Automotive Service Worker Assistant Supervisor in FY2022-23, and estimated pay for FY2023-24, which is based on budgeted headcount for the 7412. The table below reflects the fiscal impact in the years 2023 and 2024. The sum of these impacts equals \$26,924.00.

	FY2023	FY2024
Current SFMTA Rate for 7412	\$44.53	\$45.64
Proposed Rate for 7412	\$45.84	\$46.99
Hourly Rate Increase	\$1.31	\$1.35
FTE	4.00	4.00
Variable Fringe Rate	21.54%	21.54%
Pay Increase for 7412	\$13,272	\$13,651

Comparison of proposed changes to the current CBA

Adjusting the base wage rate for the 7412 classification to match the base wage rate of the 7412 under the Citywide CBA, retroactive to July 1, 2022, may require an amendment to the Citywide compensation manual but will not require an amendment to the parties’ current CBA because there is no prior agreement in the CBA on this topic. However, the parties agree to incorporate the agreed upon terms into the parties’ successor CBA in 2024. Specifically, the parties agree, that once the current MOU expires, the successor CBA will include the following term:

1. Retroactive to July 1, 2022, the base wage rate for the 7412 Automotive Service Worker Assistant Supervisor at SFMTA shall be the same as the base wage of the 7412 under the Citywide CBA.

**Third Proposed Change:
 Adjustment of Night Duty Pay Start Time for 8121 Classification**

TOPIC	THIRD PROPOSED CHANGE	FY2023-24
Night Duty for 8121 Fare Inspections Supervisor/ Investigator	Adjust the start time to qualify for Night Duty Pay, for Class 8121 only, to align with status quo hours of service in place since 2020.	\$0
Total (\$)		\$0

The proposal included in this Side Letter reflects no cost to SFMTA in FY 2023-24.



Costing Analysis and Executive Summary of Side Letter Proposals

This Side Letter will align the CBA with the status quo but will not represent any change in practice or in costs.

Comparison of proposed changes to the current CBA

Adjusting the start time to qualify for Night Duty Pay, for Class 8121 will not require an amendment to the parties' current CBA because there is no prior agreement in the CBA on this topic. However, the parties agree to incorporate the agreed upon terms into the parties' successor CBA in 2024. Specifically, the parties agree, that once the current MOU expires, the successor CBA will include the following terms:

1. Retroactive to July 1, 2022, employees in classification 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisors shall be paid eight and one half percent (8.5%) more than the base rate for each hour actually worked between 3:00 p.m. and 12:00 a.m. (swing), except for those employees working a normal shift in excess of eight (8) hours per day that requires work between the hours of 3:00 p.m. and 12:00a.m. Employees working at least five (5) hours of their regular shift between 3:00 p.m. and 12:00 a.m. shall receive the 8.5% differential for the entire shift. Night shift premium shall be paid only for days and hours actually worked, as set forth above, except for statutory holidays and vacation days.