

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



Interview Synopsis

Between March and June of 2018, the project team conducted interviews with fourteen community leaders in the Bayview. These interviews were supplemented by another four interviews conducted by the SFCTA D10 Mobility Study team. The purpose of these community interviews was to gain a strong context for the needs of Bayview residents, build trust and familiarity with the project in the community, and test what kinds of outreach approaches and messaging would resonate best with Bayview residents.

The initial community leader interview list was developed jointly with the District 10 Supervisor's office. Subsequent community leaders were identified on the recommendations of interviewees. The list of interviewees were:

- Shakirah Simley – Executive Director, Southeast Community Facility
- Tim Chan & Chris Waddling – Bayview CAC Commissioners
- Earl Shaddix – Director, Economic Development on Third
- Michael Janis – Executive Director, SF Wholesale Market
- Rey Guerrero – La Laguna Tacqueria & Bayview Merchants Association
- Cathy Davis – Executive Director, Bayview Senior Center
- Jackie Flin – Executive Director, A Philip Randolph Institute
- James Evans – Operating Manager, Bayview Moves
- Tyra Fennel – Founder, Imprint City
- Taylor Booker – Resident Services Coordinator, SFHDC
- Tacing Parker – Assistant Executive Director, Bayview YMCA
- Takai Tyler – Executive Director, Hunters Point Family
- Sophie Maxwell – Former D 10 Supervisor
- Diane Gray – Southeast Community Facility Commission
- Andre Aikins – Operations Manager, Alive & Free – *SFCTA interview*
- Christina Olague – Family services, El Centro Bayview branch – *SFCTA interview*
- Eddy Zheng – Community Youth Center (CYC) – *SFCTA interview*
- Shamann Walton – Young Community Developers – *SFCTA interview*

During this period, the Bayview CBTP project team also presented to the Bayview Community Advisory Commission, the Shipyard Community Advisory Commission, the Bayview Hill Neighborhood Association, Bayview Residents Improving Their Environment (BRITE), and the BMAGIC convener's meeting. Also during this period, the Bayview CBTP team tabled at the Black Cuisine Festival and at Sunday Streets. Input received at all of these events was incorporated into our interview synopsis.

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



Stakeholder Synopsis

SFMTA's staff is cognizant of the expressed recommendations and has adapted the planning process in order to address expressed concerns, desires and needs of the community stakeholders. The Project Team will be developing a Promise to the Public to portray how the plan will be developed, how input will be incorporated, and how we will communicate and engage with the public.

What We Heard: Recommendations for Community Engagement Approach

The top recommendations for Community Engagement are:

- Be clear about how community input impacts the plan, specific project timelines, and investments
- Demonstrate understanding of displacement in the Bayview and prioritize equity
- Utilize CBOs to reach key community groups
- Use simplicity and culturally competent messaging
- Make public participation as convenient and inviting as possible
- Incentivize participation through offering essential services (food & child care)

Importance of Clarity and Transparency

It's important that the Bayview community understands directly how their voice is heard and listened to. The quickest way to lose trust in the community is to promise a certain level of control over a project, only to disregard community-based decisions at a later date. Clarity and transparency can help the community better understand their ability to influence the project.

"Explain the decision making process – it's unfair and frustrating for the community when they provide feedback and results do not represent their input without any explanation provided."

- San Francisco Housing Development Corporation

When residents understand the value of their voice and exactly how it is being used to shape the plan, there is greater incentive to participate and trust the process. Transparency in schedule and committed funding for plan implementation is critical; residents have no interest in vague promises of future funding. Giving concrete figures and dates to work with makes the project feel more real and signals a real commitment on the agency's part.

Equity and Displacement Concerns

The SFMTA needs to proactively address concerns about displacement in the Bayview and clearly communicate that the Community Based Transportation Plan is for the benefit of the current community.

"It is a concern that the plans for the future of the Bayview would be unraveled in a way that could further displacement of current residents, and tailoring investment to a younger, whiter community."

- Imprint City

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



“The concern of being displaced can hold priority over the concern about transportation.”

- *Alive & Free*

The SFMTA needs to understand the “how” and “why” people travel to, from, and within the Bayview. Understanding these details will help ensure the CBTP addresses barriers that prevent residents from traveling in different (and more sustainable) ways. There are persistent gaps in transportation services for the most vulnerable in the Bayview, and any plan must center on their needs.

Use Culturally Appropriate Messaging

The Bayview is home to a broad range of cultures and backgrounds; simplicity of messaging for the CBTP is crucial. SFMTA cannot expect the same message to carry equivalent meaning across the Bayview.

“Be aware about how the language utilized can further stigma in the community.”

- *Sophie Maxwell, Former D 10 Supervisor*

Today’s political environment can induce fear among communities of color (especially Latinx), serving as a barrier to engage with government officials; this was reinforced by representatives from El Centro. Outreach through the CBTP should offer inclusive language, inviting the voices of the Bayview’s vulnerable communities and promoting their willingness to participate in the plan process.

Recommended Meeting & Outreach Logistics

SFMTA needs to make a commitment to hosting meetings at times and locations that are convenient for families, offering incentives to ensure outreach events are welcoming and convenient for families.

“Provision of child care and/or food is essential.”

- *San Francisco Housing Development Cooperation*

Attending traditional public meetings or workshops can be very low in priority for residents who work irregular hours or multiple jobs to provide their families with basic needs. SFMTA needs to make a commitment to hosting meetings at times and locations that are convenient for families. Interviewed stakeholders offered recommendations for events SFMTA could host that are accessible to the community.

SFMTA’s Promise to the Bayview: Community Engagement Approach

The following table summarizes the response/actions made by the SFMTA Project Team to address recommendations for the Community Engagement Approach:

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



What We Heard	Our Response
<p>Importance of Clarity and Transparency</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Residents desire to know exactly how their input is valued and that they are being listened to Previous incidents have left the community frustrated when community members have offered feedback, and the results didn't represent their input Desire among community to understand timeline and budget process Clarity about when change will be visible/on the ground 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff is developing a Promise to the Public plan to directly describe how input will be incorporated and how we will communicate with the public Staff has added clear, upfront information on funding and the schedule to the project webpage
<p>Equity and Displacement Concerns</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fear of displacement may be a priority over transportation changes Planners need to understand the "how" and "why" behind commuting patterns in the Bayview 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff has incorporated language to stress that the plan is for the current community Staff conducted 14 interviews and reviewed 19 plans to build off past efforts and gain context of community needs
<p>Use Culturally Appropriate Messaging</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Understand the power of language – especially in furthering stigma With many cultures in the Bayview, a single messaging approach will not reach everyone Inclusive language is essential 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff is working with CBOs to design outreach, language, and organize event venues that will emphasize the resident-led nature of the CBTP The Public Outreach Plan developed different messaging for different groups in the Bayview
<p>Meeting & Outreach Recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Host meetings in convenient locations and incentivize attendance through food and child-care Public engagement may be a low-priority for families working to meet their essential needs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Staff intends to build on existing events in Bayview and encourage engagement through less traditional means Staff is working with CBOs to make community involvement as convenient as possible

What We Heard: Key Groups for Outreach and Engagement

Stakeholders have suggested six groups within the Bayview that are crucial to involve in terms of outreach and resources:

- Residents of affordable housing
- Latinx community
- Black/African American community
- Asian American community
- Youth
- Seniors & residents with a disability

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



In addition to those six key groups, stakeholders also identified local businesses along 3rd Street, industrial businesses in the northwest, and faith-based organizations as groups in need of special consideration.

Representation matters for the Bayview community. Working with community-based organizations (CBOs) will be a crucial tool in ensuring representation for key groups throughout the outreach process. Many recommendations were provided as to the best ways to engage with people across the socio-economic and demographic spectrums in the Bayview including, but not limited to:

- Farmers Market booth/presence
- Work with Street Teams to reach youth
- Connect with businesses through both the Bayview and Butchertown Merchants Associations
- Engage with affordable housing tenant associations
- Involve the Southeast Community Facility Commission

Barriers to participation for seniors is a challenge, as existing options (e.g. smartphone app rides, cabs, paratransit, and public transit) all have serious limitations for them. Many families are in *survival mode* – where participation in the development of the CBTP is the least of their concern. Residents in affordable housing often feel like there is no real incentive for their participation.

SFMTA's Promise to the Bayview: How We'll Reach Key Groups

In order to best reach these key communities, SFMTA has to:

- *Partner with CBOs that focus on reaching the above suggested key groups: affordable housing residents, youth, Latinx, Black/African American, Asian, and senior residents.*
- *Offer food, drink, and childcare at engagement events to help reduce barriers and offer incentives for community involvement.*
- *Utilize connections with CBOs that emphasize cross-cultural collaboration to help facilitate cross-cultural dialogue.*

What We Heard: Focus Areas for Plan Recommendations

Top recommendations for plan focus include:

- Regional circulation and coordination with other projects
- Personal safety and security, especially on transit & at transit stops
- Relationship between transportation infrastructure and gentrification
- More programming and education

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



Regional Circulation and Coordination

Addressing challenges of regional circulation and coordination through intersectional solutions is a key recommendation. There is a strong desire to expand east-west transit connections within and beyond the Bayview.

“You cannot just make it harder for people to drive, [you] need to incentivize and provide other options that are reliable and affordable.”
- Sophie Maxwell, Former D 10 Supervisor

Addressing multi-modal transportation solutions will be crucial for the development of the CBTP, especially considering the existing popularity of shuttles and car-share services in the community. SFMTA is currently coordinating with all ongoing transportation projects in the Bayview to develop holistic, comprehensive solutions.

Personal Safety and Security

Safety is a concern in the Bayview, and the reputation of the region’s safety has an extensive impact on transportation options and access in the region.

“Uber doesn’t even drop people off. Pizza or food delivery would not go to certain deliveries. Even the police don’t go into certain areas.”
- Community Youth Center of San Francisco

“There’s a lot of violence around bus stops. Not just petty fights, but actual murders. People need to feel safe if you want them to use transit.”
- San Francisco Housing Development Cooperation

The reputation of safety and security in the Bayview has an extensive impact on the transportation options that residents can access. Residents have concerns for personal safety while riding and/or waiting for the T-Third line and buses, especially in the evenings. Concern of personal safety for transit drivers, TNC services (i.e., Uber/Lyft) has a negative impact on the community’s transportation options, especially commuting to and from T-Third and walkability along 3rd Street.

Relationship between Transportation Infrastructure and Displacement

Transportation infrastructure’s potential for displacement was real concern among many interviewees.

“They [SFMTA] tried doing bike lanes, but bike lanes make people think of gentrification and they don’t like it. In response, they should have seen this context, and found a way to show residents that they are for them, not just new residents, by doing targeted outreach and training on bikes/bike lanes.”
- A Philip Randolph Institute

Through a more intersectional approach, SFMTA can frame transportation infrastructure changes into goals to improve the everyday quality of life and mobility options for the Bayview

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



community. New infrastructure, such as bike lanes, needs to be accompanied by targeted outreach and training to help ensure residents know that these changes are for *them*. New mobility technology, such as Uber, Lyft, Lime Bike, Scoot, etc. are commonly understood as “a visual reminder of gentrification” and displacement (Parker, YMCA).

More Programming and Education

Discussing the benefits and impacts of the changing transportation landscape (i.e., Uber, Lyft, Bike-share, Chariot, etc.) within the community will be a key step in ensuring that the CBTP is well received and understood by the Bayview community.

“If you don’t have a transit corridor that works, meaning that it is reliable, affordable, efficient, and gets you where you need to go – then you have a car in the Bayview.”

- *Sophie Maxwell, Former D 10 Supervisor*

BAYVIEW COMMUNITY BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN



SFMTA’s Promise to the Bayview: What We’re Doing

The following table intends to summarize what the SFMTA Project Team heard, and what our responses are to those points:

What We Heard	Our Response
<p>Regional Circulation and Coordination</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desire to see better east-west connections and connections to the greater San Francisco • Build on existing services, such as popular car-share and shuttle services • Cannot just made it harder for one mode, easier for another, and expect to see change – need to offer reliable and affordable alternatives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inter-agency coordination to build-in transit improvement projects to Bayview to maximize transit access & reliability • Participatory budgeting exercise now incorporates car-share and community shuttles as potential projects • Potential projects will assess impacts on residents & modes
<p>Personal Safety and Security</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reputation of crime leads to limited services that reach the Bayview (e.g., Uber/Lyft, pizza delivery, etc.) • Personal safety concerns when riding, and commuting to/from T-Third and transit stops • Pedestrian safety issues along 3rd Street 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff is incorporating analysis of crime data on transit and around transit stops to existing conditions assessment • The plan will focus on addressing access to transit, including comfort and safety
<p>Relationship between Transportation Infrastructure and Displacement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Desire to see connection between transportation infrastructure and displacement in the plan • Without targeted education and outreach, community may not see that changes are for them • Concern that mobility technology signals gentrification and displacement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All proposed projects will be analyzed for potential negative impacts on vulnerable populations in the Bayview. • Outreach will include open discussion on displacement and role transportation investment can have • Project boundaries and description have been modified to emphasize the Bayview’s existing community, not new development
<p>More Programming and Education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have dialogue about benefits and impacts of changing transportation infrastructure • Offer tools to help people learn how to use new systems 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incorporation of educational tools and workshops will be included in outreach process