



San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

MEETING MINUTES • Meeting Date: Tuesday, December 5, 2023

REGULAR MEETING

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
Room 400, City Hall

Members of the SFMTA Board of Directors will attend this meeting in-person. Members of the public are invited to observe the meeting in-person or remotely online as described below. Members of the public attending the meeting in person will have an opportunity to provide public comment on every action or discussion item.

In addition to in-person public comment, the Board will hear up to 10 minutes of remote public comment on each action or discussion item. The Board will hear remote public comment on items in the order that commenters add themselves to the queue to comment on the item. Because of the 10-minute time limit, it is possible that not every person in the queue will have an opportunity to provide remote public comment. Remote public comment from people who have received an accommodation due to disability (as described below) will not count toward the 10-minute limit.

Members of the public are encouraged to provide public comment via email. Send an email to MTABoard@sfmta.com by 5pm the day before the meeting to ensure your comment is received by the Board in advance of the meeting.

REMOTE MEETING ACCESS

WATCH: www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE or
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-december-5-2023>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 ACCESS CODE: 2661 101 0021

SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Amanda Eaken, Chair
Stephanie Cajina, Vice Chair
Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Lydia So

DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION

Jeffrey Tumlin

BOARD SECRETARY

Christine Silva



ORDER OF BUSINESS

1. Call to Order

Chair Eaken called the meeting to order at 1:01pm.

Board Secretary Silva announced the 10-minute time limit for remote public comment.

2. Roll Call

Present: Steve Heminger
Dominica Henderson
Fiona Hinze
Lydia So
Stephanie Cajina
Amanda Eaken

3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva made the announcement.

4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the November 21, 2023, Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Cajina and Eaken

5. Communications

None.

6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Director Henderson shared about attending the Conference of Minority Transportation Officers (COMTO) annual gala and presenting the Curtis Green award.

Chair Eaken shared about the first Vision Zero Committee meeting on November 28, 2023.

No public comment.



7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Special Recognition
- Federal Transit Administration's Triennial Review
- Legislative Update
- Free Muni on New Year's Eve
- Ongoing Activities

Director Tumlin introduced Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, who recognized Louis Guzzo and staff that worked the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation Leaders' Meeting (APEC). Director Tumlin provided updates about the Federal Transit Administration's Triennial Review and free Muni service on New Year's Eve.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jaime Vilorio thanked staff for their work on APEC.

Stacey Randecker expressed concern about noticing for the VZ Committee meeting, sharing that she was on the Vision Zero Committee Task Force and regularly attends meetings.

Barry Taranto commented that the Vision Zero meeting was productive and expressed concern about APEC communications for taxi drivers.

Speaker expressed concern about parking restrictions.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

No report.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Speaker expressed concern about Valencia Street and asked the SFMTA to reconsider the design.

Rodrigo Lopez expressed concern about parking restrictions on Winston Drive, asking for more time and help.



Leona De Leon shared about living on Winston Drive and urged the Board to delay the implementation of parking restrictions.

Leandro shared about living on Winston Drive and asked the agency for help.

Daisy expressed concern about parking restrictions on Winston Drive.

Chris Guichet expressed support for more infrastructure for people traveling outside of a car, sharing about biking to work and supporting more local businesses.

Flo Kelly urged the Board to delay implementation of the four hour parking restriction on Winston Drive.

Vamario Smith expressed concern for residents on Winston Drive.

Sean Kim expressed support for Valencia Street merchants and opposition to the center running bike lane.

Guled Muse asked the SFMTA to postpone the implementation of parking restrictions on Winston Drive, sharing that displacing families should never be an option.

Javier Bremond expressed concern about parking restrictions on Winston Drive and urged the SFMTA to delay the parking restrictions until a safe parking site was created.

Shiba Bandeeba urged the Board to delay enforcement of the parking restrictions, sharing that families deserve the city's support.

Mark Rennie expressed concern about Valencia Street, sharing that the center bike lane is killing small businesses.

Ian James urged the Board to delay parking restrictions on Winston Drive until a safe parking site or housing is offered to everyone on Winston Drive and Buckingham Way.

Eleana Binder asked to continue to work with the SFMTA to delay implementation of parking restrictions on Winston Drive.

Speaker expressed concern about Valencia Street and asked the SFMTA to return the street to how it was.

Meina Young expressed concern about obstacles on streets, requesting streets be open, urging the SFMTA to work together to make things better and not create problems.



Hope Kamer expressed concern for those living on Winston Drive and Buckingham Way.

Pete Wilson shared about a new operator graduation in December and expressed concern about the ability for employees to request vacation.

Cyrus Hall expressed concern about Valencia Street safety and urged the Board to listen to the voices on Winston Drive.

Speaker expressed concern about Valencia Street, sharing that the bike lane has been detrimental to businesses on the corridor and surrounding streets.

Speaker shared that the Valencia Street bike lane has killed businesses.

Allen Buradell asked about a Valencia bike lane study and report that the Board required when the project was initially approved.

Richard Johnson expressed concern about closing streets such as Hayes Street and Valencia Street.

Adam shared about small wheel accessibility.

Zach Lipton shared that it is possible to create a Valencia Street that is safe and great for businesses, also sharing that any future design needs to bolder yet not compromise safety.

Aditya Bhumbla expressed concern about Valencia Street and urged the agency to continue to work on it.

Robin Pam urged the SFMTA to continue to invest, support and make improvements to the Slow Streets Program.

Bianca Gutierrez shared about living on Valencia Street and how small businesses have been suffering.

Kevin Ortiz urged the SFMTA to revert back on Valencia Street until there is a compromise plan for the Mission.

Speaker expressed concern about the Valencia center running bike lane.

Luke Bornheimer urged the Board to improve Valencia Street and not delay action.



Stacy Randecker urged the Board to lead and improve Valencia Street.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern for Valencia Street, sharing that closing off streets creates congestion.

Barry Taranto expressed concern about eliminating left turn lanes and urged the agency to provide parking control officers at Union Square.

Mary expressed concern for neighborhood businesses and urged the SFMTA to listen to merchants and residents.

Mike Lowry was encouraged by a recent protest on Valencia Street, sharing that we must move forward.

Speaker expressed concern with SFMTA process and how the department was being run, urging the Board to prioritize.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications: (The Planning Department has found that Items A-P are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act [CEQA]. For these parking and traffic modifications that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

A. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA HV (Eligibility only, no signs) – 150 Franklin Street.

B. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PARKING PERMIT AREA J (Eligibility only, no signs) – 1626-1636 Haight.



- C. ESTABLISH - RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING AREA Y (Eligibility only, no signs) – 160 King Street, 151-157 Townsend Street.
- D. RESCIND - TWO-HOUR PARKING, MON-SAT FROM 8 AM TO 10 PM, EXCEPT FOR VEHICLES WITH AREA X PERMITS, ESTABLISH - TWO-HOUR PARKING, MON-FRI FROM 8 AM TO 6 PM, EXCEPT FOR VEHICLES WITH AREA X PERMITS – Missouri Street, both sides, between Mariposa Street and 18th Street.
- E. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PARKING PERMIT AREA HV (Eligibility only, no signs) – 327-331 Hayes Street.
- F. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PARKING PERMIT AREA I (Eligibility only, no signs) – 866-870 Valencia Street.
- G. ESTABLISH – RESIDENTIAL PARKING PERMIT AREA U (Eligibility only, no signs) – 333 1st Street.
- H. RESCIND – GENERAL METERED PARKING, 2-HOUR TIME LIMIT, 7 AM TO 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY – Jones Street, east side, from 25 feet to 88 feet north of McAllister Street (removes 3 spaces).
- I. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANY TIME – Jones Street, east side, from McAllister Street to 88 feet northerly.
- J. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING, 10 PM TO 7 AM, DAILY – Jones Street, east side, from 88 feet north of McAllister Street to Golden Gate Avenue.
- K. RESCIND – GENERAL METERED PARKING, 2-HOUR TIME LIMIT, 7 AM to 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY, Fulton Street, north side, from 21.5 feet to 115 feet east of Larkin Street (removes 11 spaces), Fulton Street, south side, from 14 feet to 124.5 feet east of Larkin Street (removes 13 spaces), Fulton Street, north side, from 17.5 feet to 102.5 feet west of Hyde Street (removes 10 spaces), Fulton Street, south side, from 21 feet to 106 feet west of Hyde Street (removes 10 spaces).
- L. RESCIND – GENERAL MOTORCYCLE PARKING, 10-HOUR TIME LIMIT, 7 AM to 6 PM, MONDAY THROUGH SATURDAY, Fulton Street, north side, from 104.5 feet to 115 feet west of Hyde Street (removes 3 spaces).
- M. RESCIND – TOUR BUS WHITE LOADING ZONE, 15-MINUTE TIME LIMIT, 8AM to 6PM, EVERYDAY, Fulton Street, north side, from 119 feet to 182 feet east of Larkin Street Fulton Street, north side, from 117 feet to 175 feet west of Hyde Street.
- N. RESCIND – PASSENGER LOADING ZONE DURING BUSINESS HOURS, 5-MINUTE TIME LIMIT, Fulton Street south side, from 128.5 feet to 182.5 feet east of Larkin Street, Fulton Street, south side, from 110 feet to 176 feet west of Hyde Street.
- O. RESCIND – BLUE ZONE – Fulton Street, north side, from 4 feet to 12.5 feet east of Larkin Street (removes 1 space), Fulton Street, south side, from 5 feet



to 14 feet east of Larkin Street (removes 1 space), Fulton Street, north side, from 9 feet to 17.5 feet west of Hyde Street (removes 1 space), Fulton Street, south side, from 4 feet to 12.5 feet west of Hyde Street (removes 1 space).

- P. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME – Fulton Street, north side, from Larkin Street to Hyde Street, Fulton Street, south side, from Larkin Street to Hyde Street.

RESOLUTION No. 231205-100

- 10.2. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to execute Contract Modification No. 1 to Contract No. 1318, Woods Facility Rehabilitation – Bus Wash Systems Replacement Project, with Air & Lube Systems, Inc., to increase the Contract amount by \$172,310.77 for a total Contract amount of \$5,028,537.77 and increase the overall Contract Time to substantial completion by 307 non-compensable days for a total Contract Time of 577 days to Substantial Completion. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Item 10.2 was removed.

PUBLIC COMMENT (Item 10.2 removed):

Members of the public expressing opposition: Richard Rothman (10.10) and Stacey Randecker (10.1B, E, and F),

On motion to approve (Item 10.2 removed):

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Cajina and Eaken

Chair Eaken recessed the meeting at 3:06pm and reconvened the meeting at 3:26pm.

REGULAR CALENDAR

- 11. Authorizing the Director of Transportation to execute Contract No. SFMTA-2024-20 with ETC Institute (ETC) to conduct the 2024 Muni Onboard Survey, required by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) in order to comply with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, in the amount of \$1,829,232 and for a two-year term. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, presented the item.

Director Cajina requested a briefing once the process and agreement were finalized.



PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Jaime Vilorio and Herbert Weiner

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Henderson, Hinze, So, Cajina and Eaken

RESOLUTION No. 231205-101

12. Presentation and discussion on the Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Financial Update. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial and Administrative Officer, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Cyrus Hall expressed concern about the deficit and hoped the agency would be able to find other funding sources.

13. Transportation 2050 Program Initiatives and Capital Needs and Requirements: (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

- A. Presentation and discussion on the 2022 State of Good Repair Report.
- B. Presentation and discussion on the 2023 SFMTA 20-Year Capital Plan.
- C. Presentation and discussion on the Transportation 2050 Programmatic Initiatives.

Jonathan Rewers, Chief Strategy Officer, Jason Chan, Lead Analyst – Asset Management Unit, and Darryl Yip, Transportation Planner, presented the items.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Cyrus Hall expressed concern about increases to the Clipper discount and supported changes to fare enforcement.

Gabe Kaufman expressed concern for transit riders, sharing that operating revenue should come from car owners.

Herbert Weiner urged the agency to add to the fleet to add service and stop eliminating parking spaces.



Director Heminger requested a comprehensive inventory of all agency assets.

14. Presentation and discussion on the legal responsibilities of the SFMTA Board of Directors. (Fulfills Charter Section 8A.102 (c)(3) training requirements. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Susan Cleveland-Knowles, Deputy City Attorney, and Stephanie Stuart, Deputy City Attorney, presented the item.

No public comment.

ADJOURN – Chair Eaken adjourned the meeting at 6:55pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Christine Silva'.

Christine Silva
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.



The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at MTABoard@sfmta.com. Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at sotf@sfgov.org.

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.