



# San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors & Parking Authority Commission

---

**MEETING MINUTES** • Meeting Date: Tuesday, April 5, 2022

## **REGULAR MEETING AND CLOSED SESSION**

1:00pm

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
Room 400, City Hall

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020 emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the SFMTA Board of Directors may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or online at [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE). Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm the day before the meeting or call 415.646.4470.

## **REMOTE MEETING ACCESS**

WATCH: [www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE](http://www.sfgovtv.org/sfmtaLIVE) or  
<https://www.sfmta.com/calendar/board-directors-meeting-april-5-2022>

PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN: 415.655.0001 Access Code: 2481 190 3739

## **SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Gwyneth Borden, Chair  
Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair  
Stephanie Cajina  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli

## **DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION**

Jeffrey Tumlin

## **BOARD SECRETARY**

Christine Silva



## **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

### 1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Eaken called the meeting to order at 1:00pm.

Board Secretary Silva announced information about the hybrid meeting format and reviewed how members of the public could watch the meeting and address the Board.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Sharon Lai  
Manny Yekutieli  
Amanda Eaken

Absent: Stephanie Cajina – at time of Roll Call  
Gwyneth Borden – with notification

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

Board Secretary Silva announced that ringing and the use of cell phones and similar sound-producing electronic devices were prohibited at the meeting.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the March 10, 2022 Special Meeting and March 15, 2022 Regular Meeting:

ADOPTED: AYES – Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Cajina and Borden

### 5. Communications

Board Secretary Silva reminded board members to use the monitors to request to speak.

### 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

Director Hinze requested a transit update.



No public comment.

7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

- Special Recognition
- Vision Zero Update
- Quarterly Metro Maintenance Update
- Ongoing Activities

Director Cajina joined the meeting.

Director Tumlin recognized the agency's Department Operations Center and Human Resources teams that helped during the Omicron surge, provided updates on Vision Zero, budget, quarterly subway closure, the Van Ness Improvement Project Ribbon Cutting, upcoming hiring events, Sunday Streets, and Bike and Roll to School Week.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Francisco DeCosta expressed concern for transportation operation standards, insufficient electricians, and commented business closures on Van Ness Avenue.

Herbert Weiner shared that the Van Ness project is incomplete, urging the SFMTA to restore the 47 Van Ness line and institute arrival times on bus panels.

Aleta Dupree commented on transit funding, expressing support to sustain discounted transit for a longer period and supported closing the subway for maintenance.

8. Citizens' Advisory Council Report

Michael Chen, Chair, Citizen's Advisory Council, presented the report.

No public comment.

9. Public Comment

Members of the public may address the SFMTA Board of Directors on matters that are within the Board's jurisdiction and are not on today's calendar.

Anonymous commented on Assembly Bill 5 passed last year and expressed concern over taxi drivers and taxi medallions in San Francisco.



Benjamin Valis expressed support for making it a felony to attack a taxi driver and commented about taxi drivers not getting paid by Flywheel.

Anonymous shared about the former Taxi Commission and urged the SFMTA to do a taxi needs assessment.

Barry Taranto thanked staff, Phillip Cranna, for taxi email communications and commented on upcoming baseball season starting.

Aleta Dupree reminded the SFMTA to not forget about reduced fare customers and asked for a transit system that all could enjoy equally.

Anonymous commented on white curb zones and suggested creating a new type of stopping area, a paratransit loading zone.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7th FLOOR.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

10.1. Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA:

- A. Inge and Richard Webster v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-20-584231 filed 4/24/20 for \$80,000
- B. Brigitta Gerke v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-19-574634 filed 3/19/19 for \$50,000
- C. Selena Holmes v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-20-586497 filed 9/11/20 for \$45,000
- D. Charles Vogel v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-20-584872 filed 6/11/20 for \$45,000
- E. Derwin Parker v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-21-591077 filed 4/15/21 for \$25,000
- F. Marvella Branner v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-19-574436 filed 3/11/2019 for \$15,000



G. Walter Baltodano v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-18-567318 filed 6/15/18 for \$12,500 (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220405-024

10.2. Approving various routine parking and traffic modifications and making environmental review findings:

- A. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY, NO STOPPING ANYTIME – Hyde Street, east side, from 12 feet to 27 feet south of Filbert Street.
- B. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING 7AM TO 9AM, 3PM TO 7PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY – 1st Street, west side between Mission and Market Streets.
- C. RESCIND – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING, 3PM TO 7PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY – 1st Street, east side, from Market Street to 221 feet southerly.
- D. ESTABLISH –NO STOPPING ANYTIME, SUPPORT PUBLIC WORKS (PW) TO ESTABLISH SIDEWALK WIDENING, RESCIND – YELLOW COMMERCIAL LOADING ZONE, 9AM TO 6PM, MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY – 1st Street, east side, from Market Street to 60 feet southerly – 1st Street, east side, from Mission Street to 46 feet northerly.
- E. ESTABLISH – SIDEWALK WIDENING – ESTABLISH –NO STOPPING ANYTIME 1st Street, west side, from Market Street to 60 feet southerly.
- F. SUPPORT PW TO ESTABLISH – SIDEWALK WIDENING – 1st Street, west side, from Market to Mission Street.
- G. ESTABLISH – TOW AWAY NO PARKING ANYTIME – 1st Street, west side, from 126 feet to 155 feet southerly.
- H. ESTABLISH – TOW-AWAY NO STOPPING ANYTIME – 1st Street, west side, from 140 feet to 187.5 feet south of Stevenson Street – 1st Street, west side, from Mission Street to 100 feet northerly.
- I. ESTABLISH – NO STOPPING ANYTIME, SUPPORT PW TO ESTABLISH SIDEWALK WIDENING Fremont Street, west side, from Market Street to 245 feet southerly (5-foot-wide sidewalk widening, replaces commercial loading spaces 20 and 22) – Fremont Street, west side, from Mission Street to 48 feet north of Mission Street.
- J. SUPPORT PW TO ESTABLISH – SIDEWALK WIDENING – Fremont Street, east side, from Market Street to Mission Street.
- K. ESTABLISH – WHITE ZONE PASSENGER LOADING, AT ALL TIMES, SUPPORT PW TO ESTABLISH SIDEWALK NARROWING – Fremont Street, west side, from 48 feet to 218 feet north of Mission Street.
- L. ESTABLISH – TOW AWAY NO STOPPING ANYTIME – Fremont Street, east side, from 220 feet to 230 feet south of Market Street. (Explanatory



documents include a staff report and resolution. For every parking and traffic modification that received a categorical exemption, the proposed action is the Approval Action as defined by Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code.)

RESOLUTION No. 220405-025

- 10.3 Adopting a resolution making findings pursuant to AB361 to allow for continued remote meetings due to the COVID-19 pandemic. (Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220405-026

- 10.4 Approving three contracts for as-needed consulting services for public outreach and engagement with Civic Edge Consulting (Contract No. SFMTA-2022-24), Davis & Associates Communications (Contract No. SFMTA-2022-25), and Katz & Associates and InterEthnica joint venture (Contract No. SFMTA-2022-26), each contract not to exceed \$3,025,000 and a term of five years. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Director Yekutieli severed Item 10.4.

Deanna DeSedas, Interim Communications, Marketing, and Outreach Director presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Herbert Weiner

RESOLUTION No. 220405-027

On motion to amend the resolution to direct staff to: (1) return to the SFMTA Board of Directors with a set of performance metrics to guide SFMTA's outreach and consultant work scope based on community-based organizations input by the end of September and continue quarterly reports on the metrics, (2) maximize opportunities to partner with community-based organizations to improve the quality of SFMTA's outreach, and (3) prioritize building further staff capacity in-house, to conduct culturally competent outreach, and seek to rely less on consultants to conduct outreach over the scope of the five-year period:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Eaken



ABSENT – Borden

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Borden

- 10.5 Authorizing the Director or designee to execute a side letter with the San Francisco Building Trades Council to extend the Citywide Project Labor Agreement to cover Public Work or Improvement projects funded by the Muni and Street Safety Bond Measure, if the voters approve the measure in the election on June 7, 2022. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220405-028

- 10.6 Authorize the Director to execute a Memorandum of Understanding between the SFMTA and San Francisco Public Works for the jurisdictional transfer of portions of Michigan Street in exchange for access and use of 11 SFMTA Operator Restrooms for a period of eight years, effective July 1, 2021. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

RESOLUTION No. 220405-029

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Danny Campbell, Greg Partenum, John Gully, John Corso and Cary Robbins (10.5)

Members of the public expressing opposition: Anonymous and Eric Tristan (10.5)

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Barry Taranto (10.6)

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar (Item 10.4 severed):

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Borden

## **REGULAR CALENDAR**

11. Amending the Transportation Code, Division II, Article 1100, Section 1124(b)(5) to expand the Taxi Upfront Fare Pilot Program to allow Taxi E-Hail applications to dispatch trips that originate with third-party entities, which may offer upfront fares that are not based on



Taximeter rates and extend the implementation date of the Pilot by 90 days. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and resolution.)

Kate Toran, Director of Taxis, Access & Mobility Services, presented the item.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing support: Hansu Kim, Evelyn Poquez, Sal, Muwaffaq Mustafa, Muuwiyah Alshriedeh, Anonymous, Aleta Dupree, Chris White, and George

Members of the public expressing opposition: Robert Cesah, Benjamin Valis, Evelyn Engel, Mark Gruberg, Marc Norton, Jessica Felix, Anonymous, Kim Haverly, Barry Taranto, Spikey Woods, Matt Smarter, Gus Yu and Herbert Weiner

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: Mary Maguire and Anonymous

RESOLUTION No. 220405-030

On motion to amend the resolution directing staff to continue to create informal opportunities for key stakeholders to provide input on the pilot:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Borden

On motion to approve as amended:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Lai, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Borden

The Board recessed at 5:22pm and reconvened at 5:33pm.

12. Presentation and discussion of the Muni Service Equity Strategy Report for Fiscal Years 2022 and 2023. (Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit, introduced Jessica Garcia, Transit Planner, who presented the item.

No public comment.

Items 13a and 13b were called together.





- 13a. Presentation and discussion regarding the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Fiscal Year 2021-2025 Capital Improvement Program in the amount of \$2.6 billion for 157 projects within ten capital programs, including transit reliability, street safety, state of good repair, facilities, taxi, system safety, and accessibility. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and program summary by project.)
- 13b. Public hearing, presentation and discussion of the Fiscal Year (FY) 2021 and FY 2022 Operating and Capital Budget including use of fund balance; authorizing changes to various fines, fees, fares, rates, and charges including extending free Muni for all youth under 19 years old; amending the Transportation Code to address fees and penalties for FY 2023 and FY 2024, reducing the boot removal fee in FY 2023, the SFMTA's FY 2023 and FY 2024 Capital Budget in FY 2023 and FY 2024, funding projects within ten capital programs. (Explanatory documents include a staff report and slide presentation.)

Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer, presented the item.

Director Lai left the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Anne Stuhldreher commented on fare discounts, urging the SFMTA to prioritize making Free Muni for Youth permanent and expand free Muni to people earning up to 200% of the poverty line.

Flo Kelley urged the SFMTA to stop poverty tows, suggested increasing awareness of discounts, and reducing barriers to discount programs.

Amy Van Doren expressed support for a budget that makes the investments to enable support for priority initiatives and rebuild ridership.

14. Discussion and vote pursuant to Administrative Code Section 67.10(d) as to whether to invoke the attorney-client privilege and conduct a closed session conference with legal counsel.

No public comment.

On motion to go into closed session:

ADOPTED:       AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Yekutieli and Eaken  
                      ABSENT – Borden and Lai



## RECESS REGULAR MEETING AND CONVENE CLOSED SESSION

The Board recessed at 7:58pm.

### **CLOSED SESSION**

#### 1. Call to Order

Vice Chair Eaken called the closed session to order at 8:00pm.

#### 2. Roll Call

Present: Stephanie Cajina  
Steve Heminger  
Fiona Hinze  
Manny Yekutieli  
Amanda Eaken

ABSENT: Gwyneth Borden – with notification  
Sharon Lai – with notification

Also present: Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Streets  
Susan Cleveland-Knowles, Deputy City Attorney  
Christine Silva, Board Secretary

#### 3. Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1) and the Administrative Code Section 67.8 (a)(3), the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors will meet in Closed Session to discuss and take action on attorney client matters on the following:

##### CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL

Existing Litigation:

A. Beth Sweet v. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC-18-566578 filed 5/15/2018 for \$159,500

RESOLUTION No. 220405-031

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Borden and Lai



## ADJOURN CLOSED SESSION AND RECONVENE OPEN SESSION

The closed session adjourned at 8:03pm.

### 15. Announcement of Closed Session

Board Secretary Silva announced that the Board of Directors met in closed session and voted to settle the item.

### 16. Motion to disclose or not disclose the information discussed in closed session

On motion to not disclose:

ADOPTED: AYES – Cajina, Heminger, Hinze, Yekutieli and Eaken  
ABSENT – Borden and Lai

**ADJOURN** – The meeting was adjourned at 8:05pm.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'C. Silva'.

Christine Silva  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call 415.554.5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review



within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call 415.554.5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the website: <https://sfethics.org/>.

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than 5pm the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at <https://sfgov.org/sunshine/>.