



Car Sharing Policy and Pilot Project

San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
July 2013

Introduction

Car sharing¹ reduces household vehicle ownership rates, parking demand, vehicle miles traveled, and greenhouse gas emissions. In combination with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's (SFMTA) efforts to better utilize transportation demand management strategies, improve parking management, and make transit, walking, and bicycling more attractive, car sharing plays a role in helping the SFMTA and therefore the city achieve its goals.

Specifically, the SFMTA can advance a number of key objectives in its 2013-2018 Strategic Plan by facilitating the expansion of car sharing. These include increasing travel by non-private automobile (Objective 2.3), improving parking management (Objective 2.4), and reducing resource consumption and carbon dioxide and other emissions (Objective 3.1).

The key goals of the SFMTA's car sharing policy are to expand the availability of car sharing across San Francisco, increase the usage of car sharing, and preserve or increase choice of car share organizations (CSOs). CSOs report that one of the key challenges for expanding car sharing is the difficulty of acquiring parking spaces for car sharing parking or "pods", which are locations where customers can pick up a car sharing vehicle.^{2,3} The SFMTA can use parking policy to encourage and facilitate car sharing, and thereby realize more of its benefits.

The SFMTA currently offers car sharing spaces to CSOs in off-streets lots and garages, but no formal policy is in place to guide this process. Additionally, as part of *SFpark* and the SFMTA's effort to better manage parking demand, the SFMTA concluded a pilot of twelve on-street car share spaces ("pods") in spring 2012. Using lessons learned from that on-street pilot, to expand and facilitate the ability of car sharing organizations to acquire spaces for pods, the SFMTA proposes:

- An expanded pilot test of on-street car sharing pods from approximately September 1, 2013 through August 30, 2015.
- Clarification and improvement of SFMTA's existing policies for CSOs to acquire pods in SFMTA-managed parking lots and garages.

¹ This document uses "car sharing" to denote the "round trip" model of vehicle sharing, where a customer's sharing session begins and ends at the same parking space, and not other emerging models of car sharing, such as one-way.

² Transit Cooperative Research Program. 2005. Report No. 108: Car Sharing: Where and How it Succeeds.

³ Interviews with local car share organizations

The SFMTA proposes this broader on-street pilot because on-street car sharing pods can encourage car sharing in the following ways:

- **Increases visibility of car sharing.** More visibility can lead to greater awareness of car sharing and encourage more people to utilize car sharing.
- **Improves proximity to trip origins.** The location of on-street pods is more flexible than those in lots or garages. This improves the potential geographic distribution of pods thereby reducing the time and effort required to access the vehicle. This improves the ease of using car sharing.
- **Increases the number of pods.** Many existing off-street pods are located on underutilized parcels that are likely to be redeveloped. There will be no guarantee that these spaces will be replaced on a 1:1 basis. Given that there are approximately 281,000 on-street parking spaces in San Francisco, using even a minute fraction of those spaces as on-street car sharing pods has the potential to dramatically facilitate car sharing.

The SFMTA expects to begin evaluating the pilot in fall 2014 to decide whether or not to continue the on-street car sharing program and, if continued, how to improve it.

Benefits of car sharing

Car sharing can achieve the following goals at minimal or no cost to the SFMTA:

- **Reduce automobile ownership rates.** By having access to a vehicle, households often give up a second or third vehicle. Some forego vehicle ownership entirely. A recent comprehensive study showed that every shared car replaces as many as 13 private vehicles.⁴ Lower car ownership rates reduce overall parking demand, especially in residential and mixed use areas.
- **Reduce vehicle miles traveled (VMT).** Overall, members of CSOs travel fewer miles by car, which helps to reduce congestion and parking demand.^{5, 6, 7} One

⁴ Martin, Elliot, Susan Shaheen, and Jeffrey Lidicker. 2010. Impact of Carsharing on Household Vehicle Holdings: Results from North American Shared-Use Vehicle Survey. *Transportation Research Record: No. 2143*: 150–158.

⁵ Martin, Elliot, and Susan Shaheen. 2011. The Impact of Carsharing on Public Transit and Non-Motorized Travel: An Exploration of North American Carsharing Survey Data. *Energies* 2011, 4: 2094-2114.

⁶ Cervero, Robert and Yushin Tasi. 2004. City CarShare in San Francisco, California: Second-Year Travel Demand and Car Ownership Impacts. *Transportation Research Record No. 1887*: 117-127.

⁷ Cervero, Robert, Aaron Golub, and Brendan Nee. 2006. San Francisco City CarShare: Longer-Term Travel-Demand and Car Ownership Impacts. Working Paper.

estimate concluded that each shared vehicle leads to about 18,000 fewer VMT every year.⁸

- **Reduce greenhouse gas and other emissions.** Reducing VMT translates to reducing greenhouse gas emissions. On average, by reducing VMT and using fuel efficient vehicles with low emissions profiles, it is estimated that each shared vehicle reduces carbon dioxide emissions by about seven tons every year.⁹ Shared vehicles tend to be used more frequently, reducing the number of cold starts, contributing to lower overall emissions when compared to private automobiles.
- **Reduce household transportation budgets and increase economic reinvestment.** Bay Area residents spend up to \$12,000 annually per household car. Households who forego owning and operating a car and use car sharing and a combination of walking, bicycling, taxi, and transit to meet their transportation needs spend up to a third of the costs compared to owning and operating a vehicle. Some of these savings are reinvested in the local economy.
- **Increase walking, bicycling, and transit use.** San Franciscans already walk, bike, and use public transit more than most people in the nation. However, those who are members of CSOs do so more than non-members (77 percent of trips compared to 67 percent, respectively).¹⁰ This suggests that members of CSOs tend to walk, bike, or take transit for more trips than non-members.

Models of car sharing

For the past decade, “car sharing” has described a service where a member reserves a vehicle, picks it up at a designated location, completes his or her trip, and then returns the vehicle to the same location. However, new organizations calling themselves car sharing with different operational models challenge the traditional model. To summarize the spectrum of car sharing business models:

- **Traditional.** City CarShare and Zipcar have operated the “Point A to Point A” model in San Francisco and the Bay Area for several years. The traditional

⁸ Osgood, Andrea. 2007. Curb Dreams: Allocating On-Street Parking for Carsharing. Unpublished master’s thesis. University of California, Los Angeles.

⁹ Martin, Elliot, and Susan A. Shaheen. 2011. Greenhouse Gas Emission Impacts of Carsharing in North America, *IEEE Transactions on Intelligent Transportation Systems*, Vol. 12, No. 4: 1074-1086.

¹⁰ Cervero, Robert, Aaron Golub, and Brendan Nee. 2006. San Francisco City CarShare: Longer-Term Travel-Demand and Car Ownership Impacts. Working Paper.

model has been well-studied by academic researchers and has been proven to deliver benefits described above.

- **Peer-to-peer.** These services have a very similar operation model as the traditional “Point A to Point A” car sharing organizations, allowing individuals to rent their privately-owned vehicle to other members via a matching service. Some companies that use this model are RelayRides, Getaround, and Wheelz. Until recently, these organizations had required vehicle owners to personally hand off keys to renters, but control and monitoring infrastructure (e.g., key fob readers, odometer meters) is increasingly being implemented by peer-to-peer services to manage their operations and collect usage data.
- **One-way.** These services allow members to pick up a vehicle near the start of their trip and return it at a location near their destination, typically at an on-street parking space. This business model is predicated on the ability of CSO members to park cars at general metered or unmetered parking spaces in commercial or residential areas (though still subject to regulations such as street cleaning, tow away, white zones, yellow commercial loading zones, etc.). Car2go is an example of a one-way car sharing organization, currently operating in Washington DC, Miami, San Diego, Portland, and Austin, as well as several European and Canadian cities.

Requirements to participate

Division II of the Transportation Code (SFTC Section 901) establishes a definition for a car share organization. In order to participate in the SFMTA’s off-street car sharing program, an organization must meet this definition.

To participate in the upcoming pilot on-street program, CSOs must meet the SFTC definition as well as additional requirements. On-street parking spaces are part of the public right of way, and the SFMTA’s on-street parking management policy strives to maximize the utility of this limited public asset. Giving extraordinary privileges to organizations using the public right of way or exemptions to any parking regulations, such as dedicating on-street parking spaces for the exclusive use of car share organizations, can only be justified if it produces substantial public benefits. The additional on-street requirements are intended to ensure these benefits.

For the pilot proposed here, the SFMTA will include traditional and peer-to-peer car sharing models. The proposed pilot will not include the one-way car share model. While promising in many respects, the potential benefits and effects of the one-way model are still insufficiently documented and understood at this time.

While the SFMTA does not plan to include one-way car sharing in the on-street portion of this pilot, those organizations are free to operate within existing parking regulations¹¹ and participate in the SFMTA's off-street car sharing program if they meet the definition of a car share organization in the Transportation Code. The SFMTA is eager to see more independent research and analysis of the one-way car share system model and may consider including one-way car sharing in a later pilot.

Requirements per Division II of the Transportation Code

In August 2011, the SFMTA Board approved changes to Division II of the Transportation Code to enable on-street car sharing. The SFMTA will seek approval from the SFMTA Board to make the changes necessary for this definition to apply to any car share organization, regardless of whether they seek on- or off-street spaces.

Section 901 of the Transportation Code defines a “car share organization” as:

A public, private, or non-profit entity that provides preapproved members access to a citywide network of at least ten (10) motor vehicles in the City and County of San Francisco and meet the requirements set forth in Section 911.

Section 911(b) describes additional requirements pertaining to the organization:

- Car Share Vehicles may only be available to members by reservation on an hourly basis, or in smaller intervals, and at rates which vary by time or by time and distance.
- Car Share Vehicles are available to members at an unstaffed self-service location and available for pick-up by members on a twenty-four hour, seven day per week basis without assistance or key exchanges or hand-offs with owner, operator, lot, stations or garage or any other paid or contracted personnel. If parked in a public garage, Car Share Vehicles are available during all hours the garage is open.
- Automobile insurance must be provided for each Car Share Vehicle for each member using the vehicle during the period of use and all must be included within the standard published hourly and mileage price of the reservation.
- The emblem of the Car Share Organization must be prominently displayed on both the driver and passenger side of Car Share Vehicles.

¹¹ For example, these vehicles can park on-street as long as they do not violate signed restrictions (such as peak period tow away zones, street sweeping, or RPP time limits). Payments at meters can be made using the SFMTA parking card or the pay-by-phone system or credit cards in SFpark pilot areas. Additionally, most city-owned garages offer spaces at a monthly rate or monthly reserved rate.

Meeting these requirements will qualify a CSO to participate in the SFMTA's off-street car sharing program.

Additional on-street program requirements

In addition to meeting the formal definition of a CSO, the SFMTA requires that CSOs expressly agree to the following practices and actions to be eligible to participate in the pilot on-street program:

- **Make on-street vehicles available for rental at hourly (or less) increments only.** On-street parking spaces are valuable public space. If they are to be designated for the exclusive use of a CSO, the SFMTA must ensure that the vehicle is made available to as many users as possible. When vehicles are reserved at daily or weekly rates, other users are prevented from using it for short-term local trips.
 - **Make on-street vehicles available for rental at least 75% of the month.** Peer-to-peer car sharing permits a private owner to share their vehicle while retaining some use for themselves. In designating a dedicated on-street space for car sharing the SFMTA is granting exclusive use of a valuable public resource for the public good. Participating CSOs must commit to, and ensure that, shared vehicles are available for shared use at least 75% of the time.
 - **Provide an outreach plan to reach new members.** The goal of this pilot is to expand the number of people who use car sharing. To participate in the on-street program, each CSO must provide an overview of its planned marketing and outreach efforts related to this pilot. The SFMTA is eager to have this service reach and serve people throughout San Francisco, so CSOs' outreach and operations plans should be explicit in addressing geographic equity as well as how the CSO intends to get support for its proposed on-street spaces and ensure that those spaces are well-utilized.
 - **Provide an outreach activity summary.** For the first nine months of operation in the on-street program, CSOs must provide the SFMTA a quarterly summary of outreach activities used to promote car sharing at their on-street spaces. The SFMTA will review the effectiveness of outreach efforts after the pilot's first six months and make recommendations for any changes as appropriate.
 - **Provide data to the SFMTA.** The SFMTA needs data in order to better understand car sharing operations in San Francisco and evaluate this pilot. The CSO must agree to provide the following information to the SFMTA every quarter of every year:
 1. Total current members in San Francisco, summarized by zip code.
 2. A list of all current vehicle locations (i.e., on- and off-street locations where users may pick up a vehicle) in San Francisco. Locations should be
-

identified by an address and/or latitude/longitude. The list should identify how many vehicles are sited at each location.

3. Day, time, and location of the start and end of all trips, as well as the VMT for that trip.
4. The following operational metrics for each on-street vehicle in San Francisco over the past quarter:
 - Average utilization rate (this data shall include the percentage of time that a vehicle was used, that each space/vehicle was not available (e.g., if a parking space was removed from service), and that each vehicle sat waiting to be used).
 - Average unique users per vehicle per month.
- **Survey CSOs members.** As part of the evaluation of this pilot, the SFMTA needs to be able to survey each CSO's members to learn how travel patterns changed. The SFMTA will work with CSOs to develop a survey that the SFMTA expects each CSO to administer (via, for example, emails to its members). This survey would be administered twice, once near the beginning of the pilot and once about eight months prior to the end of the two-year pilot.

Proposed changes to the Transportation Code

Following the evaluation of lessons learned from the previous on-street car sharing pilot, the SFMTA proposes the following amendments to the Transportation Code.

Deletions

The SFMTA recommends that the Transportation Code be amended to remove:

- **Section 911(c)(1)(D):**[Each application for a permit shall] Identify the license number, provide proof of current California Department of Motor Vehicles registration for the vehicle, and provide proof of current insurance for the vehicle.
- **Section 911(c)(2):** A Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit shall be issued to a designated Car Share Vehicle for a designated specific location.

The SFMTA's evaluation of the initial on-street car sharing pilot recognized that CSOs need flexibility in deploying vehicles to certain spaces, allowing them to be responsive to the demand for car sharing and replacing vehicles as needed (e.g., when removing vehicles from service for repair). Linking the on-street car share permit to a specific vehicle via license plate, VIN, or registration record imposes an administrative burden on the SFMTA and CSOs with no real benefit.

Changes and additions

Additionally, the SFMTA recommends that the Transportation Code be amended in the following manner:

- **Section 901(f):** Car Share Organization. A public, private or non-profit entity that provides preapproved members access to a citywide network of at least ten (10) motor vehicles in the City and County of San Francisco and meet the requirements set forth in ~~Section 911(b)~~ the Transportation Code.
- **Section 901 (g):** Car Share Vehicle. A motor vehicle for which a Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit is issued by the SFMTA that authorizes ~~the~~that specific vehicle to Park in a designated on-street car share Parking Space.
- **Section 901 (h):** On-Street Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit. A permit issued by the SFMTA ~~to a specific vehicle~~ that authorizes such vehicle to Park in a designated on-street car share Parking Space without being subject to enforcement of Car Share Vehicle parking restrictions.
- **Section 911(a)(1):** The SFMTA shall issue a SFMTA permit for use by a ~~specific~~ Car Share Vehicle upon receipt of a written application from a qualified Car Share Organization on a form prescribed by the SFMTA.
- **Section 911(a)(3):** The SFMTA shall implement a pilot program until approximately ~~August 30, 2015~~August 31, 2012, and may impose additional terms and conditions for permit eligibility during ~~the~~ any initial pilot program including limiting the number of Car Share Organizations which can participate, the time period for any permit issued, and a prorated permit fee based on the number of months the permit is issued for.
- **Section 911(a)(5):** The qualified Car Share Organization must pay the applicable On-Street Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit fee, based upon the location of the designated on-street car share Parking Space as determined by the SFMTA, and a one-time set-up and installation fee of \$6400 per designated on-street car share Parking Space before a permit may be issued.
- **Section 911(a)(6):** The applicable Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit fee shall be based upon the location of the designated Parking Space as follows: [definitions of three On-Street Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit fee zones, as illustrated in Figure 1 on page 13 of this document]
- **Section 911(b)(4):** The emblem of the Car Share Organization must be prominently displayed on both the driver and passenger side ~~front doors~~ of the vehicle.

- **Section 911(b)(6):** A Car Share Vehicle must be available to members for rental at least seventy-five percent of the time during any given month when the vehicle is Parked in a designated on-street car share Parking Space at any time during that month.
- **Section 911(b)(7):** [require citywide distribution of Car Share Vehicles available to members as determined by the SFMTA.]
- **Section 902(d):** [Establish Car Share Vehicle Parking Permit fees for the three zones defined in section 911(a)(6); correct the section reference to Press Vehicle Permits.]

On-street spaces

This section summarizes how the SFMTA will make on-street spaces available at a larger scale. This will consist of an application process for spaces for a two-year period. After evaluating the pilot, the SFMTA may discontinue, continue, or expand the program.

Application and approval process

For each organization that participates in the on-street pilot, the SFMTA will make up to 150 spaces (0.05% of the city's total on-street supply) available for designation as on-street car sharing pods in FY2014 and an additional 150 spaces in FY15. Because reserved on-street parking spaces must be established in Division II of the San Francisco Transportation Code, all spaces will be subject to the following approval steps:

- Pass review by SFMTA transportation engineering staff to ensure functional feasibility (e.g., do not locate a space on a major neighborhood commercial street) and no conflicts with other regulations (e.g., do not locate a space in a tow away zone).
- Undergo review by the Transportation Advisory Staff Committee (TASC) to brief relevant SFMTA divisions and other city departments (e.g., Planning Department, DPW, SFPD) on new spaces and programs.
- Perform outreach to neighborhood and community groups.
- Pass a SFMTA Transportation Engineering Public Hearing, including conducting all required public noticing of proposed on-street space requests.
- Receive approval from the SFMTA Board of Directors.

Prior to each fiscal year for the pilot, the SFMTA will solicit applications from qualified CSOs for on-street spaces. Each CSO will submit a letter of interest indicating which spaces the CSO proposes for the upcoming fiscal year. Each CSO may request an unlimited number of spaces but no CSO will be permitted more than 150 spaces for the first year of the pilot. The CSO must submit a list of spaces in one Excel file including the address of each space with nearest cross-street and latitude/longitude.

Evaluation and space selection steps

The SFMTA will designate no more than two on-street spaces per block for reserved on-street spaces. A block is generally defined as the curb space on either side of the street where the address range increases in increments of one hundred (e.g., 400-499 Valencia is one block). The evaluation and parking space selection process will consist of the following steps:

1. The SFMTA will review each proposed space and evaluate the technical, regulatory, and operational feasibility of each space.
2. In the event that more than two spaces are proposed per block, then:
 - a. The SFMTA will present conflicts to CSOs to allow them to potentially revise their proposed spaces to resolve conflicts.
 - b. If conflicts cannot be resolved for particular blocks, the SFMTA will randomly pick which spaces are allocated to which CSOs.
3. Once all conflicts are resolved, the SFMTA will finalize a list of spaces and move forward that package of spaces through the approvals process. The CSOs are responsible for sponsoring individual spaces through the public outreach and implementation process, including:
 - a. Providing outreach to Supervisors' offices, residents, merchants, and other community groups.
 - b. Attending community group meetings to inform residents/merchants of proposed spaces
 - c. Attending SFMTA public hearings to address questions/concerns
 - d. Once spaces are approved, publicizing upcoming spaces (e.g., attending meetings, street fairs, publications in local newsletters, and other marketing and outreach)

The SFMTA will support each space based on technical merit and the stated goal of advancing car sharing citywide, but CSOs will lead advocating for particular spaces (including at all public hearings). The SFMTA reserves the right to reject a space or remove it from the approvals process at any time and for any reason.

Pricing

One goal of the program is to encourage and facilitate car sharing in all areas of the city, and the SFMTA will use price incentives to achieve that goal, as well as minimum required presence in the city's outer neighborhoods. As shown in Figure 1 below, the SFMTA will charge different fees per space based on location in the city: \$225 per month in zone 1, \$150 per month in zone 2, and \$50 per month in zone 3. The SFMTA bases all permit fees on a cost recovery methodology, and will bill CSOs on a semi-annual basis. In addition to the monthly space permit fee, a CSO must also pay a one-time set-up and installation fee of \$400 per designated on-street car share parking space to recover costs associated with installing paint and signage.

Further, each participating CSO will be required to have no less than 15% of their on-street pods in Zone 2 and no less than 15% in Zone 3.

Figure 1: On-street car sharing rate pricing zones



For each requested parking space cleared by the SFMTA, the SFMTA will maintain the curb painting and signage for the space. CSOs will be required to keep the space and surrounding area (defined as 25 feet on both sides) clean. The space will remain free of debris, trash, glass, garbage, or other obstacles at a level consistent with the surrounding parking spaces to the satisfaction of the SFMTA and DPW. This is necessary to maintain the exemption from street sweeping regulations granted to on-street car share pods.

Permits and enforcement

SFMTA will issue an on-street car sharing permit that will identify the vehicle that is authorized to park in the on-street pod. When the vehicle with the appropriate permit is parked at its assigned on-street pod, it will be exempt from street sweeping, RPP, and other time limit restrictions. SFMTA will produce and provide the permit.

To facilitate practical fleet management and reduce administrative burden, CSOs will be allowed to maintain permits for vehicles associated with on-street pods “by the space” rather than “by the vehicle”, That is, rather than having SFMTA register each car share permit with a given vehicle’s VIN or license plate number, SFMTA will issue a supply of registered on-street car share permits to participating CSOs to be completed and attached to car share vehicles, one permit per approved-and-paid space. This will allow CSOs to replace vehicles as needed (for reasons of maintenance, age, etc.) without involving SFMTA, and will be effectively self-enforcing (given that the permits will only be useful at designated car share pods and more than one shared vehicle can’t use a single pod).

In August 2011, the Board of Supervisors approved changes to Division I of the Transportation Code establishing a violation for unauthorized vehicles to be parked in a designated on-street car sharing space (Section 7.5.52), and amended Section 8.1 to allow violators to be towed. The SFMTA Board also established the violation fine for Section 7.2.52 to be \$100, which was increased to \$110 in FY12-13.

Signage and paint

The SFMTA will paint the curb a distinctive color and install stencils and signage to clearly identify that the space is to be used for car sharing parking only. The number of poles and signs will vary based on location. The sign will read “TOW AWAY NO STOPPING Except SFMTA Car Share Permit 123 – \$110 MINIMUM FINE”, where “123” is the specific permit number assigned to the vehicle. The SFMTA will also post a sign designed by CSOs to identify the space, provided that the sign meets SFMTA requirements.

CSOs will produce and provide two signs per space with a simple logo. The sign will be metal with rounded corners, no larger than 18" x 18". The SFMTA will install the signs, one on each side of the pole so that it will be visible from both sides.

Parking space closures

On-street parking spaces can be temporarily closed for construction or special events such as street fairs. For these space closures, signs are typically posted 72 hours in advance. The on-street car sharing permit does not exempt the vehicle from space closures; car sharing vehicles will be subject to the same rules and restrictions that apply to other vehicles. CSOs will be responsible for moving the vehicle from the space and finding an alternate location if necessary.

SFMTA will attempt to notify CSOs of these closures with as much advance notice as possible. However, not all space closures are communicated to SFMTA. The CSOs will be responsible for paying any parking citations received or any tow fees and fines associated if vehicles are towed, regardless of notification. Permit fees for a closed parking space will be waived for the duration of the closure, pro-rated to the portion of a month during which the space was closed.

Utilization of spaces

In taking the extraordinary step of using some of the public right of way for storing shared vehicles, the SFMTA seeks to ensure that these vehicles are truly shared (especially for the peer-to-peer model) and utilized. The SFMTA will use this pilot to learn more about on-street car sharing and establish benchmarks for key measures, especially the average utilization rate (i.e., the percentage of time that a vehicle was used) and the average unique users per vehicle per month.

After approximately nine months of operation of on-street spaces, the SFMTA will evaluate how well the spaces are being used and if they are indeed serving the broader community (as measured by unique users). During this evaluation, the SFMTA will examine the on-street pods in the bottom quartile of performance for both measures and will consider revoking those spaces if usage is too low, or if the number of unique users is unreasonably low.

Abandonment of spaces and the end of pilot period

After evaluating the pilot, the SFMTA may choose to revert some or all on-street spaces back to normal street use or to continue using those spaces for car sharing.

Once a CSO has taken on a given on-street space for use as a car share pod it may not abandon the use of that space as a car share pod for at least six months. A different qualified CSO may assume the permit, at SFMTA's discretion, under the terms agreed by the original CSO.

A CSO may choose to not continue service at a space with a 90 day notice to the SFMTA (coinciding with the permit invoicing period). In that case, the SFMTA may offer that space to other interested CSOs. The SFMTA will reevaluate this policy at the end of the pilot period.

The SFMTA also reserves the right to revoke a CSO's permit at any time. The CSO will be provided with the option for a pre-revocation hearing within five business days. In the event that the SFMTA revokes a permit, the CSO must promptly remove the vehicle from the space within five business days of notice. In circumstances that pose a serious threat to public health or safety, the SFMTA reserves the right to immediately revoke the permit.

Off-street spaces

The SFMTA manages 19 lots and 19 garages. To further encourage and facilitate car sharing, as part of this initiative the SFMTA is establishing updated rules and processes by which CSOs can obtain spaces in these facilities. To participate in the SFMTA's off-street car sharing program, organizations must meet the definition of a car share organization in the Transportation Code but do not need to meet the additional requirements of the on-street program.

Current practice

Currently, CSOs have about 80 total spaces in SFMTA-managed parking lots and garages. At SFMTA-managed garages, CSOs pay the SFMTA carpool/carshare rate for each parking space, which is roughly 50 percent of the regular monthly rate. This monthly car share rate ranges from \$60-\$200, depending on the facility's overall rate structure. At metered lots, CSOs pay a monthly rate of \$96 per space to compensate for lost meter revenue.

To date, spaces have been allocated to CSOs on a first-come, first-served basis whereby CSOs requested spaces, SFMTA reviewed and approved, then the CSO coordinated installation of signage and paint. This informal process worked effectively in the early period of car sharing in the city. Today the expanding demand for car sharing and the expanding marketplace of CSOs warrant the adoption of somewhat more formal procedures for allocation of off-street car-share spaces.

Proposed policy for parking lots

SFMTA will make available to CSOs a minimum of 5 percent of spaces in each of its 19 parking lots. In lots with low parking occupancies, additional spaces may be made available, up to 20 percent of the total.

Application and approval process

Semi-annually, SFMTA will solicit applications from CSOs for spaces in parking lots for the upcoming six-month period. In its initial submission, a CSO may request no more than 50 percent of available spaces at any one lot.¹² However, if remaining available spaces at a given lot are not requested by another CSO, SFMTA may offer more than 50 percent of spaces in that lot to one CSO.

Off-street spaces in parking lots are historically less in demand than are on-street spaces. Therefore, in most cases, a less-rigorous review process is warranted for spaces in off-street lots. Some new spaces may be assigned following minimal outreach, while some may require a more thorough process. As warranted, SFMTA will coordinate with CSO staff on preliminary outreach to local stakeholders (e.g., district Supervisor, merchants, and neighborhood groups). Based on this preliminary outreach, SFMTA will make a determination regarding the need for further outreach prior to implementing new CSO-vehicle spaces. CSO staff must actively participate in any outreach process deemed necessary by SFMTA.

Evaluation and space selection

SFMTA will review all applications and coordinate with CSOs to resolve any competing requests for spaces. In resolving any conflicts, agency staff will consider each CSO's overall number of pods at all SFMTA off-street locations, and preference at a given location may be granted to the CSO with fewer overall pods. Once any competing requests are resolved, SFMTA will finalize the list of spaces and move forward with the permitting process.

Pricing

SFMTA will use zone-based pricing to encourage car sharing in all areas of the city. The monthly fee for car-share vehicles shall be: Zone 1 - \$150, Zone 2 - \$100, Zone 3 - \$75. SFMTA will bill CSOs for their permitted spaces on a semi-annual basis.

¹² Existing CSO spaces will be included in this process, and the end result of the allocation of spaces may include a CSO having to relinquish an existing space that predates this new policy.

Signage and paint

CSOs shall coordinate and pay for installation of signage and painting within assigned spaces, following pre-approval by SFMTA. Spaces already dedicated to CSOs are not subject to additional setup fees.

Parking space closures

Off-street parking lot spaces can be temporarily closed for construction or special events. For these space closures, signs are typically posted 72 hours in advance. The off-street car sharing permit does not exempt the vehicle from space closures; car sharing vehicles will be subject to the same rules and restrictions that apply to other vehicles. CSOs will be responsible for moving the vehicle from the space and finding an alternate location, if necessary.

SFMTA will attempt to notify CSOs of these closures with as much advance notice as possible. However, not all space closures are communicated to SFMTA. The CSOs will be responsible for paying any parking citations received or any tow fees and fines associated if vehicles are towed, regardless of notification.

Permits and enforcement

SFMTA will issue an off-street car-sharing permit for each CSO space in SFMTA-managed lots. The permit will not be attached to a particular vehicle, but only to the CSO. As long as the CSO vehicles are parked in their assigned spot, they shall be exempt from time limits.

Proposed policy for garages

SFMTA will make available to CSOs a minimum of 2 percent of spaces in each of its 19 parking garages. In garages with low parking occupancy, additional spaces may be made available, up to 10 percent of the total.

Application and approval process

Semi-annually, SFMTA will solicit applications from CSOs for spaces in parking garages for the upcoming six-month period. In its initial submission, a CSO may request no more than 50 percent of the car-share spaces available at any one garage.¹³ However, if remaining car-share spaces at a given garage are not requested by another CSO, the SFMTA may offer more than 50 percent of spaces in that garage to one CSO.

¹³ Existing CSO spaces will be included in this process, and the end result of the allocation of spaces may include a CSO having to relinquish an existing space that predates this new policy.

Evaluation and space selection

SFMTA will review all applications and coordinate with CSOs to resolve any competing requests for spaces. In resolving any conflicts, agency staff will consider each CSO's overall number of pods at all SFMTA off-street locations, and preference at a given location may be granted to the CSO with fewer overall pods. Once all competing requests are resolved, SFMTA will finalize the list of allocated spaces.

The day-to-day operations at SFMTA garages are managed by parking operators and/or non-profit parking corporations. SFMTA shall coordinate with CSOs, parking operators and non-profit corporations. Once a space is assigned, the CSO will complete a monthly access agreement with the operator.

Pricing

For spaces in garages CSOs pay the SFMTA Board-adopted carpool/carshare rate, which currently ranges from \$60 to \$200 per month, depending on the facility. Rates are subject to adjustment by the SFMTA Board on a quarterly basis. For any garage that does not have a current, adopted carpool/car share rate, a rate shall be calculated by SFMTA based on current policies governing garage rates.

Signage and paint

CSOs shall coordinate and pay for installation of signage and painting within assigned spaces, following pre-approval by SFMTA. Spaces already dedicated to CSOs are not subject to additional setup fees.

Enforcement

CSO vehicles shall be subject to the terms and conditions of the monthly parking agreement at a given garage. The on-site operator is responsible for enforcing compliance with these terms and conditions, in coordination with SFMTA. These terms and conditions shall include any site-specific operational parameters, as necessary.

Evaluation

Approximately 18 months from the start of this pilot, the SFMTA will begin evaluating this pilot project. This evaluation will focus on how well reserved on-street car sharing pods helped the SFMTA achieve its goals. This evaluation will support a recommendation to the SFMTA Board (expected spring 2015) for more permanent car sharing policies. If the evaluation finds that during the pilot significant benefits were not delivered the SFMTA expects that this pilot program will not be continued or made permanent. The evaluation will estimate to what extent car sharing helped the SFMTA to achieve its goals for:

- Mode shift
- Emission reduction
- Auto ownership
- Perceived mobility (by our customers)

Implementation timeline

Date	Task
Fall 2012 to Spring 2013	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finalize policy proposal • Conduct external outreach on proposal to CSOs, Mayor, Supervisors, City Administrator's Office, Planning Department, DPW, Department of the Environment, and other stakeholders • Finalize legislative changes and policy proposal • Present policy and legislative changes to SFMTA Board for approval
Summer to Fall 2013	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CSOs begin outreach for on-street spaces • Receive CSO on-street and off-street parking lot requests and evaluate • Finalize on-street spaces to be designated and begin approvals process • Receive approvals for on-street spaces (TASC, public hearing, SFMTA Board)
Fall 2013	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SFMTA begin implementation of on-street spaces • CSOs to begin marketing on-street spaces • CSOs to initiate service at on-street spaces