



**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND  
PARKING AUTHORITY COMMISSION**

**MINUTES**

Tuesday, June 2, 2020

Due to the COVID-19 health emergency and to protect our Board Members, SFMTA staff, and members of the public, the Board's Meeting Room (Room 400) is closed.

**Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely. If you want to ensure your comment on any item on the agenda is received by the Board in advance of the meeting, please send an email to [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com) by 5pm on Monday, June 1 or call (415) 646-4470. Please see the information on the next page for remote meeting access.**

**REGULAR MEETING  
1 P.M.**

**SFMTA BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Gwyneth Borden, Chair  
Amanda Eaken, Vice Chair  
Cheryl Brinkman  
Steve Heminger

Jeffrey Tumlin  
**DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION**

Roberta Boomer  
**SECRETARY**

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chair Borden called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

Present: Gwyneth Borden  
Cheryl Brinkman  
Amanda Eaken  
Steve Heminger

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting.

No announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of the May 19, 2020 Regular Meeting: unanimously approved.

### 5. Communications

Chair Borden commented about the current situation nationwide and legacy of systematic racism. She expressed appreciation to staff for their work internally, transit operators in particular, as well as with the public during this difficult situation.

Chair Borden asked that the phone line be opened to allow a member of the public who requested a reasonable accommodation to speak.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Zachary Karnazes discussed how meetings are conducted. It hasn't been clarified that people can comment anonymously. He is disturbed that people are asked to submit comments in advance. Speaking is different than an e-mail. There are different accessibility needs. He wants the Board to encourage public participation in a manner as similar as possible to how it happened before the pandemic. People are bullied in American with Disabilities Act proceedings. The hearings only focus on individual driver discipline rather than on systemic problems. The SFMTA has to focus on driver education and training. Punishing drivers and harming people isn't how accessibility issues are solved.

## 6. Introduction of New or Unfinished Business by Board Members

None.

## 7. Director's Report (For discussion only)

### -Ongoing Activities

Jeff Tumlin, Director of Transportation, discussed systemic discrimination against African Americans; the use of Muni during protests; diversity, equity and inclusion work with staff; a cyclist fatality on Frederick Street; construction on 4<sup>th</sup> Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Street, and Townsend; SFMTA tenant rent forbearance and forgiveness; and online events to celebrate Pride month.

Vice Chair Eaken requested an update on the plan for diversity, equity, and inclusion.

### PUBLIC COMMENT:

David Pilpel discussed instructions to operators to pull in which caused many people to be stranded downtown. There have been bus reroutes related to incidents on the street. In anticipation, someone alert the public at transit shelters. Riders need information about where to go and which buses are in service.

Francisco DaCosta stated that the Director may think that he has a degree in transportation, but Ed Reiskin was a far better director. Muni is failing riders every day because of the pandemic. He asked staff to stop patting our behinds and do their job. If it's too hot in the kitchen, staff should step out.

Zachary Karnazes expressed appreciation for Director Tumlin's report and hopes there can be action. The SFMTA has to stop deleting videos and public surveillance records and keep them for longer. He encouraged the Board to ride the bus. Many who make six figure salaries don't ride the bus which puts them out of touch with people. The disproportional targeting of fare evaders is racism and it happens all the time.

Sandra Doyle thanked staff during these difficult times. She loves bus drivers and sends compassion to them on their journey. She is a survivor of traffic violators. She urged the SFMTA to make city streets safe now. There is no time to waste.

Cliff Barger expressed appreciation to staff for their work and discussed the difficulty of keeping streets clear. He appreciates the Director and Muni workers who rely on police services but it's tough to see Muni transport police officers who are breaking up peaceful protests. He is thankful that the Agency is running service during the curfew and is disappointed that SamTrans doesn't follow Muni's example.

Barry Taranto expressed appreciation for Director Tumlin's words and the dilemma regarding transporting police officers during the protests. He suggested meeting with the police department and with the head of the Transport Workers Union to discuss it. It was stressful working as a taxi driver on

Saturday and Sunday. People got stranded when the buses stopped running. Uber and Lyft stopped running as well. There was heavy demand, without enough taxis. He was horrified to hear that a cyclist was killed. Cyclists ignore traffic signals and stop signs.

Dan Sutterman discussed commuting to the south of Market to work every day. In the current COVID environment, people will drive, making the streets less safe. He hopes the Slow Streets program will be made permanent. Streets need to be made safer now.

Martin expressed appreciation for “Safe Streets” and for safe, protected bike lanes. Too many people have died on the streets. It is unacceptable to create safer infrastructure after someone has died. He condemned the use of Muni for transporting police to crack down on people who have a right to protest. Cops have a bloated budget and their own vehicles. They don’t need to use Muni buses. It is a symbol that Muni isn’t taking black and brown people seriously.

Hayden Miller stated that he is strongly opposed to the use of buses to transport police. The SFMTA shouldn’t take buses away from the people who need it and give them to people who are the problem. Bus riders are essential workers. The SFMTA needs to improve streets and build more protected bike lanes. They have an opportunity now, but the Agency isn’t using it.

Roan Kattouw discussed streamlining the creation of more bus lanes and looks forward to elaboration.

Marilyn Kriegel discussed her experience as a pedestrian in San Francisco. Walking is a major part of her life but recently it has become frightening. The public needs to be safe.

Susan Weissberg stated that she has seen a lot of accidents over the years and is concerned about what will happen as the City opens up after the pandemic. People won’t be ready to get back onto public transportation. She hopes the Agency will follow the WalkSF recommendations to keep streets safe for any race or age.

Horatio asked the Board to expand the red-light camera program immediately.

Jason Henderson stated that he sent a few images to the Board which touched on the social justice and equity situation. The first map showed air pollution in dense areas of San Francisco. There are myriad environmental impacts on residents.

#### 8. Citizens’ Advisory Council Report

No report.

#### 9. Public Comment

Hayden Miller discussed operators who have been blocking entry through the front of their coach who have been disciplined for protecting themselves. Many passengers are ill or aren’t wearing a mask. Operators shouldn’t be disciplined. The Agency needs to put operator health first.

John Lowell discussed surviving an incident when he was hit by someone who ran a red light. San Francisco must ensure that red light cameras are installed at intersections where the crash collision data shows that there have been severe or fatal collisions. Transportation safety is important.

Allie Geller discussed the impact that traffic violence has on people. The losses are preventable. Well intended messaging is not the answer as people are fallible. She suggested that the agency follow examples of other cities. There is no reason that San Francisco can't be a success story. Crashes in intersections must be reduced.

David Pilpel discussed operations and the budget. He expressed concern about the stops on Market Street for the L, N, and T lines which don't stop at all the stops during the day. It is confusing to the public. The T is partially covering for the F-line but isn't stopping at all stops. These buses should stop at all stops during the day. He suggested that the Board be briefed on the budget at a future meeting.

Roger Marengo stated that there is customer service training for operators. The Transport Workers Union (TWU) is working with the SFMTA to provide eight hours of training to give operators a better understanding of how to deal with passengers. He hadn't heard that videos were deleted after 72 hours. Operators are up for discipline for something that happens weeks earlier. Mayor Breed is asking for budget cuts, but he would like the "Back First" program to continue. He would cut his salary by 10% if senior managers took a similar cut to continue to fund this program.

Roan Kattouw discussed the plan for Alemany Street. He mostly approves of the changes, especially for pedestrians. The bike lane is buffered and doesn't offer enough protection to cyclists. He urged construction of a protected bike lane wherever possible.

Richard Rothman discussed Fulton Street which is an international speedway. There needs to be an immediate plan to slow cars down and suggested reducing the speed limit to 25mph. There have been accidents that have taken years to fix. Something needs to be done as police won't give speeding tickets. He urged staff to make Fulton Street a top priority.

Herbert Weiner expressed concern about the 9-San Bruno line. The line was packed and was in violation of the pandemic regulation. More service is needed on that line. All lines to the Marina have been eliminated. There should be equity and service for everyone, including black and brown people. Providing service to every neighborhood should be the SFMTA's mission.

Barry Taranto discussed cyclists running through stop signs and lights. Cars have been doing it lately as well. He thanked the person who sent an email to the taxi industry telling them that they are an essential service and that the curfew doesn't apply to them. There was much demand on Saturday and Sunday. Cab drivers have to pick up everybody. There is a problem with "slow streets" as taxi drivers need a list of where those streets are. There is a lack of leadership in the Taxi division without Philip Cranna.

Jason Henderson discussed the Market and Octavia Plan and the “hub”. While working as a consultant, Director Tumlin conducted the traffic studies for the plan. It took ten years for the SFMTA to address Page Street. There are a number of items in the plan that haven’t been addressed. The Planning Dept. approved the hub last week. It has a significant loading deficit and it feels like the SFMTA is a bystander. He suggested that the SFMTA talk to the Board of Supervisors to address the transit capacity issue.

Jodie Medeiros expressed appreciation for providing safe and clean transit. She urged the Agency to not lose sight of their commitment to Vision Zero and to protect the most vulnerable. There is a new red-light camera program but it’s only at 13 intersections. More cameras are in the budget. They need to be implemented this year. She asked the Board to request updates on progress towards the Vision Zero goal. Tools and data are needed to improve.

Steven Bingham discussed pedestrian safety. The plan doesn’t address any of the issues. The WalkSF concerns are longstanding and urgently need to be addressed. Every two weeks someone is killed in San Francisco and ten people are injured every week. With more open streets, there’s an increase in speeding. There is an urgent need for more safety measures.

Eric Rosell expressed appreciation for the efforts to keep city streets safe. He has personally experienced and witnessed the dangers of city streets. He asked the Board to act urgently to end fatal or severe traffic accidents and to quickly put the WalkSF recommendations in place. He would also like follow up regarding improving safety in the Tenderloin.

Deon Jackson stated that he’s been a transit operator for 23 years. He has witnessed a lot of things on the streets. He would love to share his ideas to improve safety for pedestrians, drivers, and San Franciscans. Mr. Jackson provided his email address to the Board.

Nancy Harrison expressed support for stopping speeding and addressing left-hand turns. She appreciates efforts to reduce incidents. People need to transport large bags of food and get to work. Immediate action is needed now.

THE FOLLOWING MATTERS BEFORE THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS ARE RECOMMENDED FOR ACTION AS STATED BY THE SFMTA DIRECTOR OF TRANSPORTATION OR CITY ATTORNEY WHERE APPLICABLE. EXPLANATORY DOCUMENTS FOR ALL CALENDAR ITEMS ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT 1 SOUTH VAN NESS AVE. 7<sup>th</sup> FLOOR.

#### CONSENT CALENDAR

10. All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors and will be acted upon by a single vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Board of Directors or the public so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item.

(10.1) Requesting the Controller to allot funds and to draw warrants against such funds available or will be available in payment of the following claims against the SFMTA:

- A. Bhajan Johal vs. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC19574637 filed on 3/19/19 for \$56,000
- B. Ross Feller vs. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC18566003 filed on 4/23/18 for \$70,000
- C. Sabrina Suzuki vs. CCSF, Superior Ct. #CGC18570023 filed on 9/21/18 for \$175,000  
(Explanatory documents include a resolution.)

RESOLUTION 200602-049

(10.2) Amending the Transportation Code, Division II, Section 801 to establish San Francisco Police Department vehicle only parking restrictions in front of the Police Department Special Operations Center; and approving parking restriction as follows:

- A. ESTABLISH – NO STOPPING ANYTIME, EXCEPT VEHICLES AUTHORIZED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH OR FIRE DEPARTMENT, MONDAY THROUGH THURSDAY FROM 7:00 AM TO 5:00 PM - 12th Street, south side, from Mission Street to 40 feet easterly. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, amendment and resolution. The proposed action listed above is the Approval Actions as defined by S.F. Administrative Code Chapter 31.)

RESOLUTION 200602-050

(10.3) Approving Amendment No. 6 to Contract CS-155-2, Architectural and Engineering Services for the Final Design and Construction of the Central Subway Project, with the Central Subway Design Group, for additional design support services through completion of the Project, and to increase the contract amount by \$6,879,086; and making environmental review findings. (Explanatory documents include a staff report, amendment and resolution.)

Item 10.3 was severed from the Consent Calendar at the request of a member of the public.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Members of the public expressing opposition: Adam Savlacka and Hayden Miller

Members of the public expressing neither support nor opposition: David Pilpel

RESOLUTION 200602-051

On motion to approve the Consent Calendar:

ADOPTED: AYES – Borden, Brinkman, Eaken, and Heminger

## REGULAR CALENDAR

11. Presentation and discussion regarding the Transportation Recovery Plan including transit service and street recovery planning, support for neighborhood commercial districts and managing demand for travel. (No explanatory documents.)

Jeff Tumlin, Director of Transportation; Dan Howard, Technology Systems, manager; Julie Kirschbaum, Transit Director; Sean Kennedy, Manager, Service Planning; Jamie Parks, Director, Livable Streets; Hank Willson, Manager, Curb Management -and John Knox White, Manager, Program Planning, presented the item.

### PUBLIC COMMENT:

Herbert Weiner stated that the material is coming hard and fast and he is having difficulty comprehending what's being said. There's going to be more congestion and more tradeoffs. There's more congestion on California Street because of the "Slow Streets" project on Lake Street. This is not utopia.

Roan Kattouw stated that he liked seeing the map of new bus lines. The City could use a similar vision for both the bike lane and transit lane networks.

Robin discussed the narrow sidewalks on Divisadero Streets. There are queues in front of some essential businesses. Physical distancing needs on the sidewalks have not gone away. There are thousands of people who live in the area. She asked staff to bring back the extended sidewalks on Divisadero Street.

Kenneth Russell stated that he wants to live in a city where walking and biking is a higher priority than driving. He is excited to see the bike improvements around Park Merced and would like to see more attention given to improvements for those who live east of Park Merced. He doesn't want to worry about the safety of his family. He hopes the SFMTA can prevent a surge in crashes after the pandemic.

Barry Taranto says it's important to add more buses on the popular lines and do better with communicating with riders about when a bus is coming. Taxi drivers need to know where the "Slow Streets" are. He expressed hope the Essential Trip Card (ETC) program can continue. The mayor hasn't helped promote the ETC programs. Cabs need more sanitation and protection.

Jason Henderson stated the current iteration of the hub plan in Hayes Valley doesn't reflect the current thinking. The plan needs to go to the Board of Supervisors. The plan needs to connect Hayes Valley. Separated cycle tracks are needed. He asked that the SFMTA shut off freeway access from Haight Street and consider city-wide metering as is done in European cities.



Peter Belden discussed the “bike match” network to connect donors with people who need a bike. He supports the WalkSF recommendation and urged a network of connected and protected bike lanes. The fabulous “slow streets” network can be part of a connected bike lane system. Many potential cyclists aren’t aware of the existing network. There also need to be protected bike intersections. There are too many gaps in the network.

Kevin Burke stated that the faster the SFMTA can roll out the changes, the better they will be. He urged the Agency to do it before traffic returns to City streets. Bike lanes on north Potrero would be a good idea. He would feel safer if there were bus drivers next to him rather than car drivers. The City is undercharging at parking meters and meters should be extended to Sundays and in the evening. The subways in Asia have packed vehicles but everyone is wearing a mask. The SFMTA must promote mask use and ensure everyone is wearing it correctly.

Hayden Miller stated that the plan is well thought out but it’s important to move quickly. When the 44 Stanyan is approaching the Glen Park BART station, the bus faces a lot of congestion. The 28R between SF State and Taraval is congested in the afternoon. The agency should consider extending the bus zones along Lincoln Way. They aren’t long enough to accommodate buses. Also, the SFMTA should extend the island at Market and Fremont for safety.

Adam Palm stated that the biggest issue is talking to the community. The SFMTA should make it easy for the public to get ahold of staff. Residents like the “slow streets” in SOMA. When residents call staff, they get ignored. Cars are allowed to park in the bike lane. There’s zero enforcement which destroys planning. He urged the SFMTA to remove parking to allow for transit and to not let there be a “free for all” in the South of Market area.

Brian Hodgson expressed appreciation for all the work, especially to speed up Muni service. This is critical work. The Agency must make sure the high-injury network is safe, provide left-turn calming, and expand the bike-share program.

Aleeta Dupree said there were lots of good plans. Electronic polling is essential. She supports some kind of congestion pricing, metering, and expanding the bike- and scooter-share options. Bikes and scooters should be electric. The SFMTA can learn from the New York MTA and share what we know with them. All cars that traverse the bridges should pay a toll using a website. All transit riders should use the Clipper Card.

Cat Carter thanked the Board for the conversation about the racist legacy of the SFMTA. She wants to see expedited transit priority across the City before streets get congested again. The City needs to ensure that people who are essential can get to their jobs and home. There must be an entirely functioning network. She expressed appreciation for the hard work to develop this plan.

Michal Catterall stated that there needs to be more enforcement in the South of Market neighborhood and urged implementation of transit signal priority where possible. Lyft has a monopoly on bike share providers. It needs to be regulated. E-bike trips shouldn’t be more expensive than riding transit. There needs to be bikes for people with disabilities.

ADJOURN- The meeting was adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

A recording of the meeting is on file in the office of the Secretary to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors.



Roberta Boomer  
Board Secretary

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Appeal Rights under S.F. Admin. Code Chapter 31: For identified Approval Actions, the Planning Department or the SFMTA has issued a CEQA exemption determination or negative declaration, which may be viewed online at the Planning Department's website. Following approval of the item by the SFMTA Board, the CEQA determination is subject to appeal within the time frame specified in S.F. Administrative Code Section 31.16 which is typically within 30 calendar days. For information on filing a CEQA appeal, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, or call (415) 554-5184. Under CEQA, in a later court challenge, a litigant may be limited to raising only those issues previously raised at a hearing on the project or submitted in writing to the City prior to or at such hearing, or as part of the appeal hearing process on the CEQA decision.

Board of Supervisors review of certain SFMTA Decisions: Certain parking and traffic modifications as well as Private Transportation Programs that involve certain parking modifications can be reviewed by the Board of Supervisors. These decisions are subject to review within 30 calendar days after they are made by the SFMTA Board of Directors. For information on requesting a review, contact the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102, call (415) 554-5184. Ordinance No. 127-18 specifying which SFMTA decisions are reviewable by the Board of Supervisors can be accessed on-line: <https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/o0127-18.pdf>.

The Ethics Commission of the City and County of San Francisco has asked us to remind individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance [S.F. Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code section 2.100 et seq.] to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 415.581.2300; fax: 415.581.2317; 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 220, SF, CA 94102-6027 or the web site: [sfgov.org/ethics](http://sfgov.org/ethics).

If you wish to contact the Board regarding an item that is expected to be on an agenda, please email the Board at [MTABoard@sfmta.com](mailto:MTABoard@sfmta.com). Please know that the Board appreciates receiving such communication not later than Monday, the day before the meeting so they have time to review and consider the comments prior to the meeting.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decision in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, contact Administrator, by mail to Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco CA 94102-4689; by phone at 415.554.7724; by fax at 415.554.7854; or by email at [sotf@sfgov.org](mailto:sotf@sfgov.org).

Copies of the Sunshine Ordinance can be obtained from the Clerk of the Sunshine Task Force, the San Francisco Public Library and on the City's website at [sfgov.org](http://sfgov.org).