



**SFMTA**  
Municipal  
Transportation  
Agency

**SAN FRANCISCO  
MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
CITIZENS' ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES**

Wednesday, February 21, 2018  
Union Square Conference Room  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor

**REGULAR MEETING  
3:30 P.M.**

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Neil Ballard, Chairman  
Daniel Murphy  
Susan Vaughan

**COUNCIL LIAISON**

Roberta Boomer

**COUNCIL SECRETARY**

Keka Robinson-Luqman

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### 1. Call to Order

Chairman Ballard called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m.

### 2. Roll Call

FAC members present at Roll Call: Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan

FAC members absent: Daniel Murphy (without notification)

CAC members present: Cesar Magdaleno, Daniel Weaver, and Frank Zepeda

### 3. Announcement of prohibition of sound producing devices during the meeting

CAC Secretary Robinson-Luqman made the announcement.

### 4. Approval of Minutes:

No public comment.

On motion to approve the minutes of June 22, 2017:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan

ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

### 5. Report of the Chairman (For discussion only)

No report.

### 6. Public Comment:

Edward Mason inquired if the SFMTA is tracking development in the City. The Transportation Sustainability Fee should be looked at. The SFMTA should investigate whether they need to continue to fund training for the Bicycle Coalition. It doesn't seem to be effective. He stated that the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority is trying to replicate the Commuter Shuttle Bus program. The SFMTA needs to look at how they apply shuttle fees for the use of bus zones and operating in the City. He is baffled at how Muni has grown to 6000 employees.

## REGULAR CALENDAR

7. Presentation, discussion, and possible action regarding the SFMTA's FY19 and FY20 Capital and Operating Budgets. (Sonali Bose, Director, Finance & Information Technology. Explanatory documents include a slide presentation.)

Diana Hammons, Senior Manager, Revenue Collection & Sales, discussed fare pricing policy goals and proposed changes; Emily Williams, Acting Business & Administration Manager,

Transit Division, discussed the operating budget; and Sonali Bose, Director, Finance & Information Technology, discussed the capital budget.

No public comment.

Motion 180221.01

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 1 to maintain fares for Single Ride fares for Clipper/Muni Mobile.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.02

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 2B to limit 'A' pass to a 20% premium above the 'M' pass.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.03

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 3 to implement fare differentials for visitor passports.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.04

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 4 to adopt a new low-income single ride fare product.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.05

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 5A to implement a new day pass at two times the regular fare.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.06

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 6 to authorize a 10% discount for bulk purchases of 100 or more Cable Car tickets and Passports.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.07

The SFMTA CAC recommends Fare Policy Option 7 to expand the use of institutional pass models to other groups and organizations.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

Motion 180221.08

The SFMTA CAC urges the SFMTA Board of Directors to hold a public hearing before April 17 on fee setting for commuter shuttles and private transportation vehicles that use City streets as places of enterprise for private gain to consider establishing additional, non-regulatory, revenue generating fees for the benefit of the SFMTA. A privileged and confidential City Attorney 2013 memo exists that addresses the matter of fees that can be charged for use of city streets as places of enterprise for private gain. Publicly available evidence indicates that the SFMTA can charge more.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Mark Miller stated that asking the SFMTA Board of Directors to have a public hearing on something that is beyond cost recovery is a moot point without the memo. There is a legal finding of fact by the Board of Supervisors that says the Commuter Shuttle Bus program is a voluntary program. There's a statement in Muni's bond offerings from 2014 that says voluntary programs are Prop 26 exempt. The SFMTA Board of Directors cannot have a public

hearing on a fee and say it is Prop 26 restricted, then say it's voluntary, and then say voluntary fees are Prop 26 exempt. All three of these things cannot be true. He urged the committee to put back into the motion the request that asks for attorney client privilege to be waived. The public record is faulty. He stated that he doesn't see the point of asking for the hearing without the additional information.

Motion 180221.09

The SFMTA CAC recommends that the SFMTA use some population-based Prop B funds for operating instead of capital. Future capital projects should have operations costs factored into their budgets.

On motion to approve:

ADOPTED: AYES – Neil Ballard and Sue Vaughan  
ABSENT – Daniel Murphy

8. Committee member requests for information. (For discussion only)

None.

ADJOURN - The meeting was adjourned at 5:27 p.m.

Submitted by:



Keka Robinson-Luqman  
SFMTA CAC – Secretary

Next regular meeting: Tuesday, March 7, 2018 at 3:00 p.m.  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor, Union Square Conference Room, #7080