

**Minutes**  
**PCC Executive Committee Meeting**  
**March 16, 2022**

PCC Executive Committee Members Present: Marty Smith, PCC Chair; Cheryl Damico PCC Secretary; Fred Lein; Jessica Felix; Joan Kwansa; Mara Math; Mary McLain; Susan Kitazawa

PCC Members and Guests: Tam Tran, Daveed Mandell, Jon Gaffney

PCC Executive Committee Member Excused: Kevin Lee

SF Paratransit Staff: Marc Soto; Joe Skelton; Kevin McDonald; Justin Leong; Carol Osorio; Matthew Teixeira; Catherine Callahan

SFMTA: Annette Williams; Jonathan Cheng

Marty Smith, PCC Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:35 a.m.

**Read and Approve Agenda**

Marty Smith, PCC Chair, read the agenda. The agenda were motioned/seconded/approved.

**Approve Minutes of January 19<sup>th</sup> meeting**

The minutes were motioned/seconded/approved.

Mara Math commented that she has been receiving the minutes and agenda as a DocuSign document instead of a Microsoft Word document.

**Comments from the Chair**

Marty Smith stated that he had some questions about the ramp incentive for the SFO short passes and taxi fares. He also asked if anyone could provide an update on Bruce Oka. Marc Soto did reach out to Bruce and said he is feeling better but did not provide any other details.

**Election of Vacancy on PCC Executive Committee**

By acclamation, Joan Kwansa was elected to serve as in the Unaffiliated Elderly caucus.

**Election of PCC Executive Committee Officers**

For the position of PC&O chair, there was only one nomination, Roland Wong. By acclamation, Roland was elected as PC&O chair of the PCC.

**Transportation Element Update**

Tam Tran from the San Francisco Planning Department provided an update on the Transportation Element of the city's General Plan. The General Plan is a vision as to how the city will grow and was last updated in 1995. In this forward-looking plan, the transportation policy looks at what future transportation projects should look like.

The Transportation Element of the General Plan includes policies that align with city's vision, including a people-centric approach (i.e. how to get to parks and places) to transportation; it does not cover any policy regarding day to day administration and budgeting. An example of how the Transportation Element guides transportation planning is the Better Market Street project, which closed the streets to private vehicles.

The Transportation Element of the General plan is now being updated to incorporate the Vision Zero goal to eliminate pedestrian fatalities, climate action goals to reduce greenhouse gases, and improve equity. In addition, the five goals of ConnectSF will be included, which consists of equity, environmental sustainability, economic vitality, safety and livability, accountability and engagement. In their outreach, staff reported that some of the reoccurring concerns include unreliable transit, long paratransit wait times, congestion, affordability, and safety concerns. Among the needs include frequent and affordable transit, , greater connectivity to jobs and school, and continual engagement.

Marc Soto commented that it is not only good to listen to concerns and needs but important to understand how these will be addressed. For example, SFMTA's Muni and SF Paratransit have some of the most affordable fares in the region. Tam Tran said that it is important to balance the financial considerations of all riders. Marc also addressed concerns with wait times for paratransit, stating that in the past two years, there has been a very high on-time performance rates and less complaints. Jessica Felix is concerned about traffic lights timing and its effect on congestion. She stated that as a result, there is a negative impact on the environment along major corridors

Craig Nelson asked about access of taxi and paratransit service to the Lighthouse for the Blind due to the closure of Market Street to private vehicles. Tam Tran stated that taxis are allowed on Market Street. Susan Kitazawa wanted to make sure that TNCs are addressed in the Transportation Element as there have been issues with accessibility and would like to see enhanced safety measures for drivers, similar to those of taxi drivers. Jessica Felix wants self-driving cars to be addressed in Transportation Element as well.

### **PC&O Taxi/Ramp Taxi Subcommittee Report**

Jonathan Cheng read the following report:

- **Election of Vice Chair**  
Jessica Felix became the new Vice Chair.
- **SF Paratransit Broker Report**  
Joe Skelton reported that the Ramp Taxi incentives for December have been approved and are going out. The On Time Performance for the 2nd Quarter was 91.67% with January coming in at 97.53%. Marc stated that Joe Skelton took Kent Hinton's position. Cyber security has been a focus for Transdev, and are working on improving and securing our systems. They are looking at doing a 2022 customer satisfaction survey this year. Marc informed all the Essential Worker Ride Home program that was ending in February.
- **Service Quality Issues**

Drivers/Riders - Jessica said even though there is less traffic, it is very difficult to get anywhere. The changes to the streets implemented by the SFMTA has very negatively affected traffic. Jessica is still pushing to get YoTaxi app approved however SFMTA indicates it is stalled at the 3rd party accessibility review. Forest Barnes from SFMTA said he has spoken with Yellow Management.

- **Public Comment:**

Hansu Kim, the owner of Flywheel Taxi, discussed the Flywheel app and SF Centralized Dispatch (SFCD). Hansu said he wants to make it clear that Flywheel app is aware of the importance of Paratransit to the taxi industry. He then announced that Flywheel has partnered with Uber so riders will be sent through the Uber app to taxis via the Flywheel app. Any orders received by taxis will adhere to all taxi regulation. Annette Williams from SFMTA said that the city will not be paying ramp incentives out of their funds for Uber. They will have to use their own pool of money being collected. Further discussion on the Uber collaboration followed.

The next PC&O Taxi/Ramp Taxi subcommittee meeting is on May 4, 2022.

Mara Math requested clarification as to how the arrangement between Uber and Flywheel will work, for example, will you get an Uber vehicle if a request is made through Flywheel. Jessica Felix does not want to log into a SFMTA approved app, which is currently only Flywheel, to meet the incentive requirement. Craig Nelson raised concerns about sharing any data.

**PC&O SF Access Subcommittee Report:**

Mary McLain read the following report:

- **Election of Vice Chair**

Mary McLain was voted Vice Chair for 2022

- **Service Quality Update**

Mary McLain reported out for Transdev's operating division. They focus on currently is recruiting and employment, they have enough employees to meet SF Access demand but want to be prepared for higher ridership. Additionally, SFMTA purchased 22 new vehicles, these are the smaller transit connect vehicles and her team has been coordinating with city departments on their inspection of the vehicles and working with Transdev's equipment vendors for drive cam installation and mobile i-8 installation.

- **SF Paratransit Broker's Report**

- Joe Skelton reported that overall numbers for January were down 9% compared to December. In January they did 11,590 trips on SFA and February is on track to match that mark. But due to the state of Covid, we should see numbers start to tick up. On-time performance (OTP) in January was 98.53% and for February was 98.88%. They had only five complaints in February. Joe is still looking someone to fill a Customer Service position, along with Gabe Chan who is leaving the team for an exciting role at the Water Emergency Transportation Authority.

Marc reported out on that they are following the FTA rules on masking even with masking relaxations in San Francisco. Since the office at 68 12th St. is identified as a Transit Hub, they will require masks to be worn while in office. Marc reported out on Brokers Office initiatives, first they are still working on IT related initiatives one of them is a phone solution for the Brokers office. His team is looking at the Clipper two project, which requires a computer software upgrade to the 21st version of trapeze. They plan to start the process from version 14 to migrating to version 21. Lastly Marc mentioned he would like to re-open discussions with SFMTA about having SFMTA owned operations and Paratransit facilities.

The next PC&O SF Access Subcommittee Meeting date is June 1st 2022

### **Paratransit Broker Report**

Joe Skelton, Mary McLain, and Marc Soto reported as follow:

- **Service Level Statistics**  
SF Access is operating at about 63 percent of pre-pandemic levels. Paratransit taxis are approximately 75 percent while Group Van is at around 27 percent of pre-pandemic levels. As agencies resume in-person activities, Group Van service is expected to increase in the upcoming months.
- **On Time Performance**  
On time performance for taxis was 93 and 97% respectively in January and February 2022 and 100% to-date in March 2022. For the SF Access service, the on-time performance from January to March was between 98 and 99%. Group Van on time performance during this same period was between 92 and 97%.
- **Clipper 2.0**  
MTC is working on the next generation of Clipper Cards, which will include fare payment for Paratransit. This will require SF Paratransit to update its Trapeze system. SFMTA has agreed to be the test pilot this new edition of the Clipper Card.
- **Taxi Activities**  
Staff is working with Yellow Cab to address GPS data issues concerning duplicate trips and blank trips and are currently withholding payment for these types of trips until this issue is resolved. The previous issue with missing GPS data has largely been resolved.
- **Group Van Activities**  
Staff continue to work closely with Group Van agencies and remain responsive to their needs, especially as the new variant impacts demand.
- **Broker IT Activities**  
Ongoing projects including enhancing cybersecurity protection, replacing the Broker's phone system and completing the transition to the FirstNet system. In addition, a new IT vendor for SF Paratransit will be transitioning with a new contract to start in June 2022.

- **SF Paratransit Office Updates**

Staff is working on the resumption of in-person activities including ADA eligibility interviews and photo for the taxi debit card. Per the FTA, masks are still required to be worn while riding all public transportation, including Paratransit, through April 18<sup>th</sup>

- **SF Paratransit Staffing Update**

Gabriel Chan recently left for another position and the transportation planner position is currently vacant. Transdev also has vacancies in the mobility specialist, customer service agent and eligibility analyst positions. Earnesha Scott, who is the current Assistant General Manager, will be leaving later this month.

Marty Smith asked about the benefits of using the Clipper Card for the SF Paratransit program. Marc Soto responded that riders would no longer have to carry cash or buy tickets to pay for their trip and that this new system will facilitate payment for transfer/intercounty trips to other paratransit systems. He did mention that the Clipper Card will not be used to pay for any Paratransit taxi trips. Jessica Felix asked if the withholding of payment to Yellow Cab is affect drivers. Marc answered that it is not.

### **Public Comments**

Jessica Felix expressed concerns about the change to incentives related to airport access and does not see the benefits of the new system if there is a long wait time. Carol Osorio stated that she has spoken to several ramp taxi drivers, and they have experienced more positive experiences with access to the airport with the new changes. Jessica Felix also said that it is difficult to be a taxi driver with the rising cost of gas and would like to see some kind of incentive be made available to subsidize this additional cost. Susan Kitazawa agreed with this statement.

Mara Math would like non-driver positions to be recognized at the PCC Annual Meeting. Jonathan Cheng said they riders can nominate non-drivers for the event and that in previous meetings, non-drivers have been recognized. Susan Kitazawa would like to see recognize good taxi dispatch honored. Mary McLain and Marc Soto stated that when there is a compliment, it is kept in the employee's record in their file

### **Announcements**

Marc Soto wanted to recognize the employees who have served a long time with the Paratransit service. Jonathan Cheng also asked PCC members to provide positive statements to share ahead of an employee recognition event this Friday in Brisbane. He also announced the PCC Bylaws review meeting will be held on Wednesday, March 30 at 11am.

### **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 12:30 pm.

**The next PCC meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 11<sup>th</sup> from 10:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m.**