

Bird
SFMTA Application Assessment

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens • Field staff instructed to proactively educate users about safe riding 	In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, applicant included some innovative strategies. Training field staff to proactively approach users on safe riding behavior likely to result in safer operations but may not reach all users.	Fair
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free helmet upon request; field staff will encourage helmet use 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone did not result in high levels of helmet use. Field staff approaching users regarding helmet use is unlikely to improve usage if staff or riders do not have a helmet on hand.	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Willing to implement locking mechanism but does not recommend implementation • Will require photo for proof of proper parking • Will deploy in "nests" on private property 	Willingness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018; the SFMTA evaluates this strategy at a similar level of effectiveness to most applications.	Fair
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided examples of types of penalties that could be issued, but didn't clearly define when penalties would be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor

Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over 50% discount for low income users • Limited detail in describing mechanism to participate • Cash option; no mention of SMS option 	Despite significantly discounted rates the SFMTA concludes that low income users would face barriers to accessing applicant's services based on the lack of detail about how users would access/qualify for these benefits.	Poor
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • With fewer than 750 scooters, would deploy downtown core only • No commitment to redistributing for geographic equity • Would do community outreach first six months to determine expansion proposal • No mention of service hours 	<p>The SFMTA concludes that the applicant's proposed small service area and lack of specific rebalancing plans are insufficient to ensure availability in underserved communities.</p> <p>Note: Plans to conduct outreach to identify more equitable service after 6 months are insufficiently detailed to be considered in evaluation of service area.</p>	Poor
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions outreach to determine where to expand service during second half of pilot to Communities of Concern, for larger numbers of scooters • Mentions but does not describe engagement strategy for providing scooter share service in Communities of Concern that are underserved by transit • Enhanced multilingual communications outreach 	Applicant demonstrates some understanding of the SFMTA's goals to promote low income programs but does not provide sufficient detail as to how that would be accomplished. The SFMTA negatively evaluates this lack of detail as unlikely to ensure that low income residents are aware of services and how to participate.	Poor
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions intent to participate in events to be available to answer questions and build community partnerships to be more affordable and accessible; does not articulate plans to address feedback 	Attending events and meeting with stakeholders is a baseline strategy proposed by most applicants; without specific goals or plans to address feedback, the SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail as unlikely to result in applicant successfully listening to and addressing community feedback.	Poor

Labor	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of detail regarding operations/rebalancing plan beyond nightly retrieval and recharging • Will hire Fleet Coordinator and Community Manager; rest will be contracted out 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates applicant's lack of detailed strategy for operations and rebalancing as insufficient to ensure safe and reliable operational practices.	Poor
	Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All field staff (except one Fleet Coordinator and one Community Manager) are independent contractors; this includes maintenance staff • Video training for contractors; contractors are "expected to already have knowledge relevant to the services provided" • No charging facility - chargers charge scooters on their own including in private homes 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's reliance on minimally trained independent contractors for charging and in particular for maintenance activities, which could compromise safety and reliability of system.	Poor
Sustainability	Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of recycling • No mention of battery recycling • "Damaged beyond repair" units are shipped to Southern California for parts salvage or reuse/proper disposal • Units maintained by independent contractors (likely less training) 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's response, which fails to address critical requirements of San Francisco's Zero Waste Policy.	Poor
Experience & Qualifications	Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have operated shared scooter systems in SF and scooter share and bikeshare in many cities • Public Works impounded 169 improperly parked Bird scooters and issued 5 violations; the initial violation in the amount of \$1,637.00 was paid, subsequent violations were outstanding with a total of \$13,910.17 owed as of the June 7th application deadline but have since been paid. 	The applicant demonstrates experience operating shared scooter service, but the SFMTA negatively evaluates applicant's history of violations, which indicates that past strategies have been insufficient to ensure user compliance with laws.	Poor

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

HOPR
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens • 10 free rides for users who take a scooter safety class 	In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, included some innovative strategies. Offering incentives for safety classes will result in safer operations compared to most applicants, but may not reach all users.	Fair
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Helmet provided with rental 	Providing helmets with rental is the surest way to ensure consistent helmet use. The SFMTA evaluates this strategy as highly likely to result in helmet use compared to baseline strategies.	Strong
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cable tether ready to deploy as of July 2018 • Geofenced preferred parking • Plan to deploy racks 	Readiness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018. Due to readiness to implement, the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as more effective than most applicants.	Strong
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided examples of types of penalties that could be issued, but didn't clearly define when penalties would be levied • Points-based incentive system rewards and penalizes users based on riding and parking behavior but little detail on how points would be assigned 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor

<p>Equitable Access</p>	<p>Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over 50% discount for low income users • Subscription plan available • Limited description of mechanism for participation • Cash and SMS option 	<p>Despite significantly discounted rates, the SFMTA concludes that low income users would face barriers to accessing applicant's services based on the lack of detail about how users would access/qualify for these benefits.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Equitable Access Community Outreach</p>	<p>Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Request 1,000 scooters and would deploy in all of SF minus Twin Peaks and south west neighborhoods; do not say whether service area would differ for smaller fleet • No commitment to redistributing for geographic equity • Service hours: 5am to midnight 	<p>Broad service area for larger fleet would ensure some degree of geographic equity and extended service hours will serve users when transit is limited. However, lack of rebalancing would result in reduced availability in underserved communities throughout the day, and the SFMTA is unable to evaluate service area for smaller fleet sizes.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
	<p>Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe presence at community events and inclusive, diverse marketing campaigns • Mention but do not describe collaboration with community organizations to promote low-cost scooter share programs 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail as unlikely to ensure that low income residents are aware of services and how to participate.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Community Outreach Labor</p>	<p>Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of attempts to engage members of the public generally 	<p>Failure to include strategies to engage members of the public who do not choose to use scooter services is a flaw in application.</p>	<p>Poor</p>

<p>Community Outreach Labor</p>	<p>Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Locking racks (HOPR Pods) required for deployment • Lack of detail on rebalancing/redistribution • Labor plan for 300 scooters: 1 operations manager, 1 marketing manager, 1 mechanic, 3 field technicians 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates applicant's lack of detailed strategy and low level of staffing for operations and rebalancing as insufficient to ensure safe and reliable operational practices.</p> <p>Required locking racks (HOPR Pods) would significantly delay program launch based on required coordination with the City; the SFMTA evaluates this as incompatible with current pilot permit program.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Labor Sustainability</p>	<p>Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Very limited detail regarding labor and operations • Field and maintenance staff are full & part-time hourly employees • Mentions but does not describe continued training opportunities 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail regarding training programs as unlikely to result in safe operational practices compared to other applicants.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of recycling • No mention of battery recycling • No mention of reuse/salvaging of parts • General compliance statement regarding hazardous substances • Electric bikes used for rebalancing 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's response, which fails to address critical requirements of San Francisco's Zero Waste Policy.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have operated dockless bikeshare in many cities 	<p>The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's experience operating stationless bikeshare services; however, applicant has not operated a scooter share system nor do they have a history of collaboration with the SFMTA.</p>	<p>Fair</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

JUMP
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens and FAQ; welcome email with rules of engagement & safety tips 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on staff's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone were not effective in addressing safe user behavior and operation.	Poor
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free helmet upon request, advertised in numerous locations 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone did not result in high levels of helmet use.	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No tethering planned • Credits for parking at geofenced preferred parking • List many strategies that they might explore or are considering but without level of detail sufficient for SFMTA to assess (for example: "exploring" user photos, "considering" asking Uber users to pick up scooters, "willing to discuss" providing racks) 	The SFMTA finds that the lack of specificity throughout discussion of parking, locking, and tethering is inadequate to ensure safe parking behavior despite listing some potentially effective strategies.	Poor
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exploring tiered penalty system, but didn't clearly define when penalties would be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor

Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$5/year plan includes 60 minutes riding time per day • Subscription plan available • Detailed description of mechanism for participation • Cash option; no mention of SMS option 	Strong commitment to providing a low income option. Detailed description of mechanism to access applicant's service would reduce barriers for qualifying users to access system and significantly discounted rates provide an incentive for low income users to use the system.	Strong
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NE Quadrant of City + Bayview/Hunters Point (same as JUMP Bikes service area) • Propose 20% availability in CoCs and 30% of trips starting or ending in CoCs • 24/7 service 	The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's strong commitment to ensuring availability of scooters in underserved areas through comprehensive service area and proposal to rebalance based on thoughtful metrics. Additionally, 24/7 operations would serve users when transit is limited.	Strong
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed strategy to conduct outreach at affordable housing and public housing sites and establish bike and scooter racks if desired • Would ensure marketing materials reflect community diversity • Would promote service to low income users in collaboration with existing organizations 	The SFMTA evaluates detailed proposal regarding strategies to promote service at affordable housing sites and to low income users as very likely to result in reduced barriers to participation for low income users compared to most other applicants.	Strong
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe plans to attend community events to gather feedback and answer questions 	Attending events is a baseline strategy proposed by most applicants; without specific goals or plans to address feedback, the SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail as unlikely to result in applicant successfully listening to and addressing community feedback.	Poor
Labor	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed operations & rebalancing plan • Exploring user incentives for returning low-charge scooters to warehouse and for other rebalancing, but no firm commitment • Potential rebalancing synergy with JUMP bikes 	Detailed operations plan and team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system.	Strong

<p>Labor</p>	<p>Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plan does not include specifics regarding employment status; applicant only notes that they will expand JUMP dockless bicycle operations by adding new positions but does not describe dockless bicycle operations; note that they may use independent contractors • Mentions but does not describe plans to conduct extensive onboarding and skills training for maintenance technicians and that technicians are trained on proper battery handling 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail regarding training programs as unlikely to result in safe operational practices compared to other applicants.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Sustainability</p>	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Design products to minimize waste • Maintenance salvages & reuses parts • Some non-vehicle-based rebalancing • Open to tracking VMT associated with rebalancing and potentially offsetting CO2 emissions, but no firm commitment to either 	<p>The applicant proposes some innovative strategies beyond the baseline, which demonstrates commitment to sustainable operations.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Operates shared dockless bicycle system in San Francisco (JUMP) • Operates ride-hail service in San Francisco (Uber) • SFPD records indicate high levels of violations by Transportation Network Company affiliated drivers - as high as 65% of all violations issued downtown. 	<p>Successful experience operating JUMP bikeshare service indicates capacity to comply with permit terms. The history of violation of traffic laws by ride-hail contractors including Uber's creates some concern about applicant's ability to comply with local regulations.</p>	<p>Fair</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

LIME
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens • Maps of bike routes • Field staff instructed to proactively educate users about safe riding • Email safety campaigns • Do not require drivers' license 	<p>In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, applicant included some innovative strategies. Training field staff to proactively approach users on safe riding behavior likely to result in safer operations may not reach all users.</p> <p>Decision not to require drivers' license is likely to result in rentals by underage and untrained users; this was negatively evaluated by the SFMTA.</p>	Poor
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Helmet giveaways at events 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone did not result in high levels of helmet use.	Poor

Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Willing to implement locking mechanism but don't recommend • Will require photo for proof of proper parking • Integrated 311 alerts for improper parking • Operations team rectifies improper parking • Tip sensors on scooters • Work with city to implement parking zones 	Willingness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018; the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as a similar level of effectiveness to most applications.	Fair
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provided examples of rewards and issue penalties options but did not provide details about when penalties would be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor
Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discount for Low Income users (50% discount if fewer than 1,000 permits granted; 90% discount only if 1,000 or more scooters) • Description of mechanism to obtain cash/SMS option but not of how to demonstrate low income status • Cash and SMS options 	Despite discounted rates, the SFMTA concludes that low income users would face barriers to accessing applicant's services based on the lack of detail about how users would access/qualify for these benefits.	Poor
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No limit on where scooters can be returned but for 500 scooters would only deploy downtown • Maps in appendix contradict maps in body of application but all show limited service areas • No commitment to redistributing for geographic equity • Service hours: 7am to 8pm 	The SFMTA concludes that the applicant's proposed small service area and lack of specific rebalancing plans are insufficient to ensure availability in underserved communities.	Poor

Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe plans to educate communities on low income plans and increase engagement in Communities of Concern that have less access to mobility options (e.g. Bayview) • Application includes letters of support from stakeholder groups representing low income communities. However, most of these letters represent neighborhoods that are not included in Lime's proposed service area. • App available in Chinese, Spanish, Russian, German; plan to develop multilingual materials • Host events geared at hiring but also to promote low income options 	Proposals include a few additional measures and details as compared to some other applicants and the SFMTA evaluates these as moderately likely to result in reduced barriers to participation for low income users compared to many other applicants. The applicant appears to have a successfully promoted service in low income communities in the past, however, they have not proposed to include these communities in their service area.	Fair
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Host events geared at hiring but also to hear from community about concerns, questions, suggestions • Have implemented 311 Integration to respond to complaints 	Applicant's plans to host events, and specific mention of intent to listen to and address community feedback goes beyond what many applicants propose.	Fair
Labor	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed operations & rebalancing plan (3 shifts per day, with roles & responsibilities detailed for each shift) • Labor plan details staffing breakdowns (i.e. @ 1000 scooters, field operations and maintenance staff approximately 30) 	Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system	Strong

<p>Labor</p>	<p>Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Field operations and maintenance conducted by hired staff; • Chargers are independent contractors and may charge scooters in private homes. • Minimal mention of training practices • Strong focus on hiring from community-based orgs, supported by letters of endorsement from various community groups 	<p>Approach to hiring staff from within San Francisco's diverse communities would help ensure that staff have knowledge of the communities in which they operate. However, the SFMTA evaluates lack of detail about training practices as well as the applicant's reliance on minimally trained independent contractors for charging activities as less likely to ensure reliability of the system compared to strong applicants.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Sustainability</p>	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Batteries that "malfunction" or are beyond repair returned to manufacturing plant for R&D • Salvage & reuse parts • Recycle dead batteries through Recology • Commitment to document new VMT associated with retrieving, distributing, charging, and other operational activities 	<p>The applicant proposes some innovative strategies beyond the baseline, which demonstrates commitment to sustainable operations.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have operated shared scooter systems in SF and scooter share and bikeshare in many cities • Public Works impounded 130 improperly parked Lime scooters and issued 5 violations; total amount owed was \$15,784.10. No violations were paid as of the June 7th application deadline but all have since been paid. 	<p>The applicant demonstrates experience operating shared scooter service, but the SFMTA negatively evaluates applicant's history of violations, which indicates that past strategies have been insufficient to ensure user compliance with laws.</p>	<p>Poor</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

Lyft
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens and online FAQs • Provide bike maps and have user point system for photos of trips taken on bike routes 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone were not effective in addressing safe user behavior and operation.	Poor
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free helmet upon request 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone did not result in high levels of helmet use.	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have begun exploring tethering/locking mechanism; would need approximately 3 months notice to pilot the technology effectively • User points for returning scooters to geofenced preferred parking • Tip-over detection to identify knocked-over scooters • Will require photo for proof of proper parking • Propose mobility hubs as on-street parking for scooters etc. 	Willingness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018; the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as a similar level of effectiveness to most applications.	Fair
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reserve the right to suspend use of platform/service but do not define when such a penalty would be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor

Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$5/year plan includes unlimited 30 minute rides • Subscription plan available • Detailed description of mechanism for participation • Cash and SMS options available 	Strong commitment to providing a low income option. Detailed description of mechanism to access applicant's service would reduce barriers for qualifying users to access system and significantly discounted rates provide an incentive for low income users to use the system.	Strong
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Downtown core for 500 scooters, broader coverage in north and in east with 1000 scooters • No commitment to redistributing for geographic equity • Service hours: 4am-10pm (summer) and 5am - 8pm (winter) 	The SFMTA concludes that the applicant's proposed small service area and lack of specific rebalancing plan are insufficient to ensure availability in underserved communities, despite the fact that somewhat extended hours of operations would serve users when transit service is more limited.	Poor
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goal to creating ridership demographics that reflect the economic and racial diversity of the City • Meet with community leaders and residents with goal to understand barriers to access and implement strategies to overcome those obstacles • Seek guidance from traditionally underrepresented communities and create culturally competent marketing • Partnering with TransForm, a trusted local advocacy group, to promote equity and sustainability 	Applicant's strategies to promote service in Communities of Concern are similar to many applicants, but the SFMTA evaluates the inclusion of specific goals for these activities as more likely to result in reduced barriers to participation for low income users compared to some other applicants.	Fair

<p>Community Outreach</p>	<p>Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Partner and engage with stakeholder groups to understand mobility needs of diverse communities and develop community engagement plan • Collaboration with community groups representing non-users who may be impacted by service (e.g. bicyclists, pedestrians, persons with disabilities) 	<p>Meeting with stakeholders is a baseline strategy proposed by most applicants; however, the SFMTA evaluates applicant's specific description of goals for this engagement (intent to understand needs of diverse communities including those who choose not to use scooter services) as somewhat more likely to result in meaningful engagement than what many applicants propose.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Labor</p>	<p>Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will employ operations team for distribution, repositioning, recharging, and repair • User incentives for rebalancing (especially around transit and high-demand areas) • Detailed operations plan/team breakdown (3 full-time mechanics per 500 active scooters; 15 full time operations associates (rebalancing and recharging) per 500 active scooters) • Operations staff on bicycles will be able to respond to parking issues 	<p>Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system</p>	<p>Strong</p>
	<p>Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All field and maintenance staff are company employees • Skills training will be focused on safety and will supports employee advancement opportunities 	<p>The SFMTA evaluates applicant's approach to hiring and training as likely to ensure safe operational practices; while level of detail is not as robust as strongest responses, response did not include any cause for concern as seen in poor responses.</p>	<p>Fair</p>

<p>Sustainability</p>	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Select suppliers based on ability to take back parts and design scooters for reuse and dismantling • Mechanics work with hardware team and vendors to improve durability • Reuse batteries for secondary purposes or use City's certified hazardous waste haulers • Will offset carbon emissions • Some non-vehicle-based rebalancing • Will track VMT of field operations • Will leverage data from other programs to improve efficiency 	<p>The SFMTA positively evaluates the several innovative strategies proposed by applicant, which demonstrate commitment to sustainable operations, as well as the opportunity to evaluate new approaches through pilot. Application was notable in level of detail and thoroughness as compared to all other applicants.</p>	<p>Strong</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Operates ridehail service but has never owned any equipment in the public right-of-way • SFPD records indicate high levels of violations by Transportation Network Company affiliated drivers - as high as 65% of all violations issued downtown 	<p>While experience operating ridehail services lends credibility to various business aspects of proposal, applicant has no experience to date owning/operating shared mobility equipment in the public right-of-way. The history of violation of traffic laws by ride-hail contractors, including Lyft's, creates some concern about applicant's ability to comply with local regulations.</p>	<p>Poor</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

ofo
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on staff's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone were not effective in addressing safe user behavior and operation.	Poor
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free helmet upon request 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone did not result in high levels of helmet use.	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Propose a bungee cord (non-locking) tethering, which is in development • Geofenced preferred parking • Detailed images of how to park appropriately (better than most applicants) • Will require photo for proof of proper parking 	Commitment to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018; the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as a similar level of effectiveness to most applications.	Fair
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Believe that police enforcement should be primary enforcement mechanism • Users who park improperly 3 times will be prohibited from renting (users required to rate parking job of previous user) 	While penalties for parking improperly are likely to result in improved parking behavior, other potential penalties were not discussed. Furthermore, the SFMTA finds disavowal of responsibility to enforce safe riding demonstrates insufficient commitment to safety compared to successful applicants.	Poor

Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 50% discount for Low Income users • Detailed description of mechanism for participation • Cash and SMS options available 	Fair commitment to providing a low income option. Detailed description of mechanism to access applicant's service would reduce barriers for qualifying users to access system; affordable rates reduce barrier to using system for low income users.	Fair
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No limit on where scooters can be returned; broad deployment area but depends on number of scooters • Dedicate at least 10% in disadvantaged communities • Service hours: 6am to 7pm 	Potential to result in equitable service based on commitment of 10% availability in disadvantaged communities and broad service area depending on fleet size. However, no definition of disadvantaged communities so the SFMTA is unclear how applicant proposes to measure this.	Fair
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe strategy for community outreach with various groups focusing on Communities of Concern • Web and app available in Spanish, Mandarin, Korean, Japanese, Portuguese, German, and more; will develop signage and marketing materials in Mandarin and Spanish 	Applicant demonstrates some understanding of the SFMTA's goals to promote low income programs but does not provide sufficient detail as to how that would be accomplished. The SFMTA negatively evaluates this lack of detail as unlikely to ensure that low income residents are aware of services and how to participate.	Poor
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of attempts to engage members of the public generally 	Failure to include strategies to engage members of the public who do not choose to use scooter services is a flaw in application.	Poor

Labor	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed operations & rebalancing plan Detailed operations team breakdown (2-3 Fleet Leads; 4-8 Field Staff per 100 scooters; 1 Mechanic/Quality Control Expert per 100 scooters) 	Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system.	Strong
	Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Field staff mix of company employees and employees of staffing agencies, paid hourly, not per task completed Continued training in operations and scooter repair with opportunities for advancement Field/maintenance staff are contingent workers, but with some benefits & sick pay Focus on employing underserved communities. In recruiting and hiring practices, partner with local organizations that offer rehabilitation to the homeless, as well as organizations which focus on employment for military veterans. 	The SFMTA evaluates comprehensive training program for operations staff and commitment to growth and staff retention as highly likely to result in safe and consistent operations. Hiring staff from within San Francisco's diverse communities would help ensure that staff have knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	Strong
Sustainability	Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> General recycling of "ofo mobility devices" but no mention of batteries 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's response, which fails to address critical requirements of San Francisco's Zero Waste Policy.	Poor
Experience & Qualifications	Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Have operated dockless bikeshare in many cities in 22 countries Currently operating permitted shared scooter program in Washington DC 	The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's successful experience operating a permitted shared scooter service within a North American city as well as operating stationless bikeshare services.	Strong

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

Razor
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens and rider education modules 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on staff's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone were not effective in addressing safe user behavior and operation.	Poor
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of strategies to encourage helmet use 	Failure to address helmet use is a significant flaw in this application	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Willing to implement locking mechanism but does not recommend implementation • Operations team rectifies improper parking (no further detail) • Able to implement geofenced preferred parking 	Willingness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018; the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as a similar level of effectiveness to most applications.	Fair
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will track parking complaints and safety incidents by user and prevent repeat offenders from using system, but do not define when penalty would be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor
Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Over 50% discount for low income users • Cash and SMS options • No description of mechanism for qualifying; 	Despite significantly discounted rates, the SFMTA concludes that low income users would face barriers to accessing applicant's services based on the lack of detail about how users would access/qualify for these benefits.	Poor

Equitable Access	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Downtown & Mission only • No mention of approach to rebalancing • Service hours: 7am to 8pm 	The SFMTA concludes that the applicant's proposed small service area and lack of specific rebalancing plans are insufficient to ensure availability in underserved communities.	Poor
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of how they will inform potential low income users 	Failure to include strategies to ensure awareness of low income programs is a significant flaw in application.	Poor
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will provide program information and contact information to Community Benefit Organizations to provide feedback and complaints • No additional information on plans for engagement with members of the public who choose not to participate in their program/service 	Providing contact information for complaints is a baseline strategy that will be required of all permittees. The SFMTA negatively evaluates the lack of any proposals to proactively seek feedback from the community.	Poor
Labor	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of detail regarding operations/rebalancing plan beyond nightly retrieval and recharging 	Insufficient detail provided to demonstrate commitment to safe and reliable operation.	Poor
	Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Very limited detail regarding labor and operations • Mentions but does not describe plan to use a limited group of part-time and full-time workers, both employees and contractors, to aggregate and transport the scooters • Mentions but does not describe training for maintenance staff 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail regarding training programs as unlikely to result in safe operational practices compared to other applicants.	Poor

Sustainability	Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proactive maintenance program will maximize the useful life of scooters • When scooters or batteries reach end of life, will work with local recycling partners to ensure proper disposal • Will track VMT associated with recharging/rebalancing 	The applicant proposes some innovative strategies beyond the baseline, which demonstrates commitment to sustainable operations.	Fair
Experience & Qualifications	Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has never operated a shared mobility system • Leading manufacturer of electric scooters 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's lack of experience to date owning/operating shared mobility infrastructure in the public right-of-way.	Poor

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

Ridecell
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens and FAQ • Safe Scootering sessions in the community • Can earn credits through before & after surveys around sidewalk riding (honor system) • Could add required videos and test 	Met baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. In addition, proposed some additional strategies. Strategies to offer safety classes or for users to self-report on sidewalk riding will result in safer operations compared to baseline, but may not reach all users.	Fair
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of providing helmets • Can earn credits by sending selfie wearing helmet 	<p>Applicant failed to include a strategy to distribute helmets. All but one other applicant met this minimum requirement by providing free helmets upon request or organized helmet giveaways.</p> <p>Proposal to offer credits for taking photo wearing helmet is a creative idea, but without methods to issue helmets is not likely to result in increased helmet use.</p>	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of locking or tethering • Will require photo for proof of proper parking 	Failure to address locking/tethering and minimal alternate strategies demonstrates lack of commitment to ensuring safe parking behavior. The SFMTA negatively evaluates this response as being unlikely to result in positive parking outcomes.	Poor
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Can block the user from service but did not define when penalties will be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor

Equitable Access	<p>Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 50% Discount for low-income users plus various subscription plans • May qualify based on home address in addition to income level • Cash payment option, but no SMS option mentioned • Does not describe mechanism for participation 	<p>Despite significantly discounted rates, the SFMTA concludes that low income users would face barriers to accessing applicant's services based on the lack of detail about how users would access/qualify for these benefits.</p>	Poor
	<p>Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NE quarter including Dogpatch, Mission, Castro, Western Addition Pacific Heights etc. for 250 scooters • Will rebalance to ensure availability in underserved areas • Service hours: 7am to 8pm 	<p>The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's strong commitment to ensuring availability of scooters in underserved areas through comprehensive service area and proposal to rebalance using geographic indicators in addition to Community of Concern designation.</p>	Strong
Community Outreach	<p>Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Distribute flyers and promotions in low income communities • Mentions but doesn't describe intent to highlight discounts to low income residents 	<p>Applicant demonstrates some understanding of the SFMTA's goals to promote low income programs but does not provide sufficient detail as to how that would be accomplished. The SFMTA negatively evaluates this lack of detail as unlikely to ensure that low income residents are aware of services and how to participate.</p>	Poor
	<p>Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe strategies to attend community events and meetings to capture feedback on issues and how to improve service • Most outreach focuses on promoting program/service • No mention of specific community groups/partners 	<p>Attending events and meeting with stakeholders is a baseline strategy proposed by most applicants; without specific goals or plans to address feedback the SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail as unlikely to result in applicant successfully listening to and addressing community feedback.</p>	Poor

	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed operations & rebalancing plan • Detailed breakdown of hired operations staff by role and responsibility • 20 independent recharging contractors per 250 scooters 	Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system	Strong
Labor	Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of independent contractors to charge, deploy and redistribute scooters; chargers charge scooters at home/small business office • Mentions but doesn't describe plans to provide robust training on a continuing basis • Monitor contractor performance and provide feedback to help them improve • Plan to offer subsidized data plans for contractors • Mentions but does not describe focus on employment for low-income residents 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail regarding training programs as well as reliance on minimally trained independent contractors for charging and some maintenance activities as unlikely to result in safe operational practices compared to other applicants.	Poor
Sustainability	Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Remarket scooters at 80% useful lifespan • Will reuse/recycle parts; • Mention battery recycling but no details • Plan to track VMT associated with recharging/rebalancing 	The applicant proposes some innovative strategies beyond the baseline, which demonstrates commitment to sustainable operations.	Fair

<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has developed software used in operating ridehail and carshare systems 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's lack of experience to date owning/operating shared mobility infrastructure in the public right-of-way.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
---	---	--	--	-------------

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

Scout
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mandatory instructional videos • Free in-person classes • Field staff to proactively approach riders with safety reminders 	In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, included some additional measures. Commitment to mandatory instructional videos will reach all users and is likely to result in higher level of user education compared to all other applicants. Combined with offering free classes and training field staff to proactively approach users on safe riding behavior, the SFMTA evaluates this approach as very likely to result in safer operations compared to other applicants.	Strong
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incorporating lock-box to provide helmet with rental • Free helmet giveaways 	Providing helmets with rental is the surest way to ensure consistent helmet use. The SFMTA evaluates this strategy as highly likely to result in helmet use compared to baseline strategies.	Strong
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tethering/locking mechanism in development with production partner; "would positively invite the opportunity to work with the SFMTA on a tethering/locking pilot." • Field staff will educate users who park improperly • Will encourage off-street parking in private lots • Will require photo for proof of proper parking 	Commitment to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018; the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as a similar level of effectiveness to most applications.	Fair

Disabled Access	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comprehensive documentation of exact penalties for rider non-compliance including fees for parking citations, safety violations, and service suspension for repeat violations 	Detailed approach to leveraging penalties and incentives creates transparency and demonstrates commitment to holding users accountable for poor behaviors.	Fair
Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No deposit required; but otherwise no discount (claim that their rate is already affordable; standard rate is similar to other applicants) • Detailed description of mechanism for participation • Cash option; no mention of SMS option 	The option to pay with cash will reduce barriers for some users to access applicant's services, however, rates for qualifying low income users are high compared to most other applicants and may be a barrier for low-income users.	Poor
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depending on number of scooters, would deploy to Haight, Mission, northern Potrero Hill, Dogpatch, portions of Bayview, Fishermans Wharf • Will rebalance if less than 20% in CoCs. • 24/7 service 	The SFMTA positively evaluates applicant's commitment to rebalancing, which will ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas, and 24/7 operations which will serve users when transit is limited. However, while broad service area for larger fleet would ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas, the SFMTA is unable to evaluate service area for smaller fleet sizes.	Fair
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed plan to promote use among low income communities through efforts to establish relationships with at-risk youth and youth health clinic groups, public and affordable housing groups • Customer service available in English, Chinese, Spanish, (and Catalan) 	The SFMTA evaluates level of specificity and approach to conducting targeted outreach as very likely to result in reduced barriers to participation for low income users compared to majority of other applicants.	Strong

<p>Community Outreach</p>	<p>Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Engage with stakeholder groups to understand mobility needs of diverse communities • Collaboration with community groups representing non-users who may be impacted by service (e.g. bicyclists, pedestrians, persons with disabilities) 	<p>Meeting with stakeholders is a baseline strategy proposed by most applicants; however, the SFMTA evaluates applicant's specific description of goals for this engagement (intent to understand needs of diverse communities including those who choose not to use scooter services) as somewhat more likely to result in meaningful engagement than what many applicants propose.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Labor</p>	<p>Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed labor & operations plan; existing Scoot fleet team staff would be augmented commensurate w/# of scooters permitted • User incentives for rebalancing • Rebalancing synergy with existing Scoot program • Detailed maintenance plan 	<p>Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system</p>	<p>Strong</p>
	<p>Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Field & recharging staff full-time employees with full benefits and compensation package designed to increase retention • Training to support employee advancement opportunities • All Field Service Technicians trained through four-tier certification process, which promotes growth and longevity at company • Recruitment at tech and vocational schools, as well as through the City College of San Francisco, in order to reach candidates from a range of different demographics and diverse backgrounds. 	<p>The SFMTA evaluates comprehensive training program for operations staff and commitment to growth and staff retention as highly likely to result in safe and consistent operations. Hiring staff from within San Francisco's diverse communities would help ensure that staff have knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<p>Strong</p>

<p>Sustainability</p>	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recharging batteries while parked or by swapping out in field minimizes VMT associated with recharging • Swappable battery easier to recycle (does not require wholesale scrapping of scooter) • Commit to tracking VMT of recharging/rebalancing/field operations vehicles • Non-vehicle and/or electric vehicle-based recharging 	<p>The SFMTA positively evaluates the several innovative strategies proposed by applicant, which demonstrate commitment to sustainable operations, as well as the opportunity to evaluate new approaches (swappable battery) through pilot.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Currently operate shared moped service in SF • Documented history of close collaboration with SF 	<p>The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's successful experience owning/operating shared moped service in San Francisco. The SFMTA is confident in the applicant's ability to follow through on commitments and adjust program details as needed based on past collaboration with the Agency.</p>	<p>Strong</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

Skip
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens and online tutorials • Free in-person classes • Field staff to proactively approach riders with safety reminders (focus on "high traffic areas during periods of heavy usage") 	In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, included some additional measures. Providing both free classes and trained field staff to proactively approach users on safe riding behavior will result in safer operations than most applicants but may not reach all users.	Fair
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free helmet giveaways • Will have field staff distribute helmets to users on the street • Will include carabiners with all helmet giveaways 	In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, included some additional measures. Having field staff provide helmets and including a way to carry a helmet would result in improved helmet use compared to baseline strategies but may not reach all users.	Fair
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have prototype of tethering/locking mechanism; "preparing to bring it to market" • Tip-over detection to identify knocked-over scooters • Working to require photo for proof of proper parking • Free ride incentive for demonstrated parking compliance 	Readiness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018. Due to readiness to implement, the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as more effective than most applicants.	Strong

Disabled Access	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approach defines types of incidents in detail and describes escalating penalties including required classes and deactivation, including immediate deactivation for some egregious incidents • Plan to provide compliance reports to SFMTA 	Detailed approach to leveraging penalties and incentives creates transparency and demonstrates commitment to holding users accountable for poor behaviors. Application was notable in level of detail and thoroughness as compared to all other applicants.	Strong
Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two free rides per day • Detailed description of mechanism for participation • Cash and SMS options available 	Strong commitment to providing a low income option. Detailed description of mechanism to access applicant's service would reduce barriers for qualifying users to access system and significantly discounted rates provide an incentive for low income users to use the system.	Strong
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service to entire eastern half of SF to Hunters Point for 350 scooters • Would maintain 80% in NE and 20% in SE • Service hours: 6:30 am to 8:30 pm 	The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's strong commitment to ensuring availability of scooters in underserved areas through comprehensive service area and proposal to rebalance using geographic indicators in addition to Community of Concern designation.	Strong
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Describe plans to host pop-up events in Communities of Concern, and specify that the purpose of these events is to give helmets, educate around service, and register users who don't have credit card or smart phone access 	Applicant's strategies to promote service in Communities of Concern by hosting neighborhood events are similar to many applicants, but the SFMTA evaluates the inclusion of specific goals for these events as more likely to result in reduced barriers to participation for low income users compared to some other applicants.	Fair

Community Outreach	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Propose an advisory board to address community concerns; would be attended by CEO and members of board of directors Will gather feedback from users and nonusers to learn about service gaps and understand user demographics Transparency reports to document safety incidents and resolution 	Strong commitment to being responsive to members of the community with an approach that creates transparent processes for addressing concerns, service gaps, and safety issues that the SFMTA evaluates as highly likely to result in meaningful community engagement. Application was notable in level of detail and thoroughness as compared to all other applicants.	Strong
	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two main rebalancing runs post-AM commute and pre-PM commute hours Detailed operations plan/team breakdown (maintenance: 20 technicians, with 3 leads and 2 managers; 5 roll team (find missing/improperly parked scooters) employees per 100 scooters; chargers are contracted, # not specified) 	Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system	Strong
Labor	Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Maintenance staff and ambassadors are company employees 85% of chargers will be independent contractors and 15% of chargers will be employees; Will train contractors to create independent businesses to serve both applicant and others in the industry Maintenance staff and field staff are trained and regularly re-trained; 	The SFMTA evaluates applicant's approach to hiring and training of most staffing categories as likely to ensure overall safe operational practices compared to some applicants. While the SFMTA evaluates the applicant's reliance on minimally trained independent contractors for charging activities as less likely to ensure reliability of the system compared to strongest applicants, the applicant's commitment to evaluate both independent contractors and employees for charging purposes is likely to provide valuable insight as part of the Powered Scooter Share Pilot Program.	Fair

<p>Sustainability</p>	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dedication to maintenance and repair • Batteries that cannot be recycled to be disposed of at SF Transfer Station (not an acceptable approach) • Lack of commitment to tracking VMT associated with rebalancing 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's response, which fails to address critical requirements of San Francisco's Zero Waste Policy.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Currently operating permitted shared scooter program in Washington DC • Experience designing custom vehicles (Boosted) 	<p>The SFMTA positively evaluates the applicant's successful experience operating a permitted shared scooter service within a North American city.</p>	<p>Strong</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

Spin
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
Safety	Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens • Email safety campaigns & online safety guide; working to develop videos • Field staff instructed to proactively educate users about safe riding • Flyers promoting safety 	In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, applicant included some innovative strategies. Training field staff to proactively approach users on safe riding behavior likely to result in safer operations may not reach all users.	Fair
	Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free helmet upon request • Helmet giveaways at events 	Met only baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants. Based on the SFMTA's observations during the scooter roll out in spring 2018, these baseline strategies taken alone did not result in high levels of helmet use.	Poor
Disabled Access	Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have developed locking mechanism (recommend testing mixed fleet) • Have tool to rate previous parking job • Willing to implement parking zones and signs • Will require photo for proof of proper parking • Operations team rectifies improper parking 	Readiness to implement locking technology and variety of additional strategies are likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018. Due to readiness to implement, the SFMTA evaluates this strategy as more effective than most applicants.	Strong
	User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Escalating action for noncompliant users including fines, temporary suspensions, and bans, but except for one example do not describe circumstances when penalties would be levied 	Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.	Poor

Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 50 % discount for Low Income users • Detailed description of mechanism for participation • Cash option but no SMS option 	Fair commitment to providing a low income option. Detailed description of mechanism to access applicant's service would reduce barriers for qualifying users to access system; affordable rates reduce barrier to using system for low income users.	Fair
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • With 500-scooter fleet, southern limit is 16th St; with more southern limit is 24th St; western is Divisadero • Would work with city to determine other priority areas for redistribution • Service hours: 7am to 8pm 	<p>The SFMTA concludes that the applicant's proposed small service area and lack of specific rebalancing plans are insufficient to ensure availability in underserved communities.</p> <p>Note: Intent to work with the SFMTA to determine priority distribution areas is insufficiently detailed to be considered in evaluation of rebalancing plan.</p>	Poor
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plan to complement Muni Equity Strategy (only application to mention) by focusing initiatives on Equity Work Group's priority needs and/or recommendations • Detailed description of approach to promote service to diverse users - plan meet-and-greets with CBOs in Equity Neighborhoods, and propose 1 to 2 community outreach event with CBOs in each neighborhood • Multilingual materials to promote low income program (examples provided) 	The SFMTA evaluates applicant's detailed proposal regarding strategies to promote service to low income users, including building on the SFMTA's Muni Equity Strategy, as very likely to result in reduced barriers to participation for low income users compared to most other applicants.	Strong
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe meetings with stakeholders and attendance at community events • Mentions changes made to service during unpermitted period based on past meetings, but do not describe how this would be used going forward 	Attending events and meeting with stakeholders is a baseline strategy proposed by most applicants; without specific goals or plans to address feedback, the SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail as unlikely to result in applicant successfully listening to and addressing community feedback.	Poor



	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Detailed operations team description Plan for charger network to pick up/charge/redeploy approximately 80 percent of scooters retrieved each night. Local operations team pick up remaining low-battery scooters and scooters in need of repair during the day 	Detailed operations plan & team structure demonstrates thorough understanding of operating requirements for a successful system	Strong
Labor	Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Most chargers and mechanics are independent contractors, some field/operations staff are hourly company employees In-person onboarding/training for new members of charging/maintenances teams and provision of informational guides, tutorials, and access to local operations team for assistance Both chargers and mechanics use their own tools and equipment for their work Describes plans to work with local orgs to recruit local low-income residents 	Approach to hiring staff from within San Francisco's diverse communities would help ensure that staff have knowledge of the communities in which they operate. However, the SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's reliance on independent contractors using their own tools and equipment for charging and in particular for maintenance activities, which could compromise safety and reliability of system.	Poor
Sustainability	Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Central maintenance facility Salvage or reuse parts Will comply with California Universal Waste Rule Open to documenting vehicle miles associated with the charging process but no firm commitment 	The applicant proposes some innovative strategies beyond the baseline, which demonstrates commitment to sustainable operations.	Fair

Experience & Qualifications	Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have operated shared scooter systems in SF and bikeshare in many cities • Public Works impounded 75 improperly parked Spin scooters and issued 5 violations totaling \$14,189.06 which were paid and processed as of June 6th 2018 	The applicant demonstrates experience operating shared scooter service, but the SFMTA negatively evaluates applicant's history of violations, which indicates that past strategies have been insufficient to ensure user compliance with laws.	Poor
--	--	---	--	------

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A

**UScooter
SFMTA Application Analysis & Rating**

GUIDING PRINCIPLE	EVALUATION CRITERIA	APPLICANT PROPOSAL SUMMARY	SFMTA ANALYSIS	RATING
<p style="text-align: center;">Safety</p>	<p>Strategies to educate and train users should result in safe operations of scooters by riders.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Swipe-through screens • Host classes and attend community events • Can restrict scooter speed to less than 5mph if rider ignores notice to comply 	<p>In addition to baseline strategies proposed by most or all other applicants, included some innovative strategies. Offering safety classes will result in safer operations compared to most applicants, but may not reach all users.</p> <p>Ability to restrict scooter speeds is an innovative approach to ensuring safety, but once restricted, it is unlikely the rider would then move off the sidewalk; the SFMTA does not consider this feature a positive addition to the proposal.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
	<p>Strategies to promote and distribute helmets should result in helmet use by riders.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of strategies to encourage helmet use 	<p>Failure to address helmet use is a significant flaw in this application</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Disabled Access</p>	<p>Strategies to ensure properly parked scooters, including any commitments to locking or tethering, should result in parking that does not block the right of way.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have designed a lockable docking station (no mention of being able to lock to other fixed objects) • Will require photo for proof of proper parking 	<p>Readiness to implement locking stations is likely to result in improved parking behavior compared to scooter roll out in spring 2018, but proposed approach would require significant community outreach and public process to establish stations, in contrast to being able to lock to existing objects in the right of way as proposed by most other applicants.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
	<p>User penalties for poor compliance by users with laws governing scooter operation, including possibility of suspension by the applicant, should support appropriate operation and parking by users.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pattern of non-compliance flagged in the system - required to re-review safety information; repeat offenders will be blocked from service but unclear at what point penalties would be levied 	<p>Lack of detail in response underscored lack of commitment to leveraging penalties and incentives.</p>	<p>Poor</p>

Equitable Access	Approach to providing service to low-income residents, including diverse payment options and fare discounts, should reduce barriers to participation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will have low income memberships but doesn't mention rate • Subscription plan available • Does not describe mechanism for participation • SMS and cash option 	Insufficient detail for the SFMTA to evaluate whether low income users will be able to access system at affordable rates.	Poor
	Service Area beyond the downtown core and commitment to rebalancing should ensure availability of scooters in underserved areas.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Broad reach beyond downtown core for 250 scooter fleet • Will deploy 20% in CoCs but no mention of rebalancing activities • Service hours: 6am to 9pm or dusk 	Broad service area and deployment plan will ensure some degree of geographic equity, however lack of rebalancing would result in reduced availability in underserved communities throughout the day.	Fair
Community Outreach	Outreach approach should include strategies to ensure that low income residents are aware of service and how to participate.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mentions but does not describe plan to develop collaborative partnerships and to understand diverse communities, but no specific strategies 	The SFMTA negatively evaluates lack of detail as unlikely to ensure that low income residents are aware of services and how to participate.	Poor
	Approach to outreach should ensure that members of the public, including those that choose not to use scooter services, have the opportunity to be heard and to stay informed about program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No mention of attempts to engage members of the public generally 	Failure to include strategies to engage members of the public who do not choose to use scooter services is a flaw in application.	Poor
Labor	Should demonstrate understanding of operational needs and resource requirements to ensure service reliability.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Detailed description of operational tasks • Lack of detail regarding staffing levels 	Applicant's operations and labor plan demonstrates understanding of types of activities required to achieve service reliability, however, SFMTA evaluates lack of detail about staffing levels as indicative that applicant may not be prepared to ensure service reliability.	Fair

<p>Labor</p>	<p>Approach to hiring and training employees and/or contractors should ensure that staff have the knowledge and skills to ensure safe operational practices and knowledge of the communities in which they operate.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Field/operations staff are company employees • Maintenance and repair done by trained network of service vendors through SF Wheels (local bicycle service) • Skills training delivered via video, mobile app, and website (and in-person "when necessary") 	<p>The SFMTA evaluates applicant's approach to hiring and training as likely to ensure safe operational practices; while level of detail is not as robust as strongest responses, response did not include any cause for concern as seen in poor responses.</p>	<p>Fair</p>
<p>Sustainability</p>	<p>Approaches to operations and disposal should demonstrate commitment to environmental sustainability.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will donate batteries with more than 1,000 recharges to be used for "second life" opportunities such as energy storage; no other mention of Zero Waste • VMT associated with recharging/rebalancing tracked (routes designed to minimize VMT) 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's response, which fails to address critical requirements of San Francisco's Zero Waste Policy.</p>	<p>Poor</p>
<p>Experience & Qualifications</p>	<p>Applicant's experience in operating and maintaining shared mobility systems, in San Francisco and elsewhere as well as applicant's history, and the history of their users, in complying with city regulations should demonstrate their capacity to comply with the terms of the scooter share permit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has never operated a shared mobility system • Leading manufacturer of electric scooters 	<p>The SFMTA negatively evaluates the applicant's lack of experience to date owning/operating shared mobility infrastructure in the public right-of-way.</p>	<p>Poor</p>

Data Transmission & Data Privacy	Comply with Transportation Code requirements to provide SFMTA with aggregate demographic data and real time location, and submit a data privacy policy consistent with the Director's guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to data provision and privacy 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Electronic Payment System	Provide electronic payment system compliant with PCI DSS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to electronic payment systems 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Multilingual Website, Call Center & API	Provide a multilingual website with languages determined by SFMTA, call center and mobile application customer interface.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to customer service including multilingual options 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A
Financial Assurances	Agree to Transportation Code requirements concerning insurance, payment of \$10,000 into public property repair and maintenance endowment, and agree to reimburse the SFMTA for any costs incurred for abating violations of Powered Scooter Share requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When submitting application, applicant agreed to comply with Transportation Code requirements and Terms and Conditions related to financial assurances 	Satisfactory - agrees to comply.	N/A